Michigan Law Review

VOLUME 99
2000-2001

The University of Michigan
Law School

Michigan Law Review
Ann Arbor, Michigan 48109-1215
Michigan Law Review

Vol. 99, No. 5

March 2001

CONTENTS

SYMPOSIUM
Miranda After Dickerson: The Future of Confession Law

The Michigan Law Review dedicates this issue to Professor Yale Kamisar, whose contributions to confession law have shaped Miranda jurisprudence for the past four decades. His insight and dedication inspire us all.

FOREWORD: FROM MIRANDA TO § 3501
to DICKERSON to . . . .......................... Yale Kamisar 879

PANEL ONE: ALTERNATIVES TO THE MIRANDA WARNINGS

THE PATHS NOT TAKEN: THE SUPREME COURT'S FAILURES IN DICKERSON ........................ Paul G. Cassell 898

MIRANDA, DICKERSON, AND THE PUZZLING PERSISTENCE OF FIFTH AMENDMENT EXCEPTIONALISM ...................... Stephen J. Schulhofer 941

PANEL TWO: THE SUPREME COURT'S POWER TO ISSUE PROPHYLACTIC RULES

MIRANDA, THE CONSTITUTION, AND CONGRESS ................................. David A. Strauss 958

PANEL THREE: MIRANDA'S (IR)RELEVANCE

MIRANDA'S MISTAKE ................................. William J. Stuntz 975

QUESTIONING THE RELEVANCE OF MIRANDA IN THE TWENTY-FIRST CENTURY ...............Richard A. Leo 1000

Copyright © 2001 by The Michigan Law Review Association
Panel Four: The Fate of the Pre-Dickerson Exceptions to Miranda

Identifying and (Re)Formulating Prophylactic Rules, Safe Harbors, and Incidental Rights in Constitutional Criminal Procedure........ Susan R. Klein 1030

Separated at Birth but Siblings
Nonetheless: Miranda and the Due Process Notice Cases .......... George C. Thomas III 1081

Panel Five: Deterring Police from Deliberately Violating Miranda

In the Stationhouse After Dickerson.................. Charles D. Weisselberg 1121

Panel Six: Deceptive Police Interrogation Practices:
How Far is Too Far?

Deceptive Police Interrogation Practices:
How Far is Too Far? ..................... Laurie Magid 1168

Miranda’s Failure to Restrain Pernicious Interrogation Practices............... Welsh S. White 1211

Recent Books

Books Received.......................... 1248
UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN LAW SCHOOL

Winter 2001

Administrative Officers

LEE C. BOLLINGER, B.S., J.D., President of the University
NANCY E. CANTOR, B.A., PH.D., Provost and Executive Vice President for Academic Affairs

JEFFREY S. LEHMAN, A.B., J.D., M.P.P., Dean
CHRISTINA B. WHITMAN, A.B., M.A., J.D., Associate Dean for Academic Affairs
SUELLYN SCABINCE, B.A., J.D., Associate Dean for Clinical Affairs
VIRGINIA B. GORDAN, B.A., J.D., Assistant Dean for International Programs
ERICA A. MUNZEL, B.A., J.D., Assistant Dean and Director of Admissions
DAVID H. BAUM, B.A., J.D., Assistant Dean of Students
CHARLOTTE H. JOHNSON, B.A., J.D., Assistant Dean of Students
KATHERINE B. GOTTSCHALK, B.A., Assistant Dean for Financial Aid
SUSAN M. GUNDI, B.A., J.D., Assistant Dean for Development and Alumni Relations

GEORGE L. FOLLANSBEE, JR., A.B., J.D., Assistant Dean for Development and Alumni Relations

Professors Emeriti of Law

FRANCIS A. ALLEN, A.B., LL.B., J.D., LL.D.,
Edison R. Sunderland Professor of Law
OLIN L. BROWDER, A.B., LL.B., S.J.D.,
James V. Campbell Professor of Law
ALFRED F. CONARD, A.B., LL.B., LL.M.,
J.S.D., LL.D.,
Henry M. Butzel Professor of Law
LUKE K. COOPE R RIDER, B.S., J.D.
SAMUEL D. ESTEP, A.B., J.D.
ROBBIN W. FLEMING, B.A., LL.B., LL.D.
WHITMORE GAY, A.B., J.D., LL.D.
JEROLD H. ISRAEL, B.B.A., LL.B.
Akene and Allan F. Smith Professor of Law
JOHN H. JACKSON, B.A., J.D.
Hessel E. Yntema Professor of Law
CHARLES W. JOINER, A.B., J.D.
FRANK K. KENNE Y, A.B., LL.B., J.S.D.,
Thomas M. Cooley Professor of Law

MARVIN L. NIEHUIS, A.B., LL.B.
WILLIAM J. PIERCE, A.B., J.D.
BEVERLY J. POOLEY, B.A., LL.B., LL.M., S.J.D.
ROY F. PROFFITT, B.S., J.D., LL.M.
JOHN W. REED, A.B., LL.B., LL.M., J.D.
J.U.R. Sc.D.,
Thomas M. Cooley Professor of Law
TERRANCE SANDALOW, A.B., J.D.
Edison R. Sunderland Professor of Law
THEODORE J. ST. ANTOINE, A.B., J.D.
James E. and Sarah A. Degan Professor of Law
RUSSELL A. SMITH, A.B., J.D.
ERIC STEIN, J.U.D., J.D., De.H.C.,
Hessel E. Yntema Professor of Law
PETER O. STIEDEIN, A.B., M.A., Ph.D.

Professors of Law

LAYMAN E. ALLEN, A.B., M.P.A., LL.B.
REUVEN S. AVE-YONAH, B.A., A.M., Ph.D., J.D.
LEE C. BOLLINGER, B.S., J.D.
Evan H. CAMINER, B.A., J.D.
DAVID L. CHAMBERS, A.B., LL.B.
WADE H. McCREE, JR. Collegiate Professor of Law
SHERMAN J. CLARK, B.S., J.D.
EDWARD H. COOPER,* A.B., LL.B.
Thomas M. Cooley Professor of Law
STEVEN P. CROELEY,* A.B., J.D., M.A.
REBECCA S. EISENBERG, B.A., J.D.
Robert and Barbara Luciano Professor of Law
PHOEBE C. ELLSWORTH,* A.B., Ph.D.
Kirkland and Ellis Professorship in Law
MERRITT B. FOX, B.A., J.D., Ph.D.
Akene and Allan F. Smith Professor of Law
RICHARD D. FRIEDMAN,* B.A., J.D., D.Phil.,
Ralph W. Aigler Collegiate Professor of Law
BRUCE W. FRIER, B.A., Ph.D.,
Henry King Ransom Professor of Law
THOMAS A. GREEN, B.A., Ph.D., J.D.,
John Philip Dawson Collegiate Professor of Law
SAMUEL R. GROSS,* A.B., J.D.
Thomas G. and Mabel Long Professor of Law

JAMES C. HATHWAY, A.B., LL.B., J.D., LL.M., J.S.D.
MICHAEL A. HELLER,* A.B., J.D.
DONALD J. HERZOG,* A.B., A.M., Ph.D.,
Edison R. Sunderland Professor of Law
RODERICK M. HILLS,* JR., B.A., J.D.
ROBERT L. HOWE, B.A., LL.B., LL.M.
DOUGLAS A. KAHN, B.A., J.D.
PAUL G. KAUPER Professor of Law
YALE KAMISAR,* A.B., LL.B., LL.D.,
Clarence Darrow Distinguished University Professor of Law
THOMAS E. KAUPER, A.B., J.D.
HENRY M. BUTZEL Professor of Law
JAMES E. KRIER, B.S., J.D.
EARL WARREN DELANO Professor of Law
JEFFREY S. LEHMAN, A.B., J.D., M.P.P.
RICHARD O. LEMPEK, A.B., J.D., Ph.D.
FRANCIS A. ALLEN Collegiate Professor of Law
KYLE D. LOGUE, B.A., J.D.
CATHARINE A. MACKINNON,* B.A., J.D.,
Ph.D.
ELIZABETH A. LONG Professor of Law
DEBORAH C. MALAMUD, B.A., J.D.
RONALD J. MANN, B.A., J.D.
ROY F. and Jean Humphrey Proffitt Research Professor of Law
WILLIAM I. MILLER, B.A., Ph.D., J.D.
Thomas G. Long Professor of Law
SALLYANNE PAYTON, A.B., LL.B.
DONALD H. REGAN, A.B., LL.B., B.PHIL.,
Ph.D.,
William W. Bishop, Jr. Collegiate
Professor of Law

MATHIAS W. REIMANN, Dr. Iur., L.L.M.,
Heessel E. Nyenma Professor of Law

CARL E. SCHNEIDER, A.B., J.D.,
Chaucery Stillman professorship for Ethics,
Morality, and the Practice of Law

A.W. BRIAN SIMPSON, B.A., M.A., D.L.,
Charles F. and Edith I. Cline Professor of
Law

PHILIP SOFER, B.A., M.A., J.D., Ph.D.,
James V. Campbell Professor of Law

JOSEPH VINGING, B.A., M.A., J.D.,
Harry Burns Hutchins Collegiate Professor of
Law

LAWRENCE W. WAGGNER, B.A., J.D.,
D.PHIL.,
Lewis M. Simms Professor of Law

PETER K. WESTEN, B.A., J.D.,
Frank G. Millard Professor of Law

JAMES BOYD WHITE, A.B., A.M., LL.B.,
L. Hart Wright Collegiate Professor of Law

ROBERT A. SULLIVAN, Professor of Law

CHRISTINA B. WHITMAN, A.B., M.A., J.D.

Assistant Professors of Law

OMRI BEN-SHAHAR, B.A., LL.B., L.L.M.,
Ph.D.

SUSANNA L. BLUMENTHAL, A.B., M.A., J.D.,
M.PHIL.

DANIEL HALBERSTAM, B.A., J.D.

PETER J. HAMMER, B.S., B.A., J.D., Ph.D.

ELLEN D. KATZ, B.A., J.D.

NINA A. MENDelson, B.A., J.D.

ADAM C. PRITCHARD, B.A., M.P.P., J.D.

MARK D. WEST, B.A., J.D.

Clinical Professors of Law

DONALD N. DUCETTE, B.A., J.D.

ROCHELLE E. LENTO, B.A., J.D.

PAUL D. REINGOLD, B.A., J.D.

NICHOLAS J. RINE, B.A., J.D.

SUELYN SCARNECCHIA, B.A., J.D.

Clinical Assistant Professors of Law

EDWARD R. BECKER, B.A., J.D.

MELISSA BREGER, B.S., J.D.

MARGARET CHERN, B.A., J.D.

KATHERINE D. CHEST, B.A., J.D.

JULIE P. CLOSE, B.A., J.D.

WILLIAM L. COOPER, A.B., J.D., A.M.L.S.

PHILIP M. FROST, B.A., J.D.

Teresa N. Guyer, B.S., J.D.

BRIDGET M. McCORMACK, B.A., J.D.

ANNE N. SCHROTH, B.A., J.D.

THOMAS H. SEYMOUR, B.A., M.A., J.D.

GRACE C. TONNER, B.A., J.D.

MATTHEW WEBER, B.A., J.D., M.P.A.

Visiting Professors of Law

ELIZABETH S. ANDERSON, A.M., Ph.D.

KARIMA BENNOUINE, B.A., M.A., J.D.

CHRISTINE CUNKIN, LL.B., LLM., LLM., Ph.D.

SHELTON H. DANZIGER, B.A., Ph.D.

GRANDIE DE BURCA

TOMOTORA FUJITA, B.A.

KARThy GUYEndER, LL.B., LLM.

HAROLD K. JACOBSON, B.A., M.A., Ph.D.

GARETH H. JONES, LL.B., M.A., LL.B., LLM.,
LL.D.

DANA M. MUIR, A.B., M.B.A., J.D.

MINORU NAKAZATO, LL.B.

REBECCA J. SCOTT, A.B., M.PHIL., Ph.D.

BRUNO E. SDepSMA, DOCTORATE OF LAW

MICHEL WaeLEBROCK, DOCTORATE OF LAW, LL.M.

Visiting Assistant Professors of Law

ALYSON M. COLE, B.A., M.A., Ph.D.

JOAN L. LARSEN, B.A., J.D.

Adjunct Professors of Law

ELIZABETH BARRY, B.A., J.D.

JOHN E. BOSS, B.A., J.D.

LAURENCE D. CONNOR, A.B., J.D.

PATRICIA CURTNER, B.A., J.D.

TIMOTHY DICKINSON, A.B., J.D., LL.M.

JAMES FORMAN, B.A., J.D.

ALISON HIRSCHEL, B.A., J.D.

MARVIN KRISLOV, M.A., J.D.

ROBERTA J. MORRIS, A.B., J.D.

CYRIL MOSKOV, B.S., J.D.

STEVEN W. RHOADES, B.S., J.D.

MARK D. ROSENBAUM, B.A., J.D.

EDWARD STEIN, B.A., J.D.

Adjunct Clinical Professors of Law

CHARI GROVE, B.A., J.D.

KATHLEEN Q. HEGARTY, B.A., J.D.

NEIL S. KAGAN, B.S., M.S., J.D.

VALERIE R. NEWMAN, B.A., J.D.

DAVID A. SANTACROCE, B.A., J.D., LL.M.

J. TAYLOR TEASDALE, B.A., J.D., LL.M.

FRANK E. VANDERVORT, B.A., J.D.

Affiliated Professor

Riyaz Kanji, A.B., J.D.

Adjunct Instructor

MARGARET A. LEARY, B.A., M.A., J.D.

* On Leave