

# University of Michigan Journal of Law Reform

---

Volume 32

---

1999

## Front Matter

Journal of Law Reform

Follow this and additional works at: <https://repository.law.umich.edu/mjlr>

---

### Recommended Citation

Journal of Law Reform, *Front Matter*, 32 U. MICH. J. L. REFORM i (1999).

Available at: <https://repository.law.umich.edu/mjlr/vol32/iss4/1>

This Front Matter is brought to you for free and open access by the University of Michigan Journal of Law Reform at University of Michigan Law School Scholarship Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in University of Michigan Journal of Law Reform by an authorized editor of University of Michigan Law School Scholarship Repository. For more information, please contact [mLaw.repository@umich.edu](mailto:mLaw.repository@umich.edu).



UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN

*JOURNAL OF  
LAW REFORM*

**VOLUME 32  
ISSUE 4  
SUMMER 1999**

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN  
LAW SCHOOL  
ANN ARBOR, MICHIGAN

27 2134S 1661  
06/00 XL  
02-013-06 GBC



Cite as: 32 U. MICH. J.L. REFORM \_\_ (1999).

Copyright © 1999 by the *University of Michigan Journal of Law Reform*. All rights reserved. Except where otherwise expressly indicated, copies of scholarship printed in the *University of Michigan Journal of Law Reform* may be made for course use in any public or private institution of learning provided that (1) copies are distributed at or below cost, (2) the author and the *University of Michigan Journal of Law Reform* are identified on the copies, and (3) proper notice of copyright is affixed to each copy.

The *University of Michigan Journal of Law Reform* is published quarterly by students of the University of Michigan Law School. Fourth-class postage paid at Ann Arbor, Michigan 48109. Printed by Joe Christensen, Inc., Lincoln, Nebraska 68521.

*University of Michigan Journal of Law Reform*  
University of Michigan Law School  
625 S. State Street  
Ann Arbor, MI 48109-1215  
Telephone: (734) 763-6100

#### PUBLICATION POLICY

The *Journal* seeks to improve the law and its administration by providing a forum for discussion that identifies contemporary issues for reform efforts, proposes concrete means to accomplish change, and evaluates the impact of law reform. As contributions to this discussion, the *Journal* also welcomes multidisciplinary and empirical work.

We encourage the submission of unsolicited manuscripts for publication. Each manuscript should be typed, double-spaced and sent to the Managing Article Editor at the above address. Articles should generally conform to *A Uniform System of Citation* (16th ed. 1996) and *The Chicago Manual of Style* (14th ed. 1993). We regret that we cannot return submitted articles unless they are accompanied by a self-addressed postage-paid envelope.

Views expressed in the *Journal* are those of the authors and not necessarily those of the editorial staff.

#### SUBSCRIPTIONS

The current subscription rate is \$35.00 domestic and \$40.00 foreign. All subscription inquiries should be made, by mail or phone as stated above, to the Business Manager. Subscribers should report the nonreceipt of copies within six months of the mailing date.

#### INDIVIDUAL AND BACK ISSUES

Copies of individual issues from the current volume can be obtained directly from the *Journal* for \$15.00 each.

Back issues in complete sets, volumes, or single issues can be obtained from William S. Hein & Co., Inc., 1285 Main Street, Buffalo, New York 14209 — Telephone (716) 882-2600. The *Journal* is also available on microfilm through University Microfilms International, 300 North Zeeb Road, Ann Arbor, Michigan 48106 — Telephone (734) 761-4700.

#### INDEXES

The *Journal* is indexed in the Current Law Index, Index to Legal Periodicals, Legal Resource Index, and PAIS Bulletin.

ISSN 0033-1546



UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN  
*JOURNAL OF*  
*LAW REFORM*

Announcement of 1999  
Editorial Board

VOLUME 33

*Editor in Chief*

SHANNON L. KIMBALL

*Managing Editor*

NIAMH M. McEVOY

*Executive Editors*

AMY E. LEHMAN  
ALISON B. MACDONALD  
KARYN A. THWAITES  
LAURA E. ZACHMAN

*Symposium Editor*

JULIA E. BLANKERTZ

*Managing Article Editor*

MARGO M. SCHNEIDMAN

*Article Editors*

ALEX L. FUGAZZI  
EILEEN M. KIERNAN  
PATRICIA M. PETROWSKI

*Contributing Editors*

THOMAS H. KLEIN  
BRYANT T. LAMER  
PHILLIP H. LEE  
MICHELLE I. LUNG  
AMAN L. McLEOD  
AMY M. MORTON  
NICOLE S. PAKKALA

*Associate Editors*

GJI M. JOHN  
ERIN P. KAPPLER  
JOEL P. KARANSKY  
DANIEL J. KELLY  
MELISSA A. KERN  
JASON T. KUZMA  
WARREN METLITZKY  
REBECCA MIN  
JENNIFER K. NOWACZOK  
HUN OHM  
TYLER R. F. PAGE  
PURVEE K. PAREKH  
J. ANDREW PARKER  
SEAN T. PEPPARD

*Executive Note Editor*

AMY REMUS SCOTT

*Note Editors*

SARA W. CLASH  
KEVIN M. HENRY  
MATTHEW B. MOCK  
MICHAEL S. PONDER

KENNETH J. PIPPIN

ANI B. SATZ  
MARK A. SMITH  
DANIEL B. STOLARSKY  
JASON J. STOVER  
JEAN L. TAYLOR  
GENA E. WILTSEK

KATHERINE Y. BARNES  
MICHAEL K. BLISSENBACH  
JUSTIN S. BRENNAN  
JASON H. CASELL  
BEATRICE S. CHANDLER  
KRISTIN V. COLLINS  
SHAWN M. DRAPER  
GREGORY P. FELDKAMP  
RYAN J. FITTS  
JODY B. GREENBERG  
FRANCESCA A. HOGI  
BRIAN L. HOWARD  
CHARU L. JAIN

*Business Manager*

MAUREEN A. BISHOP

*Editorial Assistants*

CATHERINE T. LEGGIERI  
MATTHEW S. REDDING

*Administrative Assistants*

DELLAREESE WEATHERSPOON  
JOHN P. ATKINSON

# UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN LAW SCHOOL

## *Administrative Officers*

LEE C. BOLLINGER, B.S., J.D., *President of the University*  
NANCY E. CANTOR, B.A., PH.D., *Provost and Executive Vice President for Academic Affairs*  
JEFFREY S. LEHMAN, A.B., J.D., M.P.P., *Dean*  
CHRISTINA B. WHITMAN, A.B., M.A., J.D., *Associate Dean for Academic Affairs*  
SUELLYN SCARNECCHIA, B.A., J.D., *Associate Dean for Clinical Affairs*  
VIRGINIA B. GORDAN, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Dean for International Programs*  
ERICA A. MUNZEL, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Dean for Admissions*  
KATHY A. OKUN, M.A., PH.D., *Assistant Dean for Development and Alumni Relations*

## *Professors Emeriti of Law*

FRANCIS A. ALLEN, A.B., LL.B., J.D., LL.D.,  
*Edson R. Sunderland Professor of Law*  
OLIN L. BROWDER, A.B., LL.B., S.J.D.,  
*James V. Campbell Professor of Law*  
ALFRED F. CONARD, A.B., LL.B., LL.M.,  
J.S.D., LL.D., *Henry M. Butzel Professor of Law*  
LUKE K. COOPERRIDER, B.S., J.D.  
SAMUEL D. ESTEP, A.B., J.D.  
ROBBEN W. FLEMING, B.A., LL.B., LL.D.  
WHITMORE GRAY, A.B., J.D., LL.D.  
JEROLD H. ISRAEL, B.B.A., LL.B.,  
*Alene and Allan F. Smith Professor of Law*  
JOHN H. JACKSON, B.A., J.D.,  
*Hessel E. Yntema Professor of Law*

CHARLES W. JOINER, A.B., J.D.  
FRANK R. KENNEDY, A.B., LL.B., J.S.D.,  
*Thomas M. Cooley Professor of Law*  
MARVIN L. NIEHUSS, A.B., LL.B.  
WILLIAM J. PIERCE, A.B., J.D.  
BEVERLEY J. POOLEY, B.A., LL.B., LL.M., S.J.D.  
ROY F. PROFFITT, B.S., J.D., LL.M.  
JOHN W. REED, A.B., LL.B., LL.M., JUR.Sc.D.,  
*Thomas M. Cooley Professor of Law*  
THEODORE J. ST. ANTOINE, A.B., J.D.,  
*James E. and Sarah A. Degan Professor of Law*  
RUSSELL A. SMITH, A.B., J.D.  
ERIC STEIN, J.U.D., J.D., DR.H.C.,  
*Hessel E. Yntema Professor of Law*  
PETER O. STEINER, A.B., M.A., PH.D.

## *Professors of Law*

LAYMAN E. ALLEN, A.B., M.P.A., LL.B.  
JOSE E. ALVAREZ, A.B., B.A., M.A., J.D.  
LEE C. BOLLINGER, B.S., J.D.  
DAVID L. CHAMBERS, A.B., LL.B.,  
*Wade H. McCree Professor of Law*  
EDWARD H. COOPER, A.B., LL.B.,  
*Thomas M. Cooley Professor of Law*  
STEVEN P. CROLEY, A.B., J.D., M.A.  
DONALD N. DUQUETTE, †† B.A., J.D.  
REBECCA S. EISENBERG, B.A., J.D.  
PHOEBE C. ELLSWORTH, A.B., PH.D.,  
*Kirkland & Ellis Professor of Law*  
MERRITT B. FOX, B.A., J.D., PH.D.  
RICHARD D. FRIEDMAN, B.A., J.D., D.PHIL.  
BRUCE W. FRIER, B.A., PH.D.,  
*Henry King Ransom Professor of Law*  
THOMAS A. GREEN, B.A., PH.D., J.D.,  
*John Philip Dawson Professor of Law*  
SAMUEL R. GROSS, A.B., J.D.,  
*Thomas G. and Mabel Long Professor of Law*  
JAMES C. HATHAWAY, LL.B., LL.M., J.S.D.  
DONALD J. HERZOG, A.B., A.M., PH.D.  
GARETH H. JONES,\* LL.B., M.A.  
DOUGLAS A. KAHN, B.A., J.D.,  
*Paul G. Kauper Professor of Law*  
YALE KAMISAR, A.B., LL.B., LL.D.,  
*Clarence Darrow Distinguished  
University Professor of Law*  
THOMAS E. KAUPER, A.B., J.D.,  
*Henry M. Butzel Professor of Law*

JAMES E. KRIER, B.S., J.D.,  
*Earl Warren DeLano Professor of Law*  
JEFFREY S. LEHMAN, A.B., J.D., M.P.P.  
RICHARD O. LEMPERT, A.B., J.D., PH.D.,  
*Francis A. Allen Professor of Law*  
KYLE D. LOGUE, B.A., J.D.  
CATHARINE A. MACKINNON, B.A., J.D., PH.D.,  
*Elizabeth A. Long Professor of Law*  
DEBORAH C. MALAMUD, B.A., J.D.  
WILLIAM I. MILLER, B.A., PH.D., J.D.,  
*Thomas G. Long Professor of Law*  
SALLYANNE PAYTON, A.B., LL.B.  
RICHARD H. PILDES, A.B., J.D.,  
*Roy F. and Jean Humphrey Proffitt  
Research Professor of Law*  
DONALD H. REGAN, A.B., LL.B., B.PHIL., PH.D.,  
*William W. Bishop, Jr. Professor of Law*  
MATHIAS W. REIMANN, DR. IUR., LL.M.  
PAUL D. REINGOLD, †† B.A., J.D.  
TERRANCE SANDALOW, A.B., J.D.,  
*Edson R. Sunderland Professor of Law*  
SUELLYN SCARNECCHIA, †† B.A., J.D.  
JANE S. SCHAFTER, A.B., J.D.  
CARL E. SCHNEIDER, A.B., J.D.  
A.W. BRIAN SIMPSON, B.A., M.A., D.C.L.,  
*Charles F. and Edith J. Clyne Professor of Law*  
PHILIP SOPER, B.A., M.A., J.D., PH.D.,  
*James V. Campbell Professor of Law*  
JOSEPH VINING, B.A., M.A., J.D.,  
*Harry Burns Hutchins Professor of Law*

LAWRENCE W. WAGGONER, B.B.A., J.D.,  
D.PHIL., *Lewis M. Simes Professor of Law*  
PETER K. WESTEN, B.A., J.D.,  
*Frank G. Millard Professor of Law*

JAMES BOYD WHITE, A.B., A.M., LL.B.,  
*L. Hart Wright Professor of Law*  
JAMES J. WHITE, B.A., J.D.,  
*Robert A. Sullivan Professor of Law*  
CHRISTINA B. WHITMAN, A.B., M.A., J.D.

*Assistant Professors of Law*

P.E. BENNETT, †† B.S., M.A., J.D.  
MELISSA L. BREGER, †† B.S., J.D.  
JULIET M. BRODIE, †† A.B., J.D.  
HOWARD J. BROMBERG, †† B.A., J.D., J.S.M.  
LORRAY S.C. BROWN, †† B.A., J.D.  
SHERMAN J. CLARK, B.S., J.D.  
PHILIP M. FROST, † B.A., J.D.  
PETER J. HAMMER, B.S., B.A., J.D., PH.D.  
MICHAEL A. HELLER, A.B., J.D.  
RODERICK M. HILLS, JR., B.A., J.D.  
KIMBERLY A. JAMES, †† A.B., J.D.  
ROCHELLE E. LENTO, †† B.A., J.D.

ANDREA D. LYON, †† B.A., J.D.  
RONALD J. MANN, B.A., J.D.  
BRIDGET M. MCCORMACK, †† B.A., J.D.  
ADAM C. PRITCHARD, B.A., M.P.P., J.D.  
NICHOLAS J. RINE, †† B.A., J.D.  
ANNE N. SCHROTH, †† B.A., J.D.  
THOMAS H. SEYMOUR, †† B.A., M.A., J.D.  
RONALD E. STEINBERG, †† B.A., J.D.  
JOHN T. TEASDALE, † B.A., J.D., LL.M.  
GRACE C. TONNER, †† B.A., J.D.  
MARK D. WEST, B.A., J.D.  
MELISSA K. WORDEN, †† B.A., J.D.

\**Visiting*

†*Adjunct*  
††*Clinical*



# UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN JOURNAL OF LAW REFORM

VOLUME 32

*Editor in Chief*  
F. PATRICK HALLAGAN

*Managing Editor*  
SALLY K. SEARS

*Executive Editors*  
REBECCA M. BRANDMAN  
LISA M. DRESNER  
ELSIE MATA  
DANIELLE C. SVESKA

*Symposium Editor*  
BRIAN T. DONADIO

ALI A. AKHTAR  
GARLAND W. ALLISON  
MICHAEL S. BAIG  
JASON K. BOWLER  
MATTHEW W. CARLIN  
DAVID B. CHARNIN  
ARADHANA DAS  
MATTHEW R. ELKIN

MARILYNN E. ARMOUR  
JULIA E. BLANKERTZ  
LIZABETH A. BOYER  
NICHOLAS A. BUDOR  
SARA W. CLASH  
JOSEPH F. FIELDER  
MARC J. FINKELSTEIN  
ALEX L. FUGAZZI  
SARAH E. GERAGHTY  
BRIAN M. GINGOLD  
DANIEL E. HAROLD  
ROBERT M. HARTLEY  
KEVIN M. HENRY

*Business Manager*  
MAUREEN A. BISHOP

*Managing Article Editor*  
MATTHEW T. FINDLEY

*Article Editors*  
JOHN A. CHILSON  
CATHERINE M. DUNN  
DANIEL E. MORRISON

*Contributing Editors*  
KIMBERLY A. EMERSON  
OLIVIER N. FARACHE  
JESSE GOLDSTEIN  
DAVID G. HUFFMAN-GOTTSCHLING  
GEORGE E. GURROLA  
SHARI L. KESSLER  
DAVID C. KIRK  
TODD B. KLESSMAN  
KIMBERLY KOONTZ

*Associate Editors*  
EILEEN M. KIERNAN  
SHANNON L. KIMBALL  
DENISE A. KIRKOWSKI  
THOMAS H. KLEIN  
BRYANT T. LAMER  
PHILLIP H. LEE  
AMY E. LEHMAN  
MICHELLE I. LUNG  
ALISON B. MACDONALD  
NIAMH M. McEVoy  
AMAN L. McLEOD  
MATTHEW B. MOCK

*Editorial Assistants*  
CATHERINE T. LEGGIERI  
MATTHEW S. REDDING

*Executive Note Editor*  
KENDRA D. CHEVES

*Note Editors*  
LACEY S. CALHOUN  
JASON H. EHRENBERG  
JENNETTA D. GROCHOWSKI  
TIMOTHY S. LEIMAN  
TODD W. ROESER  
DAVID E. SMITH  
JOSHUA S. SPECTOR

JERRY S. KOWAL  
LISA M. KRAMARENKO  
MATTHEW J. PERRY  
MARC L. ROBINSON  
ANI B. SATZ  
JAKE SCHMIDT  
STEVEN K. TAYLOR  
J. RANDAL WEXLER

NICOLE S. PAKKALA  
PATRICIA M. PETROWSKI  
KENNETH J. PIPPIN  
MICHAEL S. PONDER  
AMY REMUS SCOTT  
MARGO M. SCHNEIDMAN  
MARK A. SMITH  
DANIEL B. STOLARSKY  
JASON J. STOVER  
JEAN L. TAYLOR  
KARYN A. THWAITES  
GENA E. WILTSEK  
LAURA E. ZACHMAN

*Administrative Assistant*  
DELLAREESE WEATHERSPOON

## ANNOUNCEMENT OF AWARDS

### SARAH HONIGMAN MEMORIAL AWARD

This award has been given to Shannon L. Kimball, Editor in Chief of Volume 33 of the *University of Michigan Journal of Law Reform*, in recognition of her superior scholastic record, effective leadership, and outstanding contribution to the *Journal*.

### LOUIS HONIGMAN MEMORIAL AWARD

This award has been given to John A. Chilson and Kendra D. Cheves for significant contributions to the *University of Michigan Journal of Law Reform* during their junior and senior years.

### RAYMOND K. DYKEMA SCHOLARSHIP AWARD

This award has been given to Amy Remus Scott and Eileen M. Kiernan for significant contributions to the *University of Michigan Journal of Law Reform* during their junior year and in recognition of qualifications that indicate the likelihood of future contributions to the legal profession.

### E. BLYTHE STASON AWARD

This award has been given to Joshua S. Spector, author of the best student contribution to Volume 31:4 of the *University of Michigan Journal of Law Reform*.

### SCRIBES AWARD

An honorary membership in Scribes, the Society of Writers on Legal Subjects, has been given to Jason H. Ehrenberg for an outstanding published contribution to Volume 32:1 of the *University of Michigan Journal of Law Reform*.



UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN

VOLUME 32  
ISSUE 4  
SUMMER 1999

JOURNAL OF  
LAW REFORM

CONTENTS

MANAGED CARE  
WHAT'S THE PROGNOSIS: MANAGING CARE  
IN THE NEXT CENTURY  
SYMPOSIUM

INTRODUCTION

Managed Care—The First Chapter Comes to a Close  
*Sallyanne Payton* . . . . . 573

ARTICLES

Ethical Issues in Managed Care: Can the  
Traditional Physician-Patient Relationship  
Be Preserved in the Era of Managed Care  
or Should It Be Replaced by a Group Ethic?  
*Eugene C. Grochowski* . . . . . 619

How Not to Think About "Managed Care"  
*Jacob S. Hacker*  
*Theodore R. Marmor* . . . . . 661

The Competitive Impact of Small Group  
Health Insurance Reform Laws  
*Mark A. Hall* . . . . . 685

Questioning Traditional Antitrust  
Presumptions: Price and Non-Price  
Competition in Hospital Markets  
*Peter J. Hammer* . . . . . 727

Accountable Managed Care: Should We Be Careful What We Wish For? <i>David A. Hyman</i> . . . . .	785
Establishing New Legal Doctrine in Managed Care: A Model of Judicial Response to Industrial Change <i>Peter D. Jacobson</i> <i>Scott D. Pomfret</i> . . . . .	813
Managed Care Regulation: Can We Learn from Others? The Chilean Experience <i>Timothy Stoltzfus Jost</i> . . . . .	863
Clearing the Way for an Effective Federal-State Partnership in Health Reform <i>Eleanor D. Kinney</i> . . . . .	899
Playing Doctor: Corporate Medical Practice and Medical Malpractice <i>E. Haavi Morreim</i> . . . . .	939
Exit and Voice in American Health Care <i>Marc A. Rodwin</i> . . . . .	1041
Competing on Quality of Care: The Need to Develop a Competition Policy for Health Care Markets <i>William M. Sage</i> <i>Peter J. Hammer</i> . . . . .	1069
NOTE	
Moving Toward a Clearer Definition of Insider Trading: Why Adoption of the Possession Standard Protects Investors <i>Lacey S. Calhoun</i> . . . . .	1119