CONTENTS

ARTICLES

Understanding State Agency Independence ................. Miriam Seifter 1537

Transparenthood ........................................... Sonia K. Katyal
                                               Ilona M. Turner 1593

NOTES

What Is “New”?:
Defining “New Judgment”
After Magwood .......................................... Patrick Cothern 1669

Secret Searches:
The SCA’s Standing Conundrum ....................... Aviv S. Halpern 1697
Call for Submissions

The editors of the Michigan Law Review invite essay submissions on current areas of legal thought and research for the Michigan Law Review Online.

Michigan Law Review Online publishes short articles and op-ed style pieces by academics, judges, practitioners, and law students, as well as timely responses to articles in the print journal of the Michigan Law Review. Our online companion quickly disseminates the legal community’s initial impressions of important judicial decisions and legislative developments.

Michigan Law Review Online prefers submissions under 6,000 words inclusive of footnotes and can only very rarely accept longer pieces. Submissions should be written in a style accessible to a general audience of practitioners and policymakers. Pieces will be published on an expedited production schedule.


Please send questions and comments to the Executive Online Editors at mlr.online@umich.edu
The editors of the *Michigan Law Review* are pleased to announce

2020 SURVEY OF BOOKS RELATING TO THE LAW published April 2020


Please address inquiries to:

Michigan Law Review
University of Michigan Law School
Attn: Book Review Editors
625 S. State St.
Ann Arbor, MI 48109-1215

Visit our website at
UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN LAW SCHOOL

Administrative Officers

Mark Schlissel, B.A., M.D., Ph.D., President of the University
Martin A. Philbert, B.Sc., Ph.D., Provost and Executive Vice President for Academic Affairs
Mark D. West, B.A., J.D., Nippon Life Professor of Law, Dean
Bridge Carr, B.A., J.D., Clinical Professor of Law, Associate Dean for Strategic Initiatives
Daniel Halberstam, B.A., J.D., Eric Stein Collegiate Professor of Law, Associate Dean for Faculty and Research, Director of European Legal Studies Program
Debra Chopp, B.A., J.D., Clinical Professor of Law, Associate Dean for Experiential Education
David Santaacroce, B.A., J.D., LL.M., Clinical Professor of Law, Associate Dean for Experiential Education
Gil Seinfeld, A.B., J.D., Professor of Law, Associate Dean for Academic Programming
Michael Dunb, B.S., M.A., Assistant Dean for Development and Alumni Relations
Theresa Kaiser-Jarvis, B.A., B.S.J., Ed.M, J.D., Assistant Dean for International Affairs
Ramji Kaul, B.A., J.D., Assistant Dean for Career Planning
Bayrex Marti, B.A., J.D., Assistant Dean for Student Life
Lindsey Stetson, B.A., J.D., Assistant Dean for Financial Aid
Sarah C. Zearfoss, B.A., J.D., Senior Assistant Dean for Admissions, Financial Aid, and Career Planning

Professors Emeriti of Law

Layman E. Allen, A.B., M.P.A., LL.B.
David L. Chambers, A.B., LL.B., Wade H. McCree, Jr. Collegiate Professor of Law
Edward H. Cooper, A.B., LL.B., Thomas M. Cooley Professor of Law
Donald N. Duquette, B.A., J.D.
Philip M. Frost, B.A., J.D.
Clinical Professor of Law
Thomas A. Green, B.A., Ph.D., J.D., John Philip Davison Collegiate Professor of Law
Samuel R. Gross, A.B., J.D., Thomas G. and Mabel Long Professor of Law
Jerold H. Israel, B.B.A., LL.B., Alene and Allan F. Smith Professor of Law
Douglas A. Kahn, B.A., J.D., Paul G. Kauper Professor of Law
Yale Kamisar, A.B., LL.B., LL.D., Clarence Darrow Distinguished University Professor of Law
Thomas E. Kauper, A.B., J.D., Henry M. Butzel Professor of Law
Richard O. Lempert, A.B., J.D., Ph.D., Eric Stein Distinguished University Professor of Law and Sociology
Sallyanne Payton, B.A., J.L., William W. Cook Professor of Law
Margaret Jane Radin, A.B., M.F.A., J.D., LL.D., Henry King Ransom Professor of Law
Terrance Sandalow, A.B., J.D., Edson R. Sunderland Professor of Law
E. Philip Soper, B.A., M.A., J.D., Ph.D., James V. Campbell Professor of Law
Theodore J. St. Antoine, A.B., J.D., James E. and Sarah A. Degan Professor of Law
Joseph Vining, B.A., M.A., J.D., Harry Burns Hutchins Collegiate Professor of Law
Lawrence W. Waggoner, B.B.A., J.D., D.Phil., Lewis M. Simes Professor of Law
Peter K. Westen, B.A., J.D., Frank G. Millard Professor of Law
James Boyd White, A.B., A.M., LL.B., L. Hart Wright Collegiate Professor of Law
James A. White, B.A., J.D., Robert A. Sullivan Professor of Law

Professors of Law

Kate Andrias, B.A., J.D.
Reuven S. Avi-Yonah, B.A., A.M., Ph.D., J.D., Irwin I. Cohn Professor of Law
Samuel Bagenstos, B.A., J.D., Frank G. Millard Professor of Law
Nicholas Bagley, B.A., J.D.
Michael S. Barr, B.A., M.Phil., J.D., Roy F. and Jean Humphrey Proffitt Professor of Law
Laura N. Beny, B.A., M.A., J.D., Ph.D.
Evan H. Caninaker, B.A., J.D., Branch Rickey Collegiate Professor of Law
Sherman J. Clark, B.S., J.D., Kirkland and Ellis Professor of Law
Daniel Crane, B.A., J.D., Frederick Paul Furth, Sr. Professor of Law
Steven P. Crolley, A.B., M.A., Ph.D., Harry Burns Hutchins Collegiate Professor of Law
Kristina Daugirdas, A.B., J.D.
Rebecca S. Eisenberg, B.A., J.D., Robert and Barbara Luciano Professor of Law
Phoebe C. Ellsworth, A.B., Ph.D., Frank Murphy Distinguished Professor of Law and Psychology
Richard D. Friedman, B.A., J.D., D.Phil., Alene and Allan F. Smith Professor of Law
Bruce W. Frier, B.A., Ph.D., John and Teresa D'Arms Distinguished University Professor of Classics and Roman Law
Monica R. Hakimi, B.A., J.D.
Daniel Halberstam, B.A., J.D., Eric Stein Collegiate Professor of Law
James C. Hathaway, LL.B., LL.M., J.S.D., James E. and Sarah A. Degan Professor of Law
Scott Hershovitz, A.B., M.A., D.Phil., J.D.
Donald J. Herzog, A.B., A.M., Ph.D., Edson R. Sunderland Professor of Law
James Hines Jr., B.A., M.A., Ph.D., L. Hart Wright Collegiate Professor of Law
Nicholas C. Howson, B.A., J.D.
Ellen D. Katz, B.A., J.D., Ralph W. Aigler Professor of Law
Vikramaditya S. Khanna, B.C.A., LL.B., S.J.D., William W. Cook Professor of Law
Executive Articles Editor
Abigail E. DeHart, of Michigan

Articles Editors
Alison A. Doyle, of California
Caroline H. Howe, of Massachusetts
Salvatore M. Mancina, of Michigan
Jamil A. Oddeh, of Texas
Hailey L. Suggs, of Texas

Executive Editors
Arianna M. Demas, of New York
Patrick Kennedy, of Massachusetts
Patrick G. Maroun, of Massachusetts
Stephen M. Rees, of Illinois
Michael S. Smith, of Illinois
Jonathan I. Tietz, of Ohio

Executive Development Editor
Hanna T. All, of North Carolina

Executive Notes Editor
Michael R. Abrams, of Maryland

Notes Editors
Aviv S. Halpern, of California
Ryan M. Marosy, of New Jersey
Sarah A. Meziara, of Wisconsin
Jun Ha Park, of California
Carolina I. Velarde, of Panama

Book Review Editors
Eva Richardson, of Maryland
Neil K. Tiwari, of Alabama

Executive Online Editors
Joshua M. Goldman, of Massachusetts
Jorge E. Mancillas, of Arizona
Joseph D. Moses, of Michigan

Editorial Assistants
Jessica Pasquale

Editorial Assistant
Jessica Keebler

Managing Editor
Kristin L. Froehle, of Indiana

Editor-in-Chief
Megan L. Brown, of Georgia

Executive Production Editor
M Devon Moore, of New Jersey

Senior Editors
Max Lurin, of New York
Hunter McWinn, of Texas
Travis R. Miller, of Washington
Emily A. Minton Mattson, of Washington
Akash Patel, of Oklahoma
Nicholas L. Perry, of Massachusetts
Christopher R. Schwartz, of Michigan
Thomas J. Standifer, of California
Micah I. Telegen, of Massachusetts
Hinhi D. Tran, of California
Edna R. Turay, of Virginia
Annemarie C. Valdo, of Michigan

Associate Editors
Stacia Lee, of Washington
Matthew S. Liscovitz, of Maine
Nicholas J. Loftus, of Virginia
David N. Louison, of New York
Elena Malik, of Pennsylvania
Kaleb T. Martin, of Idaho
Adlan D. McCarthy, of California
Sarah M. McDonald, of Wyoming
Gillian McGann, of New York
Sean P. Mulloy, of Arizona
Tara F. Ogunde, of Pennsylvania
Mark C. Priewe, of Wisconsin
Christopher I. Pryby, of Georgia
Chelsea I. Ringel, of California
Alessandra N. Rossales, of Florida
Lauren Schusterman, of Colorado
Faraz Shahidpour, of Illinois
Claire A. Shimberg, of Florida
Adam B. Shinderman, of Texas
Jonathan B. Snavey, of Michigan
Angelica I. Theodoropoulos, of Illinois
Maggie M. Turner, of North Carolina
Curtis W. Victor, of Maryland
Adam J. Wallenstein, of Vermont
Hayato Watanabe, of Massachusetts
Tommy Zaino, of Ohio

Vol. 117, No. 8 June 2019
ANNOUNCEMENT OF THE VOLUME 118 EDITORIAL BOARD

Editor-in-Chief
Sarah M. McDonald, of Wyoming

Managing Editor
Gillian McGann, of New York

Executive Articles Editor
Bryce T. Freeman, of Florida

Articles Editors
Benjamin J. Bircoll, of Georgia
Donya Khadem, of Wisconsin
Elena Malik, of Pennsylvania
Faraz Shahidpour, of Illinois
Tommy Zaino, of Ohio

Executive Editors
Cade C. Boland, of Illinois
Haley Dutch, of Tennessee
Jonathan S. Edelman, of Florida
David Kim, of New Jersey
Chad F. Lee, of Nevada
Chelsea I. Rinning, of California

Executive Development Editor
Angela I. Theodoropoulos, of Illinois

Executive Notes Editor
Jackson M. Erpenbach, of South Dakota

Notes Editors
Carrie J. Darden, of Iowa
David L. Pegley, of Maryland
Sophia M. Gonzalez, of Florida
Claire A. Shimberg, of Florida
Maggie M. Turner, of North Carolina

Book Review Editors
Nina C. Cahill, of Michigan
Andrew Lanham, of Ohio

Executive Online Editors
Tezira A. Abe, of Texas
Monica L. Daegel, of California
David N. Louison, of New York

Senior Editors
Emily M. Arnold, of Pennsylvania
Patrick Balke, of Michigan
Andrew T. Bulovsky, of Wisconsin
Tyler P. Carroll, of Massachusetts
Gabriella M. D’Agostini, of Michigan
Lena Gankin, of California
Alexandra R. Genord, of Michigan
Jillian L. Gray, of Michigan
Aaron C. Jones, of Iowa
Joseph J. Kiessling, of Michigan
Stacia Lee, of Washington
Cianan M. Lesley, of Missouri
Matthew S. Liscovitz, of Maine
Nicholas J. Loftus, of Virginia
Kaleb T. Martin, of Idaho
Aidan D. McCarthy, of California
Sean P. Mulloy, of Arizona
Tara F. Ogunde, of Pennsylvania
Mark C. Priebel, of Wisconsin
Christopher I. Pryby, of Georgia
Alessandra N. Rosales, of Florida
Lauren Schusterman, of Colorado
Adam B. Shniderman, of Texas
Jonathan B. Snively, of Michigan
Curtis W. Victor, of Maryland
Adam J. Wallstein, of Vermont
Haiato Watanabe, of Massachusetts

Executive Production Editor
Sarah F. Du, of Washington
ANNOUNCEMENT OF AWARDS

AWARD FOR EXCEPTIONAL SERVICE
FOR 2018–2019

This award has been given to Jonathan I. Tietz, in recognition of his outstanding contributions to the Michigan Law Review.

AWARD FOR OUTSTANDING SCHOLARLY CONTRIBUTION
FOR 2018–2019

This award is given to the author of the best student publication of the Michigan Law Review. The award has been given to Lisa Limb, author of “Shoots Fired: Digging the Uniformed Services Employment and Reemployment Rights out of the Trenches of Arbitration,” published in Volume 117:4.

HOWARD B. COBLENTZ PRIZE

This award is given to Hailey L. Suggs for her journal-shaping contributions to the Michigan Law Review. This award was established in memory of Howard B. Coblentz, 1918, who enlisted while a student and lost his life during WWI.

AWARD FOR OUTSTANDING SERVICE AS AN ASSOCIATE EDITOR
FOR 2018–2019

This award has been given to Matthew S. Liscovitz, in recognition of his exceptional service to the Michigan Law Review as a first-year editor.