

# Michigan Law Review

---

Volume 101 | Issue 5

---

2003

## Front Matter

Michigan Law Review

Follow this and additional works at: <https://repository.law.umich.edu/mlr>

---

### Recommended Citation

Michigan Law Review, *Front Matter*, 101 MICH. L. REV. i (2003).  
Available at: <https://repository.law.umich.edu/mlr/vol101/iss5/1>

This Front Matter is brought to you for free and open access by the Michigan Law Review at University of Michigan Law School Scholarship Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in Michigan Law Review by an authorized editor of University of Michigan Law School Scholarship Repository. For more information, please contact [mlaw.repository@umich.edu](mailto:mlaw.repository@umich.edu).

# Michigan Law Review

**VOLUME 101**  
**2002-2003**

The University of Michigan  
Law School

Michigan Law Review  
Ann Arbor, Michigan 48109-1215

# Michigan Law Review

---

Vol. 101, No. 5

March 2003

## CONTENTS

### COLLOQUIUM

#### Retrying Race

### ESSAYS

FOREWORD: WHY RETRY? REVIVING DORMANT RACIAL JUSTICE CLAIMS . . . . .	<i>Martha Minow</i>	1133
RETRYING RACE . . . . .	<i>Anthony V. Alfieri</i>	1141
WHITE INTERESTS AND CIVIL RIGHTS REALISM: RODRIGO'S BITTERSWEET EPIPHANY . . . . .	<i>Richard Delgado</i>	1201
CLEANSING MOMENTS AND RETROSPECTIVE JUSTICE . . . . .	<i>Margaret M. Russell</i>	1225
AMERICAN RACIAL JUSTICE ON TRIAL—AGAIN: AFRICAN AMERICAN REPARATIONS, HUMAN RIGHTS, AND THE WAR ON TERROR . . . . .	<i>Eric K. Yamamoto</i> <i>Susan K. Serrano</i> and <i>Michelle Natividad Rodriguez</i>	1269

### NOTE

THE REPLACEMENT DILEMMA: AN ARGUMENT FOR ELIMINATING A NON-CLASS REPLACEMENT REQUIREMENT IN THE PRIMA FACIE STAGE OF TITLE VII INDIVIDUAL DISPARATE TREATMENT DISCRIMINATION CLAIMS . . . . .	<i>Marla Swartz</i>	1338
---	---------------------	------

### RECENT BOOKS

BOOKS RECEIVED . . . . .		1362
--------------------------	--	------

---

Copyright © 2003 by the Michigan Law Review Association. Except where otherwise expressly provided, the author of each article and Note in this issue has granted permission for copies of that article or Note to be made for educational use, provided that (i) copies are distributed at or below cost; (ii) the author and the *Michigan Law Review* are identified; (iii) prior written notice of the use is given to the Michigan Law Review Association; and (iv) proper notice of copyright is affixed to each copy.

*Michigan Law Review* (ISSN 0026-2234) is published monthly in October, November, December, February, March, May, June, and August. Subscriptions: United States, \$50 per year in advance, eight numbers; Foreign, \$60. Editorial and Business Offices: Hutchins Hall, 625 S. State St., Ann Arbor, Michigan 48109-1215; 734/764-0542 (Editorial); 734/763-5870 (Business); 734/647-5817 (Fax). Internet Address: <<http://www.law.umich.edu/JournalsandOrgs/mlr/>>. Periodicals postage paid at Ann Arbor, Michigan, and additional mailing offices. POSTMASTER: send address changes to Michigan Law Review, Hutchins Hall, 625 S. State St., Ann Arbor, Michigan 48109-1215.

Printed at Joe Christensen, Inc., Lincoln, Nebraska 68521.

Recent Volumes: Single Issues \$8, Book Review \$14, and Special Issues \$10, post-paid, at Editorial and Business Offices.

Volumes 1 through 95, as well as single issues in those volumes, are available in printed and microform from William S. Hein & Co., Inc., 1285 Main Street, Buffalo, New York 14209.

Because back stock of the *Review* is turned over to a dealer, back numbers are available to the *Review* for a short time only. We must therefore ask that subscribers report the nonreceipt of copies within six months of the mailing date.

We gladly consider unsolicited manuscripts for publication. Citations in manuscripts should follow the form prescribed in *The Bluebook: A Uniform System of Citation* (17th ed. 2000) and *The Chicago Manual of Style* (14th ed. 1993). We regret that we can return only those manuscripts for which we receive postage and handling fees of \$3.50 for first-class and \$1.50 for special fourth-class mail.

# UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN LAW SCHOOL

Winter 2003

## Administrative Officers

MARY SUE COLEMAN, B.A., Ph.D., *President of the University*  
PAUL N. COURANT, B.A., M.A., Ph.D., *Provost and Executive Vice-President for Academic Affairs*  
JEFFREY S. LEHMAN, A.B., M.P.P., J.D., *Dean*  
EVAN H. CAMINKER, B.A., J.D., *Associate Dean for Academic Affairs*  
VIRGINIA B. GORDAN, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Dean for International Programs*  
SARAH C. ZEARFOSS, A.B., J.D., *Assistant Dean and Director of Admissions*  
DAVID H. BAUM, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Dean of Students*  
CHARLOTTE H. JOHNSON, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Dean of Students*  
KATHERINE B. GOTTSCHALK, B.A., *Assistant Dean for Financial Aid*  
SUSAN M. GUINDI, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Dean for Career Services*  
GEORGE L. FOLLANSBEE, JR., A.B., J.D., *Assistant Dean for Development and Alumni Relations*  
ROBERT E. PRECHT, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Dean of Public Service*

## Professors Emeriti of Law

FRANCIS A. ALLEN, A.B., LL.B., J.D., LL.D., *Edson R. Sunderland Professor of Law*  
OLIN L. BROWDER, A.B., LL.B., S.J.D., *James V. Campbell Professor of Law*  
ALFRED F. CONARD, A.B., LL.B., LL.M., J.S.D., LL.D., *Henry M. Butzel Professor of Law*  
LUKE K. COOPERRIDER, B.S., J.D.  
SAMUEL D. ESTEP, A.B., J.D.  
ROBBEN W. FLEMING, B.A., LL.B., LL.D.  
WHITMORE GRAY, A.B., J.D., LL.D.  
JEROLD H. ISRAEL, B.B.A., LL.B., *Alene and Allan F. Smith Professor of Law*  
JOHN H. JACKSON, B.A., J.D., *Hessel E. Yntema Professor of Law*  
CHARLES W. JOINER, A.B., J.D.  
FRANK R. KENNEDY, A.B., LL.B., J.S.D., *Thomas M. Cooley Professor of Law*  
MARVIN L. NIEHUSS, A.B., LL.B.  
WILLIAM J. PIERCE, A.B., J.D.  
ROY F. PROFFITT, B.S., J.D., LL.M.  
JOHN W. REED, A.B., LL.B., LL.M., LL.D., JUR.Sc.D., *Thomas M. Cooley Professor of Law*  
TERRANCE SANDALOW, A.B., J.D., *Edson R. Sunderland Professor of Law*  
THEODORE J. ST. ANTOINE, A.B., J.D., *James E. and Sarah A. Degan Professor of Law*  
ERIC STEIN, J.U.D., J.D., DR.H.C., *Hessel E. Yntema Professor of Law*  
PETER O. STEINER, A.B., M.A., Ph.D.

## Professors of Law

LAYMAN E. ALLEN, A.B., M.P.A., LL.B.  
REUVEN S. AVI-YONAH, B.A., A.M., Ph.D., J.D., *Irwin I. Cohn Professor of Law*  
OMRI BEN-SHAHAR,\* B.A., LL.B., LL.M., Ph.D.  
EVAN H. CAMINKER, B.A., J.D.  
DAVID L. CHAMBERS,\* A.B., LL.B., *Wade H. McCree, Jr. Collegiate Professor of Law*  
SHERMAN J. CLARK, B.S., J.D.  
EDWARD H. COOPER,\* A.B., LL.B., *Thomas M. Cooley Professor of Law*  
STEVEN P. CROLEY, A.B., J.D., M.A.  
REBECCA S. EISENBERG, B.A., J.D., *Robert and Barbara Luciano Professor of Law*  
PHOEBE C. ELLSWORTH, A.B., Ph.D., *Kirkland and Ellis Professorship in Law*  
MERRITT B. FOX, B.A., J.D., Ph.D., *Alene and Allan F. Smith Professor of Law*  
RICHARD D. FRIEDMAN, B.A., J.D., D.Phil., *Ralph W. Aigler Collegiate Professor of Law*  
BRUCE W. FRIER, B.A., Ph.D., *Henry King Ransom Professor of Law*  
THOMAS A. GREEN, B.A., Ph.D., J.D., *John Philip Dawson Collegiate Professor of Law*  
SAMUEL R. GROSS, A.B., J.D., *Thomas G. and Mabel Long Professor of Law*  
JAMES C. HATHAWAY, LL.B., LL.M., J.S.D.  
DONALD J. HERZOG, A.B., A.M., Ph.D., *Edson R. Sunderland Professor of Law*  
RODERICK M. HILLS, JR., B.A., J.D.  
ROBERT L. HOWSE,\* B.A., LL.B., LL.M.  
DOUGLAS A. KAHN, B.A., J.D., *Paul G. Kauper Professor of Law*  
YALE KAMISAR,\* A.B., LL.B., LL.D., *Clarence Darrow Distinguished University Professor of Law*  
THOMAS E. KAUPER, A.B., J.D., *Henry M. Butzel Professor of Law*  
JAMES E. KRIER, B.S., J.D., *Earl Warren DeLano Professor of Law*  
JEFFREY S. LEHMAN, A.B., M.P.P., J.D.  
RICHARD O. LEMPERT,\* A.B., J.D., Ph.D., *Eric Stein Distinguished University Professor of Law*  
KYLE D. LOGUE, B.A., J.D.  
CATHARINE A. MACKINNON,\* B.A., J.D., Ph.D., *Elizabeth A. Long Professor of Law*  
DEBORAH C. MALAMUD,\* B.A., J.D., *James E. and Sarah A. Degan Professor of Law*  
RONALD J. MANN,\* B.A., J.D.  
WILLIAM I. MILLER, B.A., Ph.D., J.D., *Thomas G. Long Professor of Law*  
SALLYANNE PAYTON, A.B., LL.B.  
DONALD H. REGAN, A.B., LL.B., B.Phil., Ph.D., *William W. Bishop, Jr. Collegiate Professor of Law*  
MATHIAS W. REIMANN, DR. IUR., LL.M., *Hessel E. Yntema Professor of Law*

CARL E. SCHNEIDER,\* A.B., J.D.,  
*Chauncey Stillman Professorship for Ethics,  
 Morality, and the Practice of Law*  
 REBECCA J. SCOTT, A.B., M.PHIL., PH.D.  
 A.W. BRIAN SIMPSON, B.A., M.A., D.C.L.,  
*Charles F. and Edith J. Clyne Professor  
 of Law*  
 E. PHILIP SOPER, B.A., M.A., J.D., PH.D.,  
*James V. Campbell Professor of Law*  
 JOSEPH VINING, B.A., M.A., J.D.,  
*Harry Burns Hutchins Collegiate Professor of  
 Law*

LAWRENCE W. WAGGONER, B.B.A., J.D.,  
 D.PHIL.,  
*Lewis M. Simes Professor of Law*  
 PETER K. WESTEN,\* B.A., J.D.,  
*Frank G. Millard Professor of Law*  
 JAMES BOYD WHITE, A.B., A.M., LL.B.,  
*L. Hart Wright Collegiate Professor of Law*  
 JAMES J. WHITE, B.A., J.D.,  
*Robert A. Sullivan Professor of Law*  
 CHRISTINA B. WHITMAN,\* A.B., M.A., J.D.,  
*Francis A. Allen Collegiate Professor of Law*

*Assistant Professors of Law*

MICHAEL S. BARR, B.A., M.PHIL., J.D.  
 SUSANNA L. BLUMENTHAL, A.B., M.A., J.D.,  
 M.PHIL.  
 DANIEL HALBERSTAM, B.A., J.D.  
 PETER J. HAMMER, B.S., B.A., J.D., PH.D.  
 DAVID HASEN, B.A., PH.D., J.D.

ELLEN D. KATZ,\* B.A., J.D.  
 NINA A. MENDELSON, B.A., J.D.  
 RICHARD A. PRIMUS, A.B., D.PHIL., J.D.  
 ADAM C. PRITCHARD,\* B.A., M.P.P., J.D.  
 MOLLY S. VAN HOUWELING, B.A., J.D.  
 MARK D. WEST, B.A., J.D.

*Clinical Professors of Law*

DONALD N. DUQUETTE, B.A., J.D.  
 ROCHELLE E. LENTO, B.A., J.D.  
 PAUL D. REINGOLD, B.A., J.D.

NICHOLAS J. RINE,\* B.A., J.D.  
 GRACE C. TONNER, B.A., J.D.

*Clinical Assistant Professors of Law*

EDWARD R. BECKER, B.A., J.D.  
 KENNETH D. CHESTEK, B.A., J.D.  
 LAURENCE D. CONNOR, A.B., J.D.  
 SACHA M. COUPET, A.B., PH.D., J.D.  
 RACHEL CROSKERY-ROBERTS, B.A., J.D.  
 PHILIP M. FROST, B.A., J.D.  
 PAUL HOLLAND, B.A., J.D., LL.M.

BRIDGET M. MCCORMACK, B.A., J.D.  
 MARK K. OSBECK, A.B., M.A., J.D.  
 DAVID A. SANTACROCE, B.A., J.D., LL.M.  
 ANNE N. SCHROTH, B.A., J.D.  
 THOMAS H. SEYMOUR, B.A., M.A., J.D.  
 NANCY E. VETTORELLO, B.A., M.U.P., J.D.

*Affiliated Overseas Professors*

HANOCH DAGAN, LL.B., LL.M., J.S.D.

*Visiting Professors of Law*

LAN CAO, B.A., J.D.  
 MARIAN CRAIN, B.S., J.D.  
 DAVID H. GETCHES, A.B., J.D.  
 RODGER HAINES, B.A., LL.B.  
 KYRON J. HUIGENS, A.B., J.D.  
 SHERMAN JACKSON, B.A., M.A., PH.D.

ORIT KAMIR, LL.B., M.A., LL.M., J.S.D.  
 DINO KRITSIOTIS, LL.B., LL.M.  
 SCOTT E. MASTEN, M.A., PH.D.  
 LEONARD L. RISKIN, B.S., J.D., LL.M.  
 WILLIAM W. VAN ALSTYNE, B.A., J.D.  
 FRANK H. WU, B.A., J.D.

*Adjunct Professors of Law*

UZMA AHMAD, A.B., J.D.  
 JONATHAN ALGER, B.A., J.D.  
 JOHN E. BOS, B.A., J.D.  
 ELENA BRUNTSEVA, J.D., LL.M.  
 TIMOTHY L. DICKINSON, A.B., J.D., LL.M.  
 JAMES FORMAN, B.A., J.D.  
 SAUL A. GREEN, B.A., J.D.  
 ALISON E. HIRSCHL, B.A., J.D.  
 MARVIN KRISLOV, M.A., J.D.

KARL LUTZ, B.A., J.D.  
 ROBERTA J. MORRIS, A.B., J.D.  
 CYRIL MOSCOW, B.S., J.D.  
 LEONARD NIEHOFF, A.B., J.D.  
 TERRY PERRIS, B.A., J.D.  
 STEVEN W. RHODES, B.S., J.D.  
 MARK D. ROSENBAUM, B.A., J.D.  
 JOEL SAMUELS, B.A., J.D.  
 EDWARD R. STEIN, B.A., J.D.

*Adjunct Clinical Assistant Professors of Law*

CHARI GROVE, B.A., J.D.  
 NEIL S. KAGAN, B.S., M.S., J.D.

VALERIE R. NEWMAN, B.A., J.D.  
 STEVIE SWANSON, B.A., J.D.

*Adjunct Instructor*

MARGARET LEARY, B.A., M.A., J.D.

\* On Leave

# Michigan Law Review

Vol. 101, No. 5

March 2003

## EDITORIAL BOARD

### *Editor-in-Chief*

NADIA I. SHIHATA, *of Washington, D.C.*

### *Managing Editor*

THOMAS E. HOGAN, *of Connecticut*

### *Book Review Editors*

SEAN J. HARTIGAN, *of Florida*  
ASHLIE C. WARNICK, *of Virginia*

### *Executive Article Editor*

DAVID A. PETERS, *of Virginia*

### *Executive Note Editor*

STEFANIE A. DOEBLER, *of Pennsylvania*

### *Executive Editors*

ANN H. CHEN, *of Illinois*  
SARAH S. KEAST, *of Michigan*  
JEFFREY R. VESEL, *of Minnesota*

JOHN T. ADAMS, *of Arkansas*  
AAMRA S. AHMAD, *of Idaho*  
DEMIAN S. AHN, *of Washington, D.C.*  
SANTOSH S. ARAVIND, *of Michigan*  
DAVID AZCUE, *of New York*  
MARSHALL T. BELL, *of Alabama*  
MICHAEL W. BOWLING, *of Oklahoma*  
JOSCELYN R. CEKOLA, *of Michigan*  
TRENT B. COLLIER, *of Ohio*  
BRADLEY M. CONNERS, *of Wisconsin*  
JAY C. COPPOLETTA, *of Illinois*  
CLAIRE LOEBS DAVIS, *of Idaho*  
BRIAN R. GORMLEY, *of Virginia*  
JEFFREY D. KLINGMAN, *of Virginia*  
ELIZABETH A. KRONK, *of Michigan*

SELIA M. ACEVEDO, *of California*  
MICHAEL D. ADAMSKI, *of Michigan*  
JOSH A. AGEN, *of Wisconsin*  
AMNA A. AKBAR, *of Michigan*  
JOEL D. ANDERSEN, *of Iowa*  
JENELLE M. BEAVERS, *of Missouri*  
GARTH T. BEAVON, *of Michigan*  
TIMOTHY W. BUCKNELL, *of California*  
ERIC J. CARSTEN, *of California*  
OMAR N. CHAUDHARY, *of Ohio*  
BENJAMIN C. COATS, *of Michigan*  
PETER J. CUNNIFFE, *of Michigan*  
JOSHUA J. ELLISON, *of Pennsylvania*  
ERIC B. EVANS, *of Ohio*  
ADAM M. FLAKE, *of Utah*  
ANDREW L. FOSTER, *of Texas*  
JEREMY A. GORDON, *of Michigan*  
BRIAN C. HAGERTY, *of Minnesota*  
JOHANNA K. HARTWIG, *of California*  
THOMAS J. HUGHES, *of Michigan*  
BENJAMIN H. JACOBS, *of California*  
ANNE E. KANYUSIK, *of Minnesota*  
ROBERT A. KIBURZ, *of Wisconsin*  
UNA A. KIM, *of Connecticut*  
BRENDA L. KLEIDOSTY, *of California*

**BUSINESS MANAGER**  
DOROTHY A. KELLY

### *Article Editors*

MADELEINE V. FINDLEY, *of Ohio*  
WADE B. GENTZ, *of Texas*  
ANDREW P. LYCANS, *of Ohio*  
ANNA-ROSE MATHIESON, *of Oregon*  
ERIN L. SHENCOPP, *of Indiana*

### *Note Editors*

JOSHUA A. DOAN, *of New York*  
KRISTIN N. JOHNSON, *of Texas*  
ELIZABETH A. LEIFEL, *of Illinois*  
SEAN M. LEWIS, *of Vermont*  
LUMEN N. MULLIGAN, *of Kansas*  
JAGAN NICHOLAS RANJAN, *of Indiana*

### *Contributing Editors*

NEHA LALL, *of Michigan*  
DOUGLAS S. LLOYD, *of Washington*  
SARAH A. MCKUNE, *of Michigan*  
CHAD B. MEAD, *of Utah*  
ADAM S. NADELHAFT, *of New York*  
DAMON D. PERRY, *of Illinois*  
EFRAT RIFF, *of Michigan*  
JACOB T. RISNER, *of Indiana*  
JENNIFER L. SCHELLER, *of Pennsylvania*  
RACHEL E. SCHNELLER, *of Massachusetts*  
ERICA R. SEYBURN, *of Michigan*  
ALEX E. SPIUTE, *of California*  
MARLA H. SWARTZ, *of Michigan*  
SKANTHAN VIVEKAANDAMORTHY, *of California*  
SARAH A. ZUMWALT, *of New York*

### *Associate Editors*

BENJAMIN H. KLEIN, *of Pennsylvania*  
JEANNIE LEE, *of California*  
DANIEL A. LOEFFLER, *of Oklahoma*  
ANDREW C. MALONE, *of Wisconsin*  
JOHN M. MCNICHOLS, *of Idaho*  
DARREN T. NAKATA, *of Oregon*  
ELIZABETH M. NORMAN, *of New York*  
EMILY S. PALMER, *of Ohio*  
TROY D. PETERSON, *of Utah*  
MACKENZIE K. PHILLIPS, *of Illinois*  
BROOKE J. REID, *of Virginia*  
JEAN Y. RHEE, *of Michigan*  
BENJAMIN J. ROESCH, *of Wisconsin*  
LOUIS M. SEGRETI, *of Illinois*  
MARK J. SHERER, *of Michigan*  
MARK J. SHUBITZ, *of Illinois*  
KEVIN A. SMITH, *of Michigan*  
TYLER J. SMITH, *of New Jersey*  
BRENT T. STARKS, *of New York*  
TRACEY L. THOMAS, *of New Jersey*  
LAURA E. WARD, *of Florida*  
JONMICHEAL A. WHEAT, *of Texas*  
JENNIFER R. WHITE, *of New York*  
DANIEL A. ZIBEL, *of Massachusetts*

**EDITORIAL ASSISTANT**  
MELANIE D. EHLER