

CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	v
THE AUTHORS: CURRICULUM VITAE	vi

PART ONE. THE UNITED STATES AND THE OTHER "FIVE": AN ANALYTICAL COMPARISON	1
---	---

CHAPTER I

AN OVERVIEW: REQUISITE ADMINISTRATIVE FRAMEWORKS	3
1.1 Introduction: Why the volume was written	3
1.2 Relationship of procedural goals to organization	4
1.3 Sequence of this volume	4
1.4 First central theme: A centralized interpretative program	5
1.5 Second central theme: Decentralization of the enforcement function	8
1.6 Third central theme: Centralization of final administrative hearings at an intermediate level	10

CHAPTER II

CENTRALLY ADMINISTERED RULE-MAKING PROGRAMS	12
Section A. Evolution of U.S. Programs	12
2.1 Introduction	12
2.2 Evolution of U.S. regulations program	15
2.3 Evolution of U.S. private and published rulings programs	19

- 2.4 Weight normally accorded U.S. interpretative regulations and published rulings 26

- Section B. Analytic Comparison: The "Six's" Reactions to Vital Purposes Served by Centrally Administered Interpretative Programs 34

- 2.5 Introduction: Programs of the Six compared 34
- 2.6 Achieving timely uniformity, efficiently and fairly . . . 39
- 2.7 Choosing the wisest possible interpretative positions 42
- 2.8 Neutralizing risks re prospective transactions 42

- Section C. Implementing an Interpretative Regulations Program 44

- 2.9 Introduction: Inherent conflict among the goals 44
- 2.10 The goal of proper quality 44
- 2.11 Processing regulations: Reconciling the goal of proper quality with competing goals of timeliness and efficiency 48

- Section D. Implementing Private and Published Rulings Programs 51

- 2.12 Introduction: Resolving inherent conflict between respective goals of private and published rulings programs 51
- 2.13 Confining private rulings to legal questions: Requiring statements of fact and a brief 54
- 2.14 Organization, conferences, review, and appeals re private rulings 56
- 2.15 Priorities re advance rulings; and grounds for refusal to rule 59
- 2.16 Completed transactions: Private rulings and in-service technical advice 61
- 2.17 Publication of rulings and in-service technical advice. . 64

CHAPTER III
ASSESSMENT AND ADMINISTRATIVE APPEAL
PROCEDURES 70

	Section A. Analytic Comparison of the "Six": Requirements of a Tax Administration's Own Conflict Resolution Procedures, Viewed in Aggregate	70
3.1	Introduction: Comparative profiles of the entire conflict resolution process	70
3.2	Assuring impartiality of administrative conflict resolution machinery	77
3.3	Assuring administrative machinery a reasonable chance to become fully acquainted with the tax- payer's side	82
3.4	Assuring justice: Need for complete "settlement" authority	86
	Section B. Analytic Comparison of Additional Requirements: Echelon by Echelon View of Assessment and Administrative Conflict Resolution Procedures	90
3.5	Examining officer level	90
3.6	Mandatory internal review v. self-initiated requests for technical advice	92
3.7	Jurisdictional screening function re administra- tive appeals	95
3.8	Requiring written protests	99

CHAPTER IV
CONFLICT RESOLUTION BY INDEPENDENT
TRIBUNALS 102

	Section A. Analytic Comparison: Judicial Structures of the "Six"	102
4.1	Introduction: The goals	102

4.2 Trial tribunals: Impartiality and the relevance of a specialized bench's perspectives 103

4.3 Trial tribunals: Other factors relevant to the goals 109

4.4 Appellate tribunals: The right and scope of review 120

4.5 Appellate tribunals: Quality of review 125

4.6 Appellate tribunals: Unifying interpretations 131

Section B. Analytic Comparison: Litigation Practices of the "Six" 138

4.7 Introduction 138

4.8 Practices peculiarly important to the tax administration 138

4.9 Practices peculiarly important to taxpayers 151

4.10 Practices of common concern 157

PART TWO. BELGIUM 167

CHAPTER V

ADMINISTRATIVE ORGANIZATIONAL AND PERSONNEL FRAMEWORKS 169

Section A. Administrative Organizational Framework 169

1.1 Introduction 169

1.2 Organizational framework, national office level 171

1.3 Organizational framework, regional office level 174

1.4 Organizational framework, local office level 176

Section B. Personnel Framework (Governmental and Non-Governmental) 177

1.5 Governmental professional personnel 177

1.6 Private tax practitioners 179

CHAPTER VI

ADMINISTRATIVE RULE-MAKING PROGRAMS	181
Section A. Character of the Underlying Statute	181
2.1 Precision of the statute itself	181
2.2 Legislative pre-enactment aids to interpretation	186
2.3 Standards of construction followed by the judiciary in interpreting the statute	188
Section B. The Regulations Program	190
2.4 Types and force of regulations	190
2.5 Precise purpose of "interpretative" regulations	192
2.6 Manner of processing regulations	195
Section C. The Rulings Program	196
2.7 Formal advance written rulings to taxpayers	196
2.8 Informal technical advice to taxpayers on proposed transactions	197
2.9 Technical advice to field offices	198
2.10 Publication of technical advice given taxpayers and local offices	199

CHAPTER VII

ASSESSMENT, REFUND, AND ADMINISTRATIVE APPEAL PROCEDURES	201
Section A. Assessment and Audit Procedures	201
3.1 Introductory note	201
3.2a Details of the typical assessment and audit procedure	201

3.2b	Details of assessment and audit procedure re cadastral income	207
3.2c	Details of assessment and audit procedure re income arising from certain categories of professional activity	208
	Section B. Administrative Appeals	209
3.3	Introductory note	209
3.4	Details of administrative appeal procedure re assessments	210
	Section C. Extent Administrative Processing of Refund Claims Departs from Administrative Processing of Assessments	213
3.5	Introductory note	213
3.6	Details regarding refund procedure in cases of "material error"	214

CHAPTER VIII

RESOLUTION OF INTERPRETATIVE INCOME TAX QUESTIONS BY INDEPENDENT TRIBUNALS 216

4.1	Introduction	216
	Section A. Organization and Procedures: Lower Courts	216
4.2	Organization of the lower courts	216
4.3	Processing cases through the Court of Appeal	217
	Section B. Organization and Procedures: The Court of Cassation	220
4.4	Organization of the Court of Cassation	220
4.5	Processing a case through the Court of Cassation	221

PART THREE. FRANCE	225
--------------------	-----

CHAPTER IX

ADMINISTRATIVE ORGANIZATIONAL AND PERSONNEL FRAMEWORKS 227

Section A. Administrative Organizational Framework	227
1.1 Introduction	227
1.2 Organizational framework, national office level	227
1.3 Organizational framework, regional office level	229
1.4 Organizational framework, local office level	230
Section B. Personnel Framework (Governmental and Non-Governmental)	232
1.5 Governmental professional personnel	232
1.6 Private tax practitioners	236

CHAPTER X

ADMINISTRATIVE RULE-MAKING PROGRAMS 238

Section A. Character of the Underlying Statute	238
2.1 Precision of the statute itself	238
2.2 Legislative pre-enactment aids to interpretation	240
2.3 Standards of construction followed by the judiciary in interpreting the statute	241
Section B. The "Regulations" Program	243
2.4 & 2.5 Types, force, and purpose of "regulations"	243
2.6 Manner of processing "regulations"	246

Section C. The Rulings Program 247

2.7 Formal advance written rulings to taxpayers247

2.8 Informal technical advice to taxpayers on
proposed transactions249

2.9 Technical advice to field offices249

2.10 Publication of technical advice given taxpayers
and local offices250

CHAPTER XI

ASSESSMENT, REFUND, AND ADMINISTRATIVE
APPEAL PROCEDURES 251

Section A. Assessment and Audit Procedures 251

3.1 Introductory note251

3.2a Details of assessment and audit procedure re
actual income251

3.2b Details of assessment and audit procedure re
estimated income257

Section B. Administrative Appeals 264

3.3 Introductory note264

3.4a Details of administrative appeals to a departmental
Commission265

3.4b Administrative appeals to the departmental
Director: Recours contentieux269

3.4c Administrative appeals to the departmental
Director: Recours gracieux271

Section C. Administrative Processing of
Refund Claims 272

CHAPTER XII

RESOLUTION OF TAX QUESTIONS BY
INDEPENDENT TRIBUNALS 273

4.1 Introduction 273

Section A. Organization and Procedures:
Trial Level 274

4.2 Organization of the tribunals 274

4.3 Processing cases through the trial tribunals 275

Section B. Organization and Procedures:
Appellate Tribunals 281

4.4 Organization of the appellate system 281

4.5 Processing a case through the appellate tribunal . . . 283

PART FOUR. GERMANY 289

CHAPTER XIII

ADMINISTRATIVE ORGANIZATIONAL AND
PERSONNEL FRAMEWORKS 291Section A. Administrative Organizational
Framework 291

1.1 Introduction 291

1.2 Organizational framework, national office level 292

A. Federal tax administration 292

B. State tax administration 295

1.3 Organizational framework, regional office level 295

1.4 Organizational framework, local office level 296

Section B. Personnel Framework (Governmental and Non-Governmental)	299
1.5 Governmental professional personnel	299
1.6 Private tax practitioners	304

CHAPTER XIV

ADMINISTRATIVE RULE-MAKING PROGRAMS 307

Section A. Character of the Underlying Statute 307

2.1 Precision of the statute itself	307
2.2 Legislative pre-enactment aids to interpretation . . .	313
2.3 Standards of construction followed by the judiciary in interpreting the statute	315

Section B. The Regulations Program 316

2.4 Types and force of regulations	316
2.5 Precise purpose of interpretative regulations	318
2.6 Manner of processing regulations	321

Section C. The Rulings Program 322

2.7 Formal advance written rulings to taxpayers	322
2.8 Informal technical advice to taxpayers on proposed transactions	324
2.9 Technical advice to field offices	325
2.10 Publication of technical advice given taxpayers and local offices	326

CHAPTER XV

ASSESSMENT, REFUND, AND ADMINISTRATIVE APPEAL PROCEDURES	328
Section A. Assessment and Audit Procedures	328
3.1 Introductory note	328
3.2a Details of assessment and audit procedures: In general	330
3.2b Details of assessment and audit procedures where taxes withheld at source	336
Section B. Administrative Appeals	337
3.3 Introductory note	337
3.4a Protest	338
3.4b Complaint	341
Section C. Extent Administrative Processing of Refund Claims Departs from Adminis- trative Processing of Assessments	342
3.5 Introductory note	342
3.6 Details regarding refund procedures	342

CHAPTER XVI

RESOLUTION OF INTERPRETATIVE INCOME TAX QUESTIONS BY INDEPENDENT TRIBUNALS	344
4.1 Introduction	344
Section A. Organization and Procedures: Trial Level	346
4.2 Organization of the trial tribunals	346
4.3 Processing cases through the trial tribunals	348

Section B. Organization and Procedures: Appellate Tribunals	353
4.4 Organization of the appellate court system	353
4.5 Processing a case through the appellate tribunal . . .	355

PART FIVE. GREAT BRITAIN 361

CHAPTER XVII

**ADMINISTRATIVE ORGANIZATIONAL AND
PERSONNEL FRAMEWORKS** 363

Section A. Administrative Organizational Framework	363
1.1 Introduction	363
1.2 Organizational framework, national office level	365
1.3 Organizational framework, regional office level	367
1.4 Organizational framework, local office level	368
Section B. Personnel Framework (Governmental and Non-Governmental)	369
1.5 Governmental professional personnel	369
1.6 Private tax practitioners	372

CHAPTER XVIII

ADMINISTRATIVE RULE-MAKING PROGRAMS 375

Section A. Character of the Underlying Statute	375
2.1 Precision of the statute itself	375
2.2 Legislative pre-enactment aids to interpretation	383

2.3	Standards of construction followed by the judiciary in interpreting the statute	384
	Section B. The Regulations Program	385
2.4	Types and force of regulations	385
2.5	Precise purpose of statutory regulations	388
2.6	Manner of processing regulations	389
	Section C. The Rulings Program	390
2.7	Formal advance written rulings to taxpayers	390
2.8	Informal technical advice to taxpayers on proposed transactions	392
2.9	Technical advice to field offices	393
2.10	Publication of technical advice given taxpayers and local offices	396

CHAPTER XIX

ASSESSMENT, REFUND, AND ADMINISTRATIVE APPEAL PROCEDURES 399

	Section A. Assessment and Audit Procedures	399
3.1	Introductory note	399
3.2	Details of the assessment and audit procedures	401
	Section B. Administrative Appeals	406
3.3	Introductory note	406
3.4	Details of procedures analogous to administrative appeals	407
	Section C. Extent Administrative Processing of Refund Claims Departs from Adminis- trative Processing of Assessments	410
3.5	Introductory note	410

3.6 "Error or mistake" claims: Refund procedures
prior to an administrative appeal 410

3.7 "Error or mistake" claims: Procedure equivalent
to administrative appeal 412

CHAPTER XX

RESOLUTION OF INTERPRETATIVE INCOME TAX
QUESTIONS BY INDEPENDENT TRIBUNALS 413

4.1 Introduction 413

Section A. Organization and Procedures:
Trial Level 414

4.2a Organization of the General Commissioners 414

4.2b Organization of the Special Commissioners 415

4.2c Organization of the Board of Referees 416

4.2d Organization of the 1960 Act tribunal 417

4.3a Processing appeals: The General Commissioners . . . 418

4.3b Processing appeals: The Special Commissioners . . . 421

4.3c Processing appeals: The Board of Referees 422

4.3d Processing appeals: The 1960 Act tribunal 423

Section B. Organization and Procedures:
Appellate Tribunals 424

4.4 Organization of the appellate court system 424

4.5 Processing cases through the courts 425

PART SIX. THE NETHERLANDS 429

CHAPTER XXI

ADMINISTRATIVE ORGANIZATIONAL AND
PERSONNEL FRAMEWORKS 431Section A. Administrative Organizational
Framework 431

- 1.1 Introduction 431
- 1.2 Organizational framework, national office level 432
- 1.3 Organizational framework, regional office level 434
- 1.4 Organizational framework, local office level 436

Section B. Personnel Framework (Governmental
and Non-Governmental) 439

- 1.5 Governmental professional personnel 439
- 1.6 Private tax practitioners 442

CHAPTER XXII

ADMINISTRATIVE RULE-MAKING PROGRAMS 444

Section A. Character of the Underlying Statute 444

- 2.1 Precision of the statute itself 444
- 2.2 Legislative pre-enactment aids to interpretation 449
- 2.3 Standards of construction followed by the judiciary
in interpreting the statute 451

Section B. The Regulations Program 453

- 2.4 Types and force of regulations 453
- 2.5 Precise purpose of interpretative regulations 453
- 2.6 Manner of processing regulations 454

Section C. The Rulings Program	454
2.7 Formal advance written rulings to taxpayers	454
2.8 Informal technical advice to taxpayers on proposed transactions	456
2.9 Technical advice to field offices	457
2.10 Publication of technical advice given taxpayers and local offices	457

CHAPTER XXIII

ASSESSMENT, REFUND, AND ADMINISTRATIVE
APPEAL PROCEDURES 459

Section A. Assessment and Audit Procedures	459
3.1 Introductory note	459
3.2a Details of the assessment and audit procedures re individuals (income tax)	459
3.2b Details of the assessment and audit procedures re corporations (corporations tax)	464
3.2c Details of the assessment and aduit procedures re individuals (wage tax)	465
Section B. Administrative Appeals	466
3.3 Introductory note	466
3.4a Details of the administrative appeal procedure re assessments in income tax (natural persons)	466
3.4b Details of the administrative appeal procedure re corporation tax assessments	468
3.4c Details of the administrative appeal procedure re assessments in wage tax (natural persons)	469

Section C. Extent Administrative Processing of Refund Claims Departs from Administrative Processing of Assessments	469
3.5 Introductory note	469
3.6 Details regarding refund procedures prior to an administrative appeal	470
3.7 Details of the administrative appeal procedure re refund claims	471

CHAPTER XXIV

RESOLUTION OF INTERPRETATIVE INCOME TAX QUESTIONS BY INDEPENDENT TRIBUNALS 473

4.1 Introduction	473
Section A. Organization and Procedures: Trial Level	474
4.2 Organization of the trial tribunals	474
4.3 Processing cases through the trial tribunals	476
Section B. Organization and Procedures: Appellate Tribunals	481
4.4 Organization of the appellate court system	481
4.5 Processing a case through the appellate tribunals	482