

# Michigan Law Review

---

Volume 88 | Issue 8

---

1990

## Front Matter

Michigan Law Review

Follow this and additional works at: <https://repository.law.umich.edu/mlr>

---

### Recommended Citation

Michigan Law Review, *Front Matter*, 88 MICH. L. REV. i (1990).

Available at: <https://repository.law.umich.edu/mlr/vol88/iss8/1>

This Front Matter is brought to you for free and open access by the Michigan Law Review at University of Michigan Law School Scholarship Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in Michigan Law Review by an authorized editor of University of Michigan Law School Scholarship Repository. For more information, please contact [mlaw.repository@umich.edu](mailto:mlaw.repository@umich.edu).

# Michigan Law Review

Vol. 88, No. 8

August 1990

## CONTENTS

### ARTICLES

- THE NEGATIVE CONSTITUTION: A CRITIQUE ..... *Susan Bandes* 2271

- TORT LAW AS CORRECTIVE JUSTICE:  
A PRAGMATIC JUSTIFICATION FOR  
JURY ADJUDICATION ..... *Catharine Pierce Wells* 2348

- WOMEN LAWYERS AND THE QUEST FOR  
PROFESSIONAL IDENTITY IN LATE  
NINETEENTH-CENTURY AMERICA ..... *Virginia G. Drachman* 2414

### CORRESPONDENCE

- OF TWO MINDS ABOUT LAW  
AND MINDS ..... *Larry Alexander* 2444

- THE CASE OF THE AMOROUS DEFENDANT:  
CRITICIZING ABSOLUTE STARE DECISIS FOR  
STATUTORY CASES ..... *William N. Eskridge, Jr.* 2450

- CONTEMPT OF CONGRESS: A REPLY TO  
THE CRITICS OF AN ABSOLUTE RULE OF  
STATUTORY STARE DECISIS ..... *Lawrence C. Marshall* 2467

## NOTE

MAKING SENSE OF BILLBOARD LAW: JUSTIFYING PROHIBITIONS AND EXEMPTIONS.....	2482
---	------

## RECENT BOOKS

BOOKS RECEIVED.....	2526
---------------------	------

## PERIODICAL INDEX

SUBJECT INDEX of Articles, Comments, Notes, and Recent Developments Appearing in Leading Law Reviews .....	2528
---	------

## INDEX

CONTENTS OF VOLUME 88: SUBJECT INDEX, ARTICLES, NOTES, AUTHORS, BOOKS REVIEWED .....	i
---	---

---

The design on the cover is taken from an etching of The University of Michigan Legal Research Building.

*Michigan Law Review* (ISSN 0026-2234) is published monthly October, November, December, February, April, May, June, and August. Subscriptions: United States, \$36 per year in advance, eight numbers; Foreign, \$40. Editorial and Business Offices: Hutchins Hall, Ann Arbor, Michigan 48109-1215. Second-class postage paid at Ann Arbor, Michigan, and additional mailing offices. POSTMASTER: send address changes to Michigan Law Review, Hutchins Hall, Ann Arbor, Michigan 48109-1215.

Printed at Joe Christensen, Inc., Lincoln, Nebraska 68521.

Recent Volumes: Single Issues \$7, Book Review and Special Issues \$13, postpaid, at Editorial and Business Offices.

Back issues and volumes (before November 1981) available from William S. Hein & Co., Inc., 1285 Main Street, Buffalo, New York 14209.

Because back stock of the *Review* is turned over to a dealer, back numbers are available to the *Review* for a short time only. It is therefore necessary to ask that subscribers report the nonreceipt of copies within six months of the mailing date.

We gladly consider unsolicited manuscripts for publication. Citations in manuscripts should follow the form prescribed in *A Uniform System of Citation* (14th ed.). We regret that we can return only those manuscripts for which we receive postage and handling fees of \$3.50 for first-class and \$1.50 for special fourth-class mail.

# UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN LAW SCHOOL

## *Administrative Officers*

JAMES J. DUDESTADT, M.S., PH.D., *President of the University*  
GILBERT R. WHITAKER, JR., M.S., PH.D., *Provost and Vice President for Academic Affairs*  
LEE C. BOLLINGER, B.S., J.D., *Dean*  
EDWARD H. COOPER, A.B., LL.B., *Associate Dean for Academic Affairs*  
SUSAN M. EKLUND, A.B., J.D., *Associate Dean for Student Affairs and Operations*  
BEVERLEY J. POOLEY, B.A., LL.B., LL.M., S.J.D., *Associate Dean for the Law Library*  
VIRGINIA B. GORDAN, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Dean for Student Affairs*  
JONATHAN D. LOWE, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Dean for Law School Relations*  
ALLAN T. STILLWAGON, A.B., M.A., *Assistant Dean and Admissions Officer*

## *Professors Emeriti of Law*

FRANCIS A. ALLEN, A.B., LL.B., J.D., LL.D.,  
*Edson R. Sunderland Professor of Law*  
OLIN L. BROWDER, JR., A.B., LL.B., S.J.D.,  
*James V. Campbell Professor of Law*  
ALFRED F. CONARD, A.B., LL.B., LL.M., J.S.D.,  
*LL.D., Henry M. Butzel Professor of Law*  
LUKE K. COOPERRIDER, B.S., J.D.  
SAMUEL D. ESTEP, A.B., J.D.  
ROBBEN W. FLEMING, B.A., LL.B., LL.D.  
CHARLES W. JOINER, A.B., J.D.  
FRANK R. KENNEDY, A.B., LL.B., J.S.D.,  
*Thomas M. Cooley Professor of Law*

MARVIN L. NIEHUSS, A.B., LL.B.  
GEORGE E. PALMER, A.B., J.D., LL.M.  
WILLIAM J. PIERCE, A.B., J.D.  
ROY F. PROFFITT, B.S., J.D., LL.M.  
JOHN W. REED, A.B., LL.B., LL.M., JUR.Sc.D.,  
*Thomas M. Cooley Professor of Law*  
ALLAN F. SMITH, A.B., LL.B., LL.M., S.J.D.  
RUSSELL A. SMITH, A.B., J.D.  
ERIC STEIN, J.U.D., J.D., DR.H.C., DR.H.C.,  
*Hessel E. Yntema Professor of Law*  
ANDREW S. WATSON, B.S., M.D., M.S. IN MED.

## *Professors of Law*

HOWARD B. ABRAMS,\* B.A., J.D.  
T. ALEXANDER ALEINIKOFF, B.A., J.D.  
LAYMAN E. ALLEN, A.B., M.P.A., LL.B.  
AHARON BARAK,\*  
GUYORA BINDER,\* A.B., J.D.  
LEE C. BOLLINGER, B.S., J.D.  
MICHAEL H. BRADLEY, M.B.A., PH.D.  
DAVID L. CHAMBERS,\*\* A.B., LL.B.,  
*Wade H. McCree Professor of Law*  
JULIUS L. CHAMBERS, B.A., M.A., J.D., LL.M.  
EDWARD H. COOPER, A.B., LL.B.,  
*Thomas M. Cooley Professor of Law*  
ROGER A. CUNNINGHAM, S.B., J.D.,  
*James V. Campbell Professor of Law*  
GENNADY M. DANILENKO,\* DIPL., J.D.  
DONALD N. DUQUETTE,†† B.A., J.D.  
PIERRE-MARIE DUPUY,\* J.D.  
REBECCA S. EISENBERG,\*\* B.A., J.D.  
PHOEBE C. ELLSWORTH,\*\* A.B., PH.D.  
MERRITT B. FOX,\*\* B.A., J.D., PH.D.  
RICHARD D. FRIEDMAN,\*\* B.A., J.D., D.PHIL.  
BRUCE W. FRIER, B.A., PH.D.  
STEPHEN A. GARDBAUM,\* B.A., M.Sc., PH.D., J.D.  
WHITMORE GRAY, A.B., J.D., LL.D.  
THOMAS A. GREEN, B.A., PH.D., J.D.,  
*John Philip Dawson Professor of Law*  
SAMUEL R. GROSS, A.B., J.D.  
JEROLD H. ISRAEL, B.B.A., LL.B.,  
*Alene and Allan F. Smith Professor of Law*  
JOHN H. JACKSON, B.A., J.D.,  
*Hessel E. Yntema Professor of Law*  
DOUGLAS A. KAHN, B.A., J.D.,  
*Paul G. Kauper Professor of Law*  
YALE KAMISAR, A.B., LL.B., LL.D.,  
*Henry King Ransom Professor of Law*  
THOMAS E. KAUPER, A.B., J.D.,  
*Henry M. Butzel Professor of Law*

LARRY B. KRAMER,\* A.B., J.D.  
JAMES E. KRIER, B.S., J.D.,  
*Earl Warren DeLano Professor of Law*  
RICHARD O. LEMPERT, A.B., J.D., PH.D.,  
*Francis A. Allen Professor of Law*  
CATHARINE A. MACKINNON, B.A., J.D., PH.D.  
MITSUO MATSUSHITA,\* B.A., PH.D., D.JUR.  
MENACHEM MAUTNER,\* LL.B., LL.M., J.S.D.  
WILLIAM I. MILLER,\*\* B.A., PH.D., J.D.  
SALLYANNE PAYTON, A.B., LL.B.  
BEVERLEY J. POOLEY, B.A., LL.B., LL.M., S.J.D.  
DONALD H. REGAN, A.B., LL.B., B.PHIL., PH.D.,  
*William W. Bishop, Jr. Professor of Law*  
MATHIAS W. REIMANN, DR. JUR., LL.M.  
PAUL D. REINGOLD,†† B.A., J.D.  
THEODORE J. ST. ANTOINE, A.B., J.D.,  
*James E. and Sarah A. Degan Professor of Law*  
TERRANCE SANDALOW, A.B., J.D.,  
*Edson R. Sunderland Professor of Law*  
CARL E. SCHNEIDER,\*\* A.B., J.D.  
JOEL SELIGMAN, A.B., J.D.  
BRUNO SIMMA, J.D.  
A.W. BRIAN SIMPSON, B.A., M.A., D.C.L.,  
*Charles F. and Edith J. Clyne Professor of Law*  
PHILIP SOPER, B.A., M.A., J.D., PH.D.  
JOSEPH Vining, B.A., M.A., J.D.,  
*Harry Burns Hutchins Professor of Law*  
LAWRENCE W. WAGGONER, B.B.A., J.D.,  
D.PHIL., *Lewis M. Stites Professor of Law*  
JOSEPH WEILER, B.A., LL.B., PH.D., LL.M.  
PETER K. WESTEN, B.A., J.D.  
JAMES BOYD WHITE, A.B., A.M., LL.B.,  
*L. Hart Wright Professor of Law*  
JAMES J. WHITE, B.A., J.D.,  
*Robert A. Sullivan Professor of Law*  
PATRICIA D. WHITE,\* B.A., J.D., M.A.  
CHRISTINA B. WHITMAN, A.B., M.A., J.D.

## *Assistant Professors of Law*

MARIE R. DEVENEY, B.A., M.A., J.D.  
JULIE M. FIELD,†† B.A., J.D.  
AVERY KATZ,\*\* B.A., M.A., J.D., PH.D.  
LEO KATZ,\*\* B.A., M.A., J.D.  
JEFFREY S. LEHMAN, A.B., J.D., M.P.P.  
MARK D. MITSHKUN,†† B.A., J.D.

JUDITH G. OLIN,†† B.A., J.D.  
RICHARD H. PILDES, A.B., J.D.  
NICHOLAS J. RINE,†† B.A., J.D.  
SUELLYN SCARNECCIA,†† B.A., J.D.  
KENT D. SYVERUD, B.S.F.S., J.D., M.A.  
MARK C. VAN PUTTEN,†† B.A., J.D.

## *Instructor in Law*

MARY F. WHITE, B.A., J.D.

## *Lecturers in Law*

FRED E. BELL,† B.A., J.D.

FREDERICK W. LAMBERT,† A.B., J.D.,  
† Adjunct                            † Clinical

ROCHELLE E. LENTO, B.A., J.D.

DAVID M. PIONTKOWSKY,† B.S., J.D.,  
\* Visiting                            \*\* On Leave

# Michigan Law Review

Vol. 88, No. 8

August 1990

## EDITORIAL BOARD

### *Editor-in-Chief*

DAVID D. MEYER, *of Michigan*

### *Managing Editor*

GREGORY B. HELLER, *of Delaware*

#### *Book Review Editors*

GREGORY T. EVERTS, *of Wisconsin*  
CAROL J. SULCOSKI, *of Pennsylvania*

#### *Executive Article Editor*

RENÉ L. TODD, *of Ohio*

#### *Executive Note Editor*

DANA M. MUIR, *of Michigan*

#### *Executive Editors*

KEITH R. DENNY, *of Michigan*  
ERIK G. LIGHT, *of Illinois*

#### *Article Editors*

R. DOUGLASS BOND, *of New Jersey*  
DAVID C. ESSEKS, *of New York*  
MARY I. HINIKER, *of Michigan*  
ERIC S. WALTERS, *of Michigan*

#### *Note Editors*

AUDREY J. ANDERSON, *of Minnesota*  
WILLIAM J. ASELYNNE, *of Michigan*  
PETER E. JAFFE, *of Pennsylvania*  
MARY BETH MURPHY, *of Virginia*  
EDWARD J. SEBOLD, *of Ohio*  
GRAEME E. SHARPE, *of New York*

#### *Contributing Editors*

CHRISTOPHER M. ADAMS, *of Louisiana*  
GAIL C. BENT, *of New York*  
DAVID A. CERDA, *of Illinois*  
CARY J. COGLIANESE, *of Michigan*  
JONATHAN J. ENGLANDER, *of New York*  
BRADLEY L. FISHER, *of Washington*  
LISA D. FREEMAN, *of Illinois*  
WILLIAM J. GALLAGHER, *of Illinois*  
SUSAN M. GUINDI, *of Michigan*  
STEVEN A. KLEIN, *of New Jersey*

GREGORY B. LADEWSKI, *of Washington, D.C.*  
JOHN I. LAZAR, *of Michigan*  
THEODORE MACVEAGH, *of New Hampshire*  
K. HEATHER MCRAY, *of New York*  
MARTA E. NELSON, *of Ohio*  
MARK G. PETERS, *of New York*  
LAURA M. SCHACHTER, *of New Jersey*  
STANLEY S. SOKUL, *of New Hampshire*  
MELANIE S. STEIN, *of New York*  
RONALD C. WERNETTE, *of Michigan*

#### *Associate Editors*

GREGG M. AUDET, *of New Hampshire*  
KEITH R. BARNETT, *of Massachusetts*  
GREGORY W. BLACK, *of Illinois*  
ROBERT A. BRUNDAGE, *of Missouri*  
AARON H. CAPLAN, *of Iowa*  
MICHAEL F. COLOSI, *of Massachusetts*  
KATHRYN M. DESSAYER, *of California*  
KENNETH P. EWING, *of Maryland*  
STEVEN M. FARINA, *of Connecticut*  
JULIA A. GOATLEY, *of Michigan*  
DAVID B. GOLDMAN, *of Connecticut*  
MERYL T. GORDON, *of New York*  
ADAM S. GRACE, *of New Jersey*  
WENDEL V. HALL, *of Michigan*  
MATTHEW R. HARRIS, *of Washington*  
LAURA J. HINES, *of Iowa*  
DANIEL R. HURLEY, *of New York*

MICHAEL K. ISENMAN, *of Maryland*  
TRINA JONES, *of South Carolina*  
STEVEN W. KASTEN, *of Massachusetts*  
DANIAL J. KIM, *of Michigan*  
MARTIN D. LITT, *of Connecticut*  
BRIAN E. MAZUREK, *of Michigan*  
JILL D. NEIMAN, *of New York*  
CHRISTINE A. PAGAC, *of Michigan*  
EVELYN E. SHOCKLEY, *of Tennessee*  
ADAM C. SLOANE, *of New York*  
CRAIG T. SMITH, *of Michigan*  
JAMES B. SPETA, *of Illinois*  
ALBERT L. VREELAND, II, *of Alabama*  
WILLIAM A. WALKER, *of New York*  
STEFANIE B. WEIGMANN, *of New Jersey*  
EDWARD J. WONG, III, *of Illinois*  
GREGORY J. ZEMANICK, *of Pennsylvania*

#### BUSINESS MANAGER

Eleonora V. Eckert

#### EDITORIAL ASSISTANT

Jenne S. Moldovan

## ANNOUNCEMENT OF AWARDS AND PRIZES

### JASON L. HONIGMAN AWARD FOR 1989-1990

This award has been given to Gregory B. Heller in recognition of his outstanding contributions as editor of the *Michigan Law Review*.

### HOWARD B. COBLENTZ PRIZE FOR 1989-1990

This prize has been awarded to Dana M. Muir, Carol J. Sulcoski, and René L. Todd in recognition of their contributions as editors of the *Michigan Law Review*.

### HELEN L. DEREOY MEMORIAL AWARD FOR 1989-1990

This award has been given to Audrey J. Anderson, author of *Corporate Life After Death: CERCLA Preemption of State Corporate Dissolution Law*, judged the best student contribution to Volume 88 of the *Michigan Law Review*.

### SCRIBES AWARD FOR 1989-1990

An honorary membership in Scribes, the Society of Writers on Legal Subjects, is given for an outstanding published written contribution to the *Michigan Law Review* to Dana M. Muir for her Note, entitled *Changing the Rules of the Game: Pension Plan Terminations and Early Retirement Benefits*.

### ABRAM N. SEMPLINER MEMORIAL AWARD FOR 1989-1990

This award has been given to James B. Speta, Editor-in-Chief of Volume 89 of the *Michigan Law Review*, in recognition of his superior scholastic record, effective leadership, and outstanding contribution to the *Review*.

### BODMAN-LONGLEY AWARD FOR 1989-1990

This award has been given to Gregg M. Audet, Gregory W. Black, Robert A. Brundage, Michael F. Colosi, Kathryn M. Dessayer, Steven M. Farina, Julia A. Goatley, and Wendel Hall in recognition of their superior scholastic records and their contributions to the *Michigan Law Review* in their junior year.

### RAYMOND K. DYKEMA AWARD FOR 1989-1990

This award has been given to Matthew R. Harris, Laura J. Hines, Daniel R. Hurley, Michael K. Isenman, Trina Jones, Christine Pagac, Evelyn Shockley, Adam C. Sloane, and William A. Walker for significant contributions to the *Michigan Law Review* during their junior year and in recognition of qualities that indicate the likelihood of future contributions to the legal profession.

## ANNOUNCEMENT OF THE EDITORIAL BOARD 1990-1991

*Editor-in-Chief*  
JAMES B. SPETA, of Illinois

*Managing Editor*  
JULIA A. GOATLEY, of Michigan

*Book Review Editors*  
STEVEN M. FARINA, of Connecticut  
ADAM C. SLOANE, of New York

*Executive Article Editor*  
MATTHEW R. HARRIS, of Washington

*Executive Note Editor*  
KATHRYN M. DESSAYER, of California

*Executive Editors*  
GREGG M. AUDET, of New Hampshire  
GREGORY W. BLACK, of Illinois

*Article Editors*  
DANIEL R. HURLEY, of New York  
MICHAEL K. ISENMAN, of Maryland  
TRINA JONES, of South Carolina  
WILLIAM A. WALKER, of New York

*Note Editors*  
ROBERT A. BRUNDAGE, of Missouri  
MICHAEL F. COLOSI, of Massachusetts  
WENDEL V. HALL, of Michigan  
LAURA J. HINES, of Iowa  
CHRISTINE A. PAGAC, of Michigan  
EVELYN E. SHOCKLEY, of Tennessee

*Contributing Editors*  
KEITH R. BARNETT, of Massachusetts  
AARON H. CAPLAN, of Iowa  
CARY COGLIANESE, of Michigan  
KENNETH P. EWING, of Maryland  
DAVID B. GOLDMAN, of Connecticut  
MERYL T. GORDON, of New York  
ADAM S. GRACE, of New Jersey  
STEVEN W. KASTEN, of Massachusetts  
DANIAL J. KIM, of Michigan  
MARTIN D. LITT, of Connecticut  
BRIAN E. MAZUREK, of Michigan  
JILL D. NIEMAN, of New York  
CRAIG T. SMITH, of Michigan  
ALBERT L. VREELAND, II, of Alabama  
STEFANIE B. WEIGMANN, of New Jersey  
EDWARD J. WONG, III, of Illinois  
GREGORY J. ZEMANICK, of Pennsylvania