Michigan Law Review

Vol. 92, No. 8 August 1994

CONTENTS

SYMPOSIUM

Visions of Equality: The Future of Title VII

No Time for Trumpets: Title VII, Equality, and the Fin de Siècle........... D. Marvin Jones 2311

Structuralist and Cultural Domination

Theories Meet Title VII: Some Contemporary Influences ............... Martha Chamallas 2370

The Anticaste Principle......................... Cass R. Sunstein 2410

Caste and the Civil Rights Laws: From Jim Crow to Same-Sex Marriages ...... Richard A. Epstein 2456

Title VII and the Complex Female Subject ......................... Kathryn Abrams 2479

Only Girls Wear Barrettes: Dress and Appearance Standards, Community Norms, and Workplace Equality .... Katharine T. Bartlett 2541

Employment Discrimination Law in Perspective: Three Concepts of Equality ......................... John J. Donohue III 2583

Copyright © 1994 by The Michigan Law Review Association
UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN LAW SCHOOL

Summer 1994

Administrative Officers

JAMES J. DUDERSTADT, M.S., PH.D., President of the University
GILBERT R. WHITAKER, JR., M.S., PH.D., Provost and Vice President for Academic Affairs
JEFFREY S. LEHMAN, A.B., J.D., M.P.P., Dean
EDWARD H. COOPER, A.B., LL.B., Associate Dean for Academic Affairs
SUSAN M. EKlund, A.B., J.D., Associate Dean for Student Affairs and Operations
BEVERLEY J. POOLEY, B.A., LL.B., LL.M., S.J.D., Associate Dean for the Law Library

VIRGINIA B. GORDAN, B.A., J.D., Assistant Dean for Student Affairs
ANNE P. KNOTT, B.S., M.A.T., Assistant Dean and Director for Development & Alumni Relations
JONATHAN D. LOWE, B.A., J.D., Assistant Dean for Law School Relations

DENNIS J. SHIELDS, B.A., J.D., Assistant Dean and Admissions Officer

Professors Emeriti of Law

FRANCIS A. ALLEN, A.B., LL.B., J.D.,
Edson R. Sunderland Professor of Law
OLIN L. BROWDER, JR., A.B., LL.B., S.J.D.,
James V. Campbell Professor of Law
ALFRED F. CONARD, A.B., LL.B., LL.M., J.S.D., LL.D., Henry M. Butzel Professor of Law
LUKE K. COOPER RIDER, B.S., J.D.
SAMUEL D. ESTEP, A.B., J.D.
ROBBEN W. FLEMING, B.A., LL.B., LL.D.
WHITMORE GRAY, A.B., J.D., LL.D.
CHARLES W. JOINER, A.B., J.D.
FRANK R. KENNEDY, A.B., LL.B., J.S.D.,
Thomas M. Cooley Professor of Law
MARVIN L. NIEBUSS, A.B., LL.B.
WILLIAM J. PIERCE, A.B., J.D.
ROY F. PROPPITT, B.S., J.D., LL.M.
JOHN W. REED, A.B., LL.B., LL.M., JUR.Sc.D.,
Thomas M. Cooley Professor of Law
RUSSELL A. SMITH, A.B., J.D.
ERIC STEIN, J.U.D., J.D., Dr.H.C., Dr.H.C.,
Hessel E. Yntema Professor of Law

Professors of Law

T. ALEXANDER ALEINIKOFF,** B.A., J.D.
LAYMAN E. ALLEN, A.B., M.P.A., LL.B.
JOSE E. ALVAREZ, B.A., A.B., J.D.
MICHAEL H. BRADLEY, M.B.A., PH.D.
DAVID L. CHAMBERS, A.B., LL.B.,
Wade H. McCree Professor of Law
EDWARD H. COOPER, A.B., LL.B.,
Thomas M. Cooley Professor of Law
DONALD N. DUQUETTE,** B.A., J.D.
REBECCA S. EISENBERG, B.A., J.D.
PHOEBE C. ELSWORTH, A.B., PH.D.,
Kirkland & Ellis Professor of Law
MERRITT B. FOX, B.A., J.D., PH.D.
RICHARD D. FRIEDMAN, B.A., J.D., D.PHIL.
BRUCE W. FRIER, B.A., Ph.D., Henry King Ransom Professor of Law
THOMAS A. GREEN, B.A., PH.D., J.D.,
John Philip Dawson Professor of Law
SAMUEL R. GROSS, A.B., J.D.
ROBERT J. HARRIS,† B.A., LL.B.
DONALD J. HERZOG, A.B., A.M., PH.D.
JEROLD H. ISRAEL, B.A., B.B.A.,
Allene and Allan F. Smith Professor of Law
JOHN H. JACKSON, B.A., J.D.,
Hessel E. Yntema Professor of Law
DOUGLAS A. KAHN, B.A., J.D.,
Paul G. Kauper Professor of Law
YALE KAMISAR, A.B., LL.B., LL.D.,
Clarence Darrow Distinguished University Professor of Law

AVERY KATZ, B.A., M.A., J.D., PH.D.
THOMAS E. KAUPER, A.B., J.D.,
Henry M. Butzel Professor of Law
JAMES E. KRIER, B.S., J.D.,
Earl Warren DeLano Professor of Law
JEFFREY S. LEHMAN, A.B., J.D., M.P.P.
RICHARD O. LEMPERT, A.B., J.D., PH.D.,
Francis A. Allen Professor of Law
CATHERINE A. MACKINNON, B.A., PH.D.,
WILLIAM J. MILLER, B.A., PH.D.,
SALLY ANNE PAYTON, A.B., LL.B.
RICHARD H. PILDES, A.B., J.D.
BEVERLEY J. POOLEY, B.A., LL.B., LL.M.,
CARL E. SCHNEIDER, A.B.,
JOHN G. KAUPER PROFESSOR OF LAW
THOMAS A. GREEN, B.A., PH.D., J.D.,
John Philip Dawson Professor of Law
SAMUEL R. GROSS, A.B., J.D.
ROBERT J. HARRIS,† B.A., LL.B.
DONALD J. HERZOG, A.B., A.M., PH.D.
JEROLD H. ISRAEL, B.A., B.B.A.,
Allene and Allan F. Smith Professor of Law
JOHN H. JACKSON, B.A., J.D.,
Hessel E. Yntema Professor of Law
DOUGLAS A. KAHN, B.A., J.D.,
Paul G. Kauper Professor of Law
YALE KAMISAR, A.B., LL.B., LL.D.,
Clarence Darrow Distinguished University Professor of Law

AVERY KATZ, B.A., M.A., J.D., PH.D.
THOMAS E. KAUPER, A.B., J.D.,
Henry M. Butzel Professor of Law
JAMES E. KRIER, B.S., J.D.,
Earl Warren DeLano Professor of Law
JEFFREY S. LEHMAN, A.B., J.D., M.P.P.
RICHARD O. LEMPERT, A.B., J.D., PH.D.,
Francis A. Allen Professor of Law
CATHERINE A. MACKINNON, B.A., PH.D.,
WILLIAM J. MILLER, B.A., PH.D.,
SALLY ANNE PAYTON, A.B., LL.B.
RICHARD H. PILDES, A.B., J.D.
BEVERLEY J. POOLEY, B.A., LL.B., LL.M.,
CARL E. SCHNEIDER, A.B.,
JOHN G. KAUPER PROFESSOR OF LAW
THOMAS A. GREEN, B.A., PH.D., J.D.,
John Philip Dawson Professor of Law
SAMUEL R. GROSS, A.B., J.D.
ROBERT J. HARRIS,† B.A., LL.B.
DONALD J. HERZOG, A.B., A.M., PH.D.
JEROLD H. ISRAEL, B.A., B.B.A.,
Allene and Allan F. Smith Professor of Law
JOHN H. JACKSON, B.A., J.D.,
Hessel E. Yntema Professor of Law
DOUGLAS A. KAHN, B.A., J.D.,
Paul G. Kauper Professor of Law
YALE KAMISAR, A.B., LL.B., LL.D.,
Clarence Darrow Distinguished University Professor of Law

AVERY KATZ, B.A., M.A., J.D., PH.D.
THOMAS E. KAUPER, A.B., J.D.,
Henry M. Butzel Professor of Law
JAMES E. KRIER, B.S., J.D.,
Earl Warren DeLano Professor of Law
JEFFREY S. LEHMAN, A.B., J.D., M.P.P.
RICHARD O. LEMPERT, A.B., J.D., PH.D.,
Francis A. Allen Professor of Law
CATHERINE A. MACKINNON, B.A., PH.D.,
WILLIAM J. MILLER, B.A., PH.D.,
SALLY ANNE PAYTON, A.B., LL.B.
RICHARD H. PILDES, A.B., J.D.
BEVERLEY J. POOLEY, B.A., LL.B., LL.M.,
CARL E. SCHNEIDER, A.B.,
JOHN G. KAUPER PROFESSOR OF LAW
THOMAS A. GREEN, B.A., PH.D., J.D.,
John Philip Dawson Professor of Law
SAMUEL R. GROSS, A.B., J.D.
ROBERT J. HARRIS,† B.A., LL.B.
DONALD J. HERZOG, A.B., A.M., PH.D.
JEROLD H. ISRAEL, B.A., B.B.A.,
Allene and Allan F. Smith Professor of Law
JOHN H. JACKSON, B.A., J.D.,
Hessel E. Yntema Professor of Law
DOUGLAS A. KAHN, B.A., J.D.,
Paul G. Kauper Professor of Law
YALE KAMISAR, A.B., LL.B., LL.D.,
Clarence Darrow Distinguished University Professor of Law
PHILIP SOPER, B.A., M.A., J.D., Ph.D.
James V. Campbell Professor of Law
KENT D. SYVERUD, B.S.F.S., J.D., M.A.
MARK C. VAN PUTTEN, B.A., J.D.
JOSEPH VIXING, B.A., M.A., J.D.
Harry Burns Hutchins Professor of Law
LAWRENCE W. WAGGONER, B.B.A., J.D.
D.Phil., Lewis M. Simes Professor of Law

Peter K. Westen, B.A., J.D.
Frank G. Millard Professor of Law
James Boyd White, A.B., A.M., LL.B.
L. Hart Wright Professor of Law
James J. White, B.A., J.D.
Robert A. Sullivan Professor of Law
CHRISTINA B. WHITMAN, A.B., M.A., J.D.

Assistant Professors of Law

P.E. BENNETT,† B.S., M.A., J.D.
STEVEN P. CROLEY, A.B., J.D., M.A.
HEIDI L. FELDMAN, B.A., J.D., Ph.D.
JULIE M. FIELD,† B.A., J.D.
ROCHELLE E. LENTO,† B.A., J.D.
KYLE D. LOGUE, B.A., J.D.

DEBORAH C. MALAMUD, B.A., J.D.
MARK D. MITSHKUN,† B.A., J.D.
NICHOLAS J. RINE,† B.A., J.D.
SUELLYN SCARNECCHIA, B.A., J.D.
THEODORE M. SHAW,** B.A., J.D.

Instructor in Law

CYNTHIA A. BAKER,† B.G.A., J.D.
† Adjunct †† Clinical ** On Leave
ANNOUNCEMENT OF AWARDS AND PRIZES

JASON L. HONIGMAN AWARD FOR 1993-1994
This award has been given to David C. Dinielli and Cynthia A. Stroman in recognition of their outstanding contributions as editors of the Michigan Law Review.

HOWARD B. COBLENTZ PRIZE FOR 1993-1994
This prize has been awarded to Robert M. Fogler and Sonia M. Suter in recognition of their contributions as editors of the Michigan Law Review.

HELEN L. DEROY MEMORIAL AWARD FOR 1993-1994
This award has been given to Mitchell N. Berman, author of Removal and the Eleventh Amendment: The Case for District Court Remand Discretion To Avoid a Bifurcated Suit, judged the best student contribution to the Michigan Law Review during the past year.

SCRIBE AWARD FOR 1993-1994
An honorary membership in Scribes, the Society of Writers on Legal Subjects, is given for an outstanding published written contribution to the Michigan Law Review to Michael R. Phillips, for his Note, entitled The Constitutionality of Employer-Accessible Child Abuse Registries: Due Process Implications of Governmental Occupational Blacklisting.

ABRAM W. SEMPLINER MEMORIAL AWARD FOR 1993-1994
This award has been given to Linda L. Terry, Editor-in-Chief of Volume 93 of the Michigan Law Review, in recognition of her superior scholastic record, effective leadership, and outstanding contribution to the Review.

BODMAN-LONGLEY AWARD FOR 1993-1994
This award has been given to C. Ian Anderson, Katherine D. Ashley, Benjamin C. Bair, Paul R. Bernard, Robert L. Bronston, Michael A. Carrier, Steven C. Coberly, Martha Dye, Samuel L. Feder, and Jared A. Goldstein in recognition of their superior scholastic records and their contributions to the Michigan Law Review in their junior year.

RAYMOND K. DYKEMA SCHOLARSHIP AWARD FOR 1993-1994
This award has been given to Jim Greiner, Jonathan D. Hacker, Roger A. Hipp, Gerald F. Leonard, David A. Luigs, David A. Sutphen, and Kevin T. Traskos for significant contributions to the Michigan Law Review during their junior year and in recognition of qualities that indicate the likelihood of future contributions to the legal profession.

ANNOUNCEMENT OF THE EDITORIAL BOARD

Editor-in-Chief
LINDA L. TERRY, of Michigan

Managing Editor
JONATHAN D. HACKER, of Kansas

Book Review Editors
Benjamin C. Bair, of Ohio
Michael A. Carrier, of New York

Executive Article Editor
Paul R. Bernard, of New York

Executive Note Editor
Jared A. Goldstein, of Kansas

Executive Editors
Katherine D. Ashley, of Rhode Island
Roger A. Hipp, of Kansas

Contributing Editors
John C. Blattner, of Michigan
Steven W. Clark, of Michigan
Jeffrey R. Costello, of Michigan
Christopher R. Falk, of Illinois
Timothy P. Harkness, of Michigan
Richard E. Klarman, of Michigan
Daniel B. Kosove, of Florida
Dawn R. Kreyser, of Georgia
Eric R. Lamison, of Michigan
Melissa A. Leonard, of Ohio
James D. Lewis, of Michigan
Bryan W. Metcalf, of Kentucky
Diane L. Millar, of California

Article Editors
Robert L. Bronston, of Maryland
Martha Dye, of Minnesota
Jim Greiner, of South Carolina
Gerald F. Leonard, of New York

Note Editors
C. Ian Anderson, of California
Steven C. Coberly, of New Mexico
Samuel L. Feder, of Virginia
David A. Luigs, of Virginia
David A. Sutphen, of Wisconsin
Kevin T. Traskos, of Connecticut

Christina Nicolosi, of California
Susan M. Rabinowitz, of Illinois
David L. Schwartz, of Illinois
Bruce H. Searby, of Maryland
Seth J. Sergent-Leventhal, of Connecticut
Melissa Nicholson Starkey, of Ohio
Stacy R. Stoller, of New York
Michael Todd Wade, of Texas
Eugene Whitlock, of California
Eric L. Zagar, of Michigan

DIANE L. MILLAR, of California