

Michigan Journal of International Law

Volume 19 | Issue 3

1998

Jurisprudence of the Committee on the Rights of the Child: A Guide for Research and Analysis

Cynthia Price Cohen
ChildRights International Research Institute

Susan Kilbourne
ChildRights International Research Institute

Follow this and additional works at: <https://repository.law.umich.edu/mjil>



Part of the [International Humanitarian Law Commons](#), [International Law Commons](#), [Juvenile Law Commons](#), and the [Legal History Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Cynthia P. Cohen & Susan Kilbourne, *Jurisprudence of the Committee on the Rights of the Child: A Guide for Research and Analysis*, 19 MICH. J. INT'L L. 633 (1998).

Available at: <https://repository.law.umich.edu/mjil/vol19/iss3/1>

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Michigan Journal of International Law at University of Michigan Law School Scholarship Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in Michigan Journal of International Law by an authorized editor of University of Michigan Law School Scholarship Repository. For more information, please contact mLaw.repository@umich.edu.

JURISPRUDENCE OF THE COMMITTEE ON THE RIGHTS OF THE CHILD: A GUIDE FOR RESEARCH AND ANALYSIS†

Cynthia Price Cohen and Susan Kilbourne***

I.	INTRODUCTION	633
II.	CONVENTION ON THE RIGHTS OF THE CHILD: BACKGROUND AND CONTENT	635
III.	CHILDRIGHTS JURISPRUDENCE PROJECT	642
	A. <i>Methodology</i>	644
	B. <i>General Trends in Committee Jurisprudence</i>	646
	C. <i>Factors Influencing Committee Jurisprudence</i>	649
IV.	RESEARCH AND THE DEVELOPING CHILD RIGHTS JURISPRUDENCE	651
	APPENDIX	654

I. INTRODUCTION

The year 1998 is the focal point for numerous events celebrating the fiftieth anniversary of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights (“Universal Declaration”)¹—the United Nations’ first effort at human rights codification.² Since the Universal Declaration was adopted on December 10, 1948, the United Nations has drafted and adopted a series

† © 1998 Cynthia Price Cohen and Susan Kilbourne.

* Executive Director, ChildRights International Research Institute. J.S.D., Law Studies Institute of the Polish Academy of Sciences (Warsaw, 1994); J.D., New York Law School (1979); M.A., City University of New York Graduate Center; B.A., The City College of New York (1986).

** Director of Research, ChildRights International Research Institute; J.D., Georgetown University Law Center (Candidate); M.P.S., The Graduate School of Political Management at George Washington University (1995); B.S., University of Massachusetts (1988).

1. See *Universal Declaration of Human Rights*, G.A. Res. 217, U.N. GAOR, 3d Sess., U.N. Doc. A/810 (1948) [hereinafter *Universal Declaration*].

For information on the celebratory events in the United States, see Franklin and Eleanor Roosevelt Foundation (visited Apr. 19, 1998) <<http://www.udhr50.org>>.

2. The impetus to define human rights came from the United Nations Charter. The second paragraph of the preamble states as one of the purposes of the United Nations: “to reaffirm faith in fundamental human rights, in the dignity and worth of the human person, in the equal rights of men and women and of nations large and small” U.N. CHARTER preamble.

of treaties designed to make the Universal Declaration's principles legally binding.³ Originally conceived as a broad and sweeping instrument, the Universal Declaration sets standards for securing a minimum quality of life for all human beings. However, with one exception, each of the subsequent treaties has taken a piecemeal approach to rights implementation. Most notably, the two primary human rights covenants, the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights and the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Right, split the rights enumerated in the Universal Declaration into two distinct categories: "civil and political rights," and "economic, social and cultural rights."⁴ Other treaties have focused on specific types of rights, such as protection against torture or discrimination.⁵ Only the Convention on the Rights of the Child ("the Convention")⁶ has followed the Universal Declaration's comprehensive model by establishing a full panoply of rights for children which includes civil-political rights, economic-social-cultural rights, and humanitarian rights.⁷ Highlighting the ground-breaking significance of the Convention is particularly appropriate during the Universal Declaration's Fiftieth Anniversary Year.

The history of the Convention on the Rights of the Child is unique among human rights treaties. On the day of its formal signing ceremony in January 1990, the Convention broke the United Nations record for numbers of signatories.⁸ The Convention came into force approximately six months later—more quickly than any previous human rights treaty.⁹

3. See, e.g., International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, Dec. 16, 1966, 993 U.N.T.S. 3; International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, Dec. 16, 1966, 999 U.N.T.S. 171; International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, *opened for signature* Mar. 7, 1966, 660 U.N.T.S. 195; Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination Against Women, Dec. 18, 1979, 1249 U.N.T.S. 13; Convention Against Torture and Other Degrading Treatment or Punishment, Dec. 10, 1984, 1465 U.N.T.S. 85; *Convention on the Rights of the Child*, G.A. Res. 44/25, U.N. GAOR, 44th Sess., U.N. Doc. A/RES/44/25 (1989) [hereinafter *Convention*].

4. See International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, *supra* note 3; International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, Dec. 16, 1966, 993 U.N.T.S. 3.

5. See International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, *supra* note 3; Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women, *supra* note 3; Convention Against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, *supra* note 3.

6. See *Convention*, *supra* note 3.

7. For a discussion of the various types of rights in the Convention, see EUGEN VERHELLEN, *CONVENTION ON THE RIGHTS OF THE CHILD 57-74* (1994).

8. See Cynthia Price Cohen & Per Miljeteig-Olssen, *Status Report: United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child*, 8 N.Y.L. SCH. J. HUM. RTS. 367, 368 (1991). See also *United Nations: 58 Countries Sign Convention on Children's Rights*, Inter Press Serv., Jan. 26, 1990, available in LEXIS, Nexis Library, Inter Press File.

9. The Convention went into force on September 2, 1990 and achieved the requisite number of ratifications one month earlier. See *Convention*, *supra* note 3, at art. 49.

The Convention has been ratified by and is in force for every country in the world, with two exceptions: the United States and Somalia.¹⁰ The speed with which countries are implementing the Convention presents a particular challenge to those who must interpret the Convention and apply its standards to the real-life situations of the children whose condition the Convention was intended to improve.

The purpose of this article and the attached tables is to give child rights advocates and scholars: 1) a bird's-eye view of the Convention and its implementation mechanism; 2) an introduction to the jurisprudence that is being developed as governments begin to put the Convention into effect; and 3) a guide to assist in research and analysis of the developing jurisprudence of the Committee on the Rights of the Child.

II. CONVENTION ON THE RIGHTS OF THE CHILD: BACKGROUND AND CONTENT

The rights of the child became a topic of concern for international organizations in 1924 when the League of Nations adopted the first declaration of the rights of the child, "commonly known as the 'Declaration of Geneva' . . ."¹¹ The five paragraph "Declaration of Geneva" spoke of child rights in terms of "care and protection."¹² For example, paragraph 2 says that: "The child that is hungry should be fed; the child that is sick should be helped; the erring child should be

The first twenty-two States Parties to the Convention were: Ghana, Viet Nam, Ecuador, the Holy See, Belize, Guatemala, Sierra Leone, Bolivia, Sweden, Mongolia, Egypt, El Salvador, Guinea, St. Kitts & Nevis, Mauritius, Kenya, Senegal, Bhutan, Sudan, Bangladesh, Benin and Togo. *See Recent Actions Regarding Treaties to Which the United States is not a Party: Status of U.N. Convention on the Rights of the Child*, 30 I.L.M. 1780 (1991).

10. Note that the 191 countries that have ratified the Convention are not all members of the United Nations.

11. 1924 Declaration of Geneva, *reprinted in THE UNITED NATIONS CONVENTION ON THE RIGHTS OF THE CHILD: A GUIDE TO THE "TRAVAUX PRÉPARATOIRES"* 641 (Sharon Detrick ed., 1992) [hereinafter Detrick].

The "Declaration of Geneva" was a project of the international Save the Children movement, begun in England by Eglantyne Jebb in the years following World War I. For background about the "Declaration of Geneva," the Save the Children movement, and Eglantyne Jebb, see Michael Longford, *NGOs and the Rights of the Child*, in "THE CONSCIENCE OF THE WORLD": THE INFLUENCE OF NON-GOVERNMENTAL ORGANISATIONS IN THE U.N. SYSTEM (Peter Willetts ed., 1996).

12. For a detailed discussion of the evolution of children's rights from "care and protection" rights to "care and protection plus individual personality" rights, see Cynthia Price Cohen, *The Developing Jurisprudence of the Rights of the Child*, 6 ST. THOMAS L. REV. 1 (1993).

reclaimed; and the orphan and the homeless child should be sheltered and succoured."¹³

The plight of children following World War II once again brought worldwide attention to children's needs. One of the earliest human rights instruments adopted by the United Nations was the 1959 Declaration of the Rights of the Child.¹⁴ Its ten principles expanded the basic concepts of the "Declaration of Geneva," but continued to define children's rights as involving "care and protection."¹⁵ Among its principles are those that call for the child to: "enjoy special protection;"¹⁶ "enjoy the benefits of social security;"¹⁷ "be given the special treatment, education and care required by his particular condition [if handicapped];"¹⁸ "grow up in the care and under the responsibility of his parents;"¹⁹ "be given an education;"²⁰ "be among the first to receive protection and relief;"²¹ "be protected against . . . exploitation;"²² and "be protected from . . . discrimination."²³

The twentieth anniversary of the Declaration of the Rights of the Child ("the Declaration") inspired the 1979 International Year of the Child (IYC), which provided the international community with an opportunity to assess the current status and condition of children. As part of the events surrounding IYC, the Polish government proposed a treaty that would shape the principles of the Declaration into a legally binding instrument.²⁴

Drafting the Convention began in 1979, under the auspices of a Working Group of the Commission on Human Rights.²⁵ The draft was

13. 1924 Declaration of Geneva, *supra* note 11, at ¶ 2.

14. See *Declaration of the Rights of the Child*, U.N. GAOR, 14th Sess., Supp. No. 16, at 19, U.N. Doc. A/4354 (1959) [hereinafter *1959 Declaration*].

15. Cohen, *supra* note 12, at 1.

16. *Id.*, at Principle 2.

17. *Id.*, at Principle 4.

18. *Id.*, at Principle 5.

19. *Id.*, at Principle 6.

20. *Id.*, at Principle 7.

21. *Id.*, at Principle 8.

22. *Id.*, at Principle 9.

23. *Id.*, at Principle 10.

24. See *Adoption of the Agenda*, U.N. Commission on Human Rights, 34th Sess., Provisional Agenda Item 2, U.N. Doc. E/CN.4/1284 (1978).

25. For reports of the United Nations Working Group that drafted the Convention on the Rights of the Child for the years 1979–1987, see *Question of a Convention on the Rights of the Child: Report of the Working Group*, U.N. Commission on Human Rights, 35th Sess., Agenda Item 13, U.N. Doc. E/CN.4/L.1468 (1979) [hereinafter *1979 Working Group Report*]; *Question of a Convention on the Rights of the Child: Report of the Working Group*, U.N. Commission on Human Rights, 36th Sess., Agenda Item 13, U.N. Doc. E/CN.4/L.1542 (1980); *Report of the Working Group on a Draft Convention on the Rights of the Child*, U.N. Commission on Human Rights, 37th Sess., Agenda Item 14, U.N. Doc. E/CN.4/L.1575

completed ten years later. During that period Working Group deliberations marked a significant step in the evolution of accepted views regarding child rights.²⁶ Using a model treaty submitted by the Polish government²⁷ as a starting point, the Working Group expanded its child rights concept from a "care and protection" model to one that also protects the child's "individual personality" rights,²⁸ (i. e., civil and political rights that were never before included in an international children's rights instrument). The Convention on the Rights of the Child developed from a draft model treaty of twenty substantive articles to a final text with a substantive section approximately twice that size. Instead of merely picturing the child as a being in need of services, the Convention depicts the child as an individual with the right to have an opinion, to be

(1981); *Report of the Working Group on a Draft Convention on the Rights of the Child*, U.N. Commission on Human Rights, 38th Sess., Agenda Item 13, U.N. Doc. E/CN.4/1982/L.41 (1982); *Report of the Working Group on a Draft Convention on the Rights of the Child*, U.N. Commission on Human Rights, 39th Sess., Agenda Item 13, U.N. Doc. E/CN.4/1983/62 (1983); *Question of a Convention on the Rights of the Child: Report of the Working Group on a Draft Convention on the Rights of the Child*, U.N. Commission on Human Rights, 40th Sess., Agenda Item 13, U.N. Doc. E/CN.4/1984/71 (1984); *Question of a Convention on the Rights of the Child: Report of the Working Group on a Draft Convention on the Rights of the Child*, U.N. Commission on Human Rights, 41st Sess., Agenda Item 13, U.N. Doc. E/CN.4/1985/64 (1985); *Question of a Convention on the Rights of the Child: Report of the Working Group on a Draft Convention on the Rights of the Child*, U.N. Commission on Human Rights, 42d Sess., Agenda Item 13, U.N. Doc. E/CN.4/1986/39 (1986); *Question of a Convention on the Rights of the Child: Report of the Working Group on a Draft Convention on the Rights of the Child*, U.N. Commission on Human Rights, 43d Sess., Agenda Item 13, U.N. Doc. E/CN.4/1987/25 (1987); *Question of a Convention on the Rights of the Child: Report of the Working Group on a Draft Convention on the Rights of the Child*, U.N. Commission on Human Rights, 44th Sess., Agenda Item 13, U.N. Doc. E/CN.4/1988/28 (1988).

For the report of the Working Group's second reading, see *Question of a Convention on the Rights of the Child: Report of the Working Group on a Draft Convention on the Rights of the Child*, U.N. Commission on Human Rights, 45th Sess., Agenda Item 13, U.N. Doc. E/CN.4/1989/48 (1989).

For an article-by-article compilation of the Working Group reports, see, for example, Detrick, *supra* note 11. See also United Nations Centre for Human Rights, *Legislative History of the Convention on the Rights of the Child (1978-1989)*, U. N. Doc. HR/1996/Ser.1 (1996).

26. See generally Cohen, *supra* note 12.

27. The Polish government submitted two draft models of the Convention to the Commission on Human Rights. The first draft was modeled on the Declaration and was rejected by the Commission. See *Question of a Convention on the Rights of the Child*, U.N. ESCOR, 34th Sess., Supp. No. 4, at 75, U.N. Doc. E/CN.4/1292 (1978).

A second, longer and more legally enforceable draft was subsequently submitted and became the basis for the Working Group's deliberations. See 1979 Working Group Report, *supra* note 25, at 1.

28. See, e.g., Cohen, *supra* note 12.

a participant in decisions affecting his or her life, and to be respected for his or her human dignity.²⁹

The implementation mechanism of the Convention is similar to that of other United Nations human rights treaties. It establishes a committee of experts,³⁰ the Committee on the Rights of the Child, the members of which act in their personal capacities and examine the reports of States Parties (ratifying nations) to evaluate the measures that have been taken to implement the Convention.³¹ The initial State Party report is due two years after the Convention comes into force for that State Party.³² After that, States Parties must submit periodic reports every five years.³³

The text of the Convention on the Rights of the Child was finalized by the Working Group in the fall of 1988 and adopted by the Commission on Human Rights at its 1989 session.³⁴ After it was adopted by the General Assembly and opened for signature, ratifications quickly followed. By the time of the World Summit for Children in September of 1990,³⁵ the Convention was already in force.³⁶ Election of the original ten members of the Committee on the Rights of the Child took place at a meeting of States Parties in February 1991. Based on the article 43 requirement that membership in the Committee on the Rights of the Child be geographically diverse, the States Parties elected Committee members from Barbados, Burkina Faso, Brazil, Egypt, Peru, Philippines, Portugal, the Russian Federation, Sweden and Zimbabwe.³⁷

29. Among the articles that support the child's human dignity are articles 12-16 which protect the child's right to be heard, to freedom of expression, freedom of religion, freedom of association and assembly, and the right to privacy. An important characteristic of the Convention is that its text uses feminine as well as masculine singular possessive pronouns. For a discussion of the significance of this usage in regard to other human rights instruments, see Cynthia Price Cohen, *The United Nations Convention of the Rights of the Child: A Feminist Landmark*, 3 WM. & MARY J. WOMEN & L. 29 (1997).

30. See Convention, *supra* note 3, at art. 43.

31. See *id.* art. 44.

32. See *id.* art. 44.

33. See *id.* art. 49.

34. Although the "second reading" of the Convention, in which the final modifications to the text were made, actually took place in November-December 1988, the "second reading" was technically under the auspices of the 1989 Commission on Human Rights.

35. The World Summit for Children was held at the United Nations Headquarters in New York, September 29-30, 1990, and was attended by seventy-one heads of State and Government, as well as eighty-eight other senior officials. The meeting resulted in the adoption of a Declaration on the Survival, Development and Protection of Children and a Plan of Action for implementing the Declaration in the 1990s. The text of the Declaration is reprinted in *THE RIGHTS OF THE CHILD* (Maria Rita Saulle ed., 1995). For further information about the World Summit, see, for example, Cohen & Miljeteig-Olssen, *supra* note 8.

36. See *supra* note 9 and accompanying text.

37. The first members elected to the Committee included: *Mrs. Hoda Badran, Egypt; Msgr. Luis A. Bambaren Gastelumendi, Peru; Ms. Akila Belembaogo, Burkina Faso; *Ms. Marie de Fatima Borges de Omena, Brazil; *Ms. Flora Euphemio, Philippines; Mr. Thomas

One of the Convention's distinguishing characteristics is the extent to which nongovernmental organizations (NGOs) were involved in its drafting and are participating in its implementation. In 1983, a group of about thirty NGOs gathered in Geneva to form the Informal Ad Hoc NGO Group on the Drafting of the Convention on the Rights of the Child ("NGO Group"). They held regular meetings throughout the Convention's drafting process and their recommendations strongly influenced the Convention's content.³⁸ The success of the NGO Group's negotiations led the Working Group to include a special function for NGOs in the Convention's implementation process.³⁹ The Convention's innovative article 45 gives the Committee on the Rights of the Child the ability to obtain information from "other competent bodies."⁴⁰ This language was meant to be interpreted as "NGOs."

Hammarberg, Sweden; Mr. Youri Kolosov, Russian Federation (former U.S.S.R.); Mrs. Sandra Prunella Mason, Barbados; *Mr. Swithun Mombeshora, Zimbabwe; and *Mrs. Marta Santos Pais, Portugal. An asterisk (*) denotes a two year term. Two-year delegates were reelected in 1993 to new four-year terms that expired in 1997, while those members who originally drew four year terms came up for reelection in 1995. See *Annex II: Membership of the Committee on the Rights of the Child, 1991-93*, U.N. GAOR, 47th Sess., Supp. No. 41, at 15, U.N. Doc. A/47/41 (1992).

Elections to the Committee on the Rights of the Child are held at a meeting of States Parties every two years. No major changes were made after the 1993 election (the original Brazilian member was replaced by an alternate), but at the 1995 election a new member from Brazil was elected and the member from Peru was replaced by a new member from Israel. The 1997 election brought a restructuring of the Committee. In addition to the election of four new members from Indonesia, Italy, Lebanon and South Africa (who replaced the members from Egypt, the Philippines, Portugal and Zimbabwe), the members from Burkina Faso and Sweden were replaced by new members representing those countries. The original members from Barbados and the Russian Federation continue to be members of the Committee.

38. For background regarding NGO activities see Cynthia Price Cohen, *Role of Non-Governmental Organizations in the Drafting of the Convention on the Rights of the Child*, 12 HUM. RTS. Q. 137 (1990).

39. See Convention, *supra* note 3, at art. 45.

40. Article 45 of the Convention reads:

In order to foster the effective implementation of the Convention and to encourage international co-operation in the field covered by the Convention:

(a) The specialized agencies, the United Nations Children's Fund and other United Nations organs shall be entitled to be represented at the consideration of the implementation of such provisions of the present Convention as fall within the scope of their mandate. The Committee may invite the specialized agencies, United Nations Children's Fund and *other competent bodies* as it may consider appropriate to provide expert advice on the implementation of the Convention in areas falling within the scope of their respective mandates. The Committee may invite the specialized agencies, United Nations Children's Fund and other United Nations organs to submit reports on the implementation of the Convention in areas falling within the scope of their activities;

(b) The Committee shall transmit, as it may consider appropriate, to the specialized agencies, United Nations Children's Fund and *other competent bodies*, any reports from States Parties that contain a request, or indicate a need, for tech-

Once the Convention was adopted by the General Assembly, members of the NGO Group reorganized to actualize the new role they had been given by the Convention.⁴¹ In addition to following the work of the Committee on the Rights of the Child, the NGO Group, acting as a conduit for information between national NGOs and the Committee, ensures that the Committee receives the broadest possible information when reviewing States Parties' reports.⁴²

Initial reports from States Parties were first submitted to the Committee in the fall of 1992, and the formal State Party report examination process was begun by the Committee at its Third Session in January 1993. The First and Second Sessions of the Committee were spent formalizing the organization of its work. During this period the Committee drafted its *Provisional Rules of Procedure*, which covers such matters as its election of officers, distribution of documents, requests for studies, official languages, and General Discussion Days.⁴³

Because the task of reporting on the Convention's forty-two substantive articles threatened to be overwhelming, both for States Parties and for Committee members, the Committee also promulgated *General Guidelines Regarding the Form and Content of Initial Reports (Guidelines)*.⁴⁴ The *Guidelines* cluster the Convention's articles into sections according to topic, rather than in numerical order. Each of these sections covers a specific article or set of articles. Sections I and II of the *Guidelines* ask comprehensive questions about the country (demographics, etc.), the measures that have been taken to implement the Convention, and how the State Party defines the word "child." The remaining sections cover: general principles; civil rights and freedoms; family environment and

tical advice or assistance along with the Committee's observations and suggestions, if any, on these requests or indications. . . .

Convention, *supra* note 3, at art. 45 (emphasis added).

41. To reflect its new situation, the NGO Group changed its name to the NGO Group for the Convention on the Rights of the Child.

42. For further information on its activities, the NGO Group for the Convention on the Rights of the Child can be reached by contacting its Coordinator, Laura Theytaz-Bergman, at her email address: <dc_i_ngo.group@pingnet.ch>.

43. See *Annex IV: Provisional Rules of Procedure of the Committee*, U.N. GAOR, 47th Sess., Supp. No. 41, at 22, U.N. Doc. A/47/41 (1992) [hereinafter *Rules of Procedure*].

44. See *General Guidelines Regarding the Form and Content of Initial Reports to be Submitted by States Parties Under Article 44, Paragraph 1(a) of the Convention*, Convention on the Rights of the Child, 1st Sess., 22d mtg., U.N. Doc. CRC/C/5 (1991) [hereinafter *Guidelines*]. It should be noted that article 44 requires States Parties to submit their initial reports two years after the Convention goes into effect for that country, with periodic reports every five years thereafter. The Committee has also issued a comprehensive set of Guidelines for the periodic reports. See *General guidelines for periodic reports*, Comm. on the Rights of the Child, 13th Sess., 343d mtg., U.N. Doc. CRC/C/58 (1996). For a summary of the Guidelines, see Table I.

alternative care; basic health and welfare; education, leisure and cultural activities; and special protection measures.⁴⁵ States Parties are requested to submit their reports to the Committee following the format of the *Guidelines*.⁴⁶

When States Parties' reports are received by the Committee on the Rights of the Child, they are first translated into the Committee's three working languages (English, French and Spanish),⁴⁷ then they are given a U.N. document designation, and ultimately assigned a position in the Committee's order of review. The Committee's examination of States Parties' reports takes place in several stages. First, Committee members study the reports. The Committee then holds a private "pre-sessional" meeting, at which those reports are discussed. At this time, the Committee may invite NGOs and other experts from the countries under review to be present and to comment on the report.⁴⁸ Often these "other competent bodies" provide alternative reports and additional documents.⁴⁹ Based on its findings, the Committee submits a list of written questions to each State Party, which must reply in writing. The final stage is a public oral hearing at the next session of the Committee, at which representatives of the government of the State Party are present to answer Committee members' questions. The Committee typically holds from five to seven oral hearings at each of its sessions.⁵⁰

At the end of a session, the Committee on the Rights of the Child issues *Concluding Observations* on each State Party's report. The Committee uses this medium to comment on the information that has been supplied during the reviewing process. The *Concluding Observations* are usually divided into five subheadings: Introduction; Positive Aspects; Factors and Difficulties Impeding the Implementation of the Convention; Principle Subjects of Concern; and Suggestions and Recommendations. The *Concluding Observations* are included in the Committee's report to the General Assembly.⁵¹

As a result of the Committee's growing workload, since 1994, the General Assembly has approved a schedule that allows the Committee to meet for four weeks, three times each year.⁵² The first three weeks of

45. See *infra* notes 59 to 66 and accompanying text.

46. See *Guidelines*, *supra* note 44.

47. See Rule 27, *Rules of Procedure*, *supra* note 43, at 27.

48. See Article 45, *supra* note 40 and accompanying text.

49. Convention, *supra* note 40, at art. 45.

50. See Tables III-XVI.

51. Reports from States Parties and the Committee's Concluding Observations can be found on the web site for the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights. See United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights (visited Apr. 13, 1998) <<http://www.unhchr.ch>>.

52. When the Committee was first elected it assumed that, at most, they would meet twice a year for two weeks. With its current workload, the twelve weeks now scheduled is

each session are devoted to the examination of States Parties' reports. The fourth week is used to prepare for the following session.

The ratification of the Convention on the Rights of the Child by 191 countries⁵³ has made the Committee's tasks overwhelming. Although the Committee has been able to examine more than eighty States Parties reports over a period of five years,⁵⁴ a large backlog of reports still awaits review.⁵⁵ Furthermore, all of the members have other employment in addition to serving on the Committee. This means that Committee members, who have no designated clerks, have little time to prepare for their sessions before they arrive in Geneva and are therefore forced to prepare while the sessions are in progress.

These conditions have made it impossible for the Committee on the Rights of the Child to be able to follow the model of the Human Rights Committee which monitors the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights. Over a period of time, that committee has issued a series of *General Comments* that explain how the Human Rights Committee interprets most articles of the Covenant.⁵⁶ Unfortunately, establishing the jurisprudence of the Committee on the Rights of the Child is largely a matter of guesswork. Scholars and researchers cannot state with any certainty exactly how the Committee interprets a given article of the Convention. That task is probably difficult even for members of the Committee themselves.

III. CHILDRIGHTS JURISPRUDENCE PROJECT

Analysis of the jurisprudence of the Committee on the Rights of the Child is important because the Convention's language is quite general, as is typical of any constitutive instrument. This built-in elasticity of

insufficient to examine all the States Parties' reports. The usual meeting schedule for the Committee is January, May–June and September–October.

53. For a comprehensive list of the countries, see United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights (visited Apr. 23, 1998) <<http://www.unhcr.ch>>

54. Some countries have not yet submitted their initial reports, while others have already begun to submit their second or periodic reports.

55. As mentioned above, according to the Convention's article 44, States Parties are required to submit their initial reports two years after the Convention goes into force and periodic reports every five years thereafter. See Convention, *supra* note 3, at art. 44, ¶ 1.

56. The Human Rights Committee has drafted a series of General Comments on articles of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights that explain that Committee's interpretation of the Covenant's language. These can be found in Annexes to the Sessional/Annual Reports of the Human Rights Committee on the internet site for the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights. See United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights (visited Apr. 13, 1998) <<http://www.unhcr.ch/tbs/doc.nsf/by+Type+of+document?OpenView&Start=1&Count=30&Expand=9.6#9.6>>.

interpretation is intended to ensure that the Convention will meet the needs of diverse political, legal, and economic systems, and make it possible for differing cultures to be in compliance with the Convention's standards.

The ChildRights Jurisprudence Project was designed to make it possible for advocates and scholars to follow the developing jurisprudence of the Committee on the Rights of the Child by organizing that information in an accessible manner. Beginning in 1996, with the American Legal Realism premise that the meaning of law can best be found in its application,⁵⁷ ChildRights International Research Institute began exploring different techniques for creating a comprehensive whole from the *Concluding Observations* of the Committee on the Rights of the Child.

Originally, the ChildRights Jurisprudence Project was conceived as one that would take all of the Committee's comments about a particular article and synthesize this information into a single principle. The collected, synthesized conclusions were then to be published as a general guide. However, due to concerns that such an approach might result in editorialization or misinterpretation of the Convention's norms and the Committee's views, this methodology was not adopted. Rather, the Project's directors decided that since child rights jurisprudence is in a state of continuing evolution, the most practical approach would be to devise a system that provides the researcher with quick, unfiltered access to selected information in the original documents.

Arguably, child rights jurisprudence is created by the States Parties and others that submit reports to the Committee, as well as by the Committee's reviewing process. However, for the study to be manageable, it was necessary that it be confined to information derived only from the Committee, as the Convention's official monitoring body. Consequently, the ChildRights Jurisprudence Project has produced this Guide to Research and Analysis (ChildRights Guide) which consists of the attached sixteen tables correlating the Committee's comments in the *Concluding Observations* for sessions three through sixteen⁵⁸ with the topical paragraphs of its *Guidelines*.

Listing both the *Guidelines*' paragraph numbers and the relevant Convention article, Table I provides an overview of the Committee's *Guidelines*. Table II correlates the States Parties' reports with the number of the session in which it was reviewed by the Committee, along

57. See generally Oliver Wendell Holmes, *The Path of the Law*, 10 HARV. L. REV. 457 (1896-97); WOLFGANG FRIEDMANN, *LEGAL THEORY* 292 (1967); EDWIN W. PATTERSON, *JURISPRUDENCE: MEN AND IDEAS OF THE LAW* § 4.50 (1953).

58. The Committee began reviewing States Parties reports in Session 3.

with the date of the *Concluding Observations* and the appropriate United Nations document number. Notably, five countries (Colombia, Indonesia, Paraguay, Rwanda and Sudan) submitted more than one report to the Committee because the Committee considered the initial reports from these States Parties inadequate. At the Committee's request, those governments submitted additional reports and returned for a second oral hearing on their implementation of the Convention. In the tables, the conclusions from these first reports are designated "preliminary," which is indicated by the letter "P." Each of the remaining tables document the Committee's *Concluding Observations* for the States Parties' reports reviewed during a single session of the Committee.

A. Methodology

The research method used to develop to the ChildRights Guide entailed an examination of each set of *Concluding Observations* using a two-step method. First, the Convention's articles were listed in tabular form using the *Guidelines*' paragraph numbers as an ordering mechanism.⁵⁹ Next, the Committee's remarks in the *Concluding Observations* were analyzed and recorded in the table under the corresponding *Guidelines*' paragraph number.

Convention articles are listed according to the *Guidelines*' topical format and are catalogued by *Guidelines* paragraph numbers to allow for greater specificity in correlating particular observations with the article(s) being interpreted. For example, Section I, General Measures of Implementation, is listed in the tables under the *Guidelines*' numbers 9(a), (b), 10, and 11. Correspondingly, Committee comments on State Party responses regarding "[t]he measures taken to harmonize national law and policy with the provisions of the Convention; and [e]xisting or planned mechanisms at [the] national or local level for coordinating policies relating to children and for monitoring the implementation of the Convention"⁶⁰ are listed under *Guidelines* paragraphs 9(a) and (b).

In the tables, a positive and a negative column appear under the name of each State Party. Positive Committee remarks, such as commendation for progress in a particular area, were recorded in the corresponding column. If the Committee's comment was one of concern

59. See *Guidelines*, *supra* note 44. As stated above, the *Guidelines* do not follow the numerical order of the Convention's articles, but group related subjects together. The Committee has also established reporting guidelines for periodic reports. See *General guidelines for periodic reports*, *supra* note 44. However, all concluding observations discussed in this article are analyzed in accordance with the initial reporting guidelines because the reports concerned were initial reports.

60. *Guidelines*, *supra* note 44, at ¶ 9.

or was a recommendation for improvement, the comment was recorded in the negative column. Both types of comments are denoted by a number which corresponds to the paragraph number of the relevant *Concluding Observations*. In many cases the Committee noted progress in an area but also recommended further measures, and observations were frequently applicable to more than one subject category.⁶¹ In addition, Committee comments regarding reservations and declarations made by States Parties at ratification are denoted by the letter "R" or "D" next to the applicable paragraph number.⁶²

Although the *Concluding Observations* are not organized according to article numbers, the Committee usually specifies which article it is discussing in a particular comment, or the topic is clear from the context. However, parts of the analysis required interpretation based on a general understanding of the Convention's legislative history, implementation, and overall meaning. For example, the Committee's comments regarding infant mortality were assigned to the categories pertaining to the child's right to life, survival, and development,⁶³ as well as to the category of health and health services,⁶⁴ even though the Committee rarely specified how its comments on that subject were to be interpreted. Similarly, the Committee's remarks concerning poverty were assigned to the category of standard of living⁶⁵ because the context of the Committee's observations suggested that the Committee's primary concern regarding standard of living was poverty, even though "standard of living" can refer to issues other than poverty.

In addition to the information requested by the Committee in *Guidelines* paragraphs 9 to 23(d), eight categories of particular interest to U.S. researchers have been included in the tables. The categories regarding the allocation of resources and the training of professionals who have contact with children are general areas that were added to the tables because of their importance to the Convention's implementation. The others were included because of the current status of the Conven-

61. For example, an observation about the State Party's failure to provide access to education for disabled children could pertain to the categories of education, disabled children, and discrimination.

62. A *reservation* indicates that a particular portion of the treaty will not be observed by the State Party. A *declaration* has to do with how the treaty language will be interpreted. The Convention on the Rights of the Child not only allows for reservations, it also contains a procedure for withdrawal of reservations. See Convention, *supra* note 3, at art. 51; see also Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties, May 23, 1969, arts. 19-23, U.N. Doc. A/Conf39/28, 8 I.L.M. 679 (entered into force Jan. 27, 1980). There are no provisions for declarations or their withdrawal, however, they are allowed.

63. *Guidelines*, *supra* note 44, at ¶ 13(c), 19(a); Convention, *supra* note 3, at art. 6.

64. *Guidelines*, *supra* note 44, at ¶ 13(c), 19(a); Convention, *supra* note 3, at art. 24.

65. *Guidelines*, *supra* note 44, at ¶ 13(c), 19(a); Convention, *supra* note 3, at art. 27.

tion in the United States and the particular relevance of these six issues to the U.S. political debate: corporal punishment, abortion, teen pregnancy, family planning/sex education, youth suicide, and family breakdown/divorce/single parents.⁶⁶

B. *General Trends in Committee Jurisprudence*

An examination of the tables reveals trends toward increasing comprehensiveness in the *Concluding Observations*. The Committee's *Concluding Observations* for the third session, in January 1993, contained an average of sixteen paragraphs. By the sixteenth session, in October 1997, the *Concluding Observations* averaged forty-five paragraphs. The Committee's comments have become more detailed and complex. For example, one of the Committee's substantive recommendations to Viet Nam, during the third session in 1993, involved juvenile justice:

The appropriate amendments should be made to the Penal Code in order to adequately reflect the provisions contained in articles 37, 39, and 40 of the Convention as well as the relevant provisions of the Code of Conduct for Law Enforcement Officials and other international standards in this field, such as the "Beijing Rules," the "Riyadh Guidelines" and the Rules for the Protection of Juveniles Deprived of their Liberty. In this connection the Committee recommends that a training course for law enforcement personnel be organized by the Center for Human Rights in Viet Nam.⁶⁷

A similar paragraph found in the Committee's *Concluding Observations* for Lao People's Democratic Republic in 1997 provides much more detail:

The Committee recommends that legal reform in the field of administration of juvenile justice be pursued and take fully into account the Convention on the Rights of the Child, in particular articles 37, 39 and 40 as well as other relevant standards in this field such as the Beijing Rules, the Riyadh Guidelines and the United Nations Rules for the Protection of Juveniles Deprived of their Liberty. Particular attention should be paid to the prevention of juvenile delinquency, the protection of the rights of

66. See *infra* notes 89-92 and accompanying text. These issues may overlap with some paragraphs of the Committee's *Guidelines*, but listing them separately provides an efficient way of indexing those comments.

67. *Concluding Observations of the Committee on the Rights of the Child: Viet Nam*, U.N. Comm. on the Rights of the Child, 3d Sess., ¶ 8, U.N. Doc. CRC/C/15/Add.3 (1993).

children deprived of their liberty, respect for fundamental rights and legal safeguards in all aspects of the juvenile justice system and full independence and impartiality of the judiciary dealing with juveniles. The Committee also encourages the State party to explore alternatives to institutional care as well as traditional mechanisms of conciliation, as long as the principles and guarantees of the Convention are respected. The Committee also recommends that the State party avails itself of the technical assistance programmes of the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights and the Crime Prevention and Criminal Justice Division of the United Nations.⁶⁸

This increased comprehensiveness probably reflects the growing familiarity of Committee members with the reviewing process, the issues involved in the Convention, and the resources available to assist States Parties. Whatever the reason, the increased comprehensiveness allows a more complete understanding of the Convention's provisions.

The tables also show a tendency for the Committee to emphasize certain sections of the *Guidelines*, both procedural and substantive. For example, with only three exceptions, the Committee uniformly identified paragraph 9 of the *Guidelines*, pertaining to general measures of implementation (e.g., harmonizing national law with the Convention and coordinating the implementation and monitoring of the Convention) as an area requiring additional measures for full implementation.⁶⁹ In addition, the Committee almost always observed that the allocation of resources to children's programs⁷⁰ and the training of professionals who deal with children were in need of significant improvement. Cooperation with NGOs was also frequently noted with both approval and encouragement for further measures; and beginning with the fifth session in January 1994, the Committee consistently emphasized the need for increased publicity for the Convention.⁷¹

Implementation of the articles in *Guidelines*, Section III, dealing with the Convention's general principles is among the substantive areas

68. *Concluding Observations of the Committee on the Rights of the Child: Lao People's Democratic Republic*, U.N. Comm. on the Rights of the Child, 16th Sess., ¶ 53, U.N. Doc. CRC/C/15/Add.78 (1997).

69. The only exceptions as of Oct. 1997 are Egypt and Viet Nam (third session) and the Holy See (tenth session). See *Concluding Observations of the Committee on the Rights of the Child: Egypt*, U.N. Comm. on the Rights of the Child, 3d Sess., U.N. Doc. CRC/C/15/Add.5 (1993); *Concluding Observations of the Committee on the Rights of the Child: Holy See*, U.N. Comm. on the Rights of the Child, 10th Sess., U.N. Doc. CRC/C/15/Add.46 (1995); *Concluding Observations of the Committee on the Rights of the Child: Viet Nam*, *supra* note 67.

70. Convention, *supra* note 3, at art. 4.

71. See *infra*, Tables V–XVI.

subject to regular comment by the Committee.⁷² The Committee has cited as needing improvement at least one of the articles corresponding to section III in every State Party report reviewed.⁷³ Those observations, reveal a clear emphasis on the need for better implementation of the article 2 guarantee of protection against discrimination, and an increasing concern about the implementation of the article 12 assurance of respect for the views of the child.

In addition to these general principles, the Committee regularly comments on several other substantive subject categories. The subject categories of juvenile justice and the deprivation of liberty⁷⁴ were often cited for improvement, as were the areas of child labor,⁷⁵ abuse and neglect,⁷⁶ and education.⁷⁷ Substantive issues that have been noted by the Committee with increasing frequency include rehabilitation;⁷⁸ birth registration;⁷⁹ protection from harmful media, such as violent or pornographic television;⁸⁰ and corporal punishment (usually cited as part of the issue of violence against children, article 19).⁸¹

In contrast, only one subject category was never cited in any of the Committee's *Concluding Observations*: the illicit transfer and non-return of the child.⁸² Two other categories have received only minimal attention from the Committee: the recovery of maintenance,⁸³ which was noted only three times;⁸⁴ and leisure and recreation,⁸⁵ which was noted only six times.⁸⁶

72. See *Guidelines*, supra note 44.

73. The only exceptions are the preliminary observations for Sudan and Rwanda. See *Preliminary Observations of the Committee on the Rights of the Child: Sudan*, U.N. Comm. on the Rights of the Child, 3d Sess., U.N. Doc. CRC/C/15/Add.6 (1993); *Report on the Fourth Session of the Committee on the Rights of the Child, Preliminary Observations: Rwanda*, U.N. Comm. on the Rights of the Child, 4th Sess., U.N. Doc. CRC/C/20 (1993). However, the Committee commented on each of articles 2, 3, 6, and 12 in its concluding observations for Sudan. See *Concluding Observations of the Committee on the Rights of the Child: Sudan*, U.N. Comm. on the Rights of the Child, 4th Sess., ¶¶ 8, 12, 21, U.N. Doc. CRC/C/15/Add.10 (1993).

74. Convention, supra note 3, at art. 40.

75. *Guidelines*, supra note 44, at ¶ 23(c)(i); Convention, supra note 3, at art. 32.

76. *Guidelines*, supra note 44, at ¶ 16(i); Convention, supra note 3, at arts. 19, 32.

77. *Guidelines*, supra note 44, at ¶ 21(a); Convention, supra note 3, at art. 28.

78. *Guidelines*, supra note 44, at ¶ 23(b); Convention, supra note 3, at art. 39.

79. *Guidelines*, supra note 44, at ¶ 15(a); Convention, supra note 3, at art. 7.

80. *Guidelines*, supra note 44, at ¶ 15(c); Convention, supra note 3, at art. 17.

81. Convention, supra note 3, at art. 19.

82. *Guidelines*, supra note 44, at ¶ 16(h); Convention, supra note 3, at art. 11.

83. *Guidelines*, supra note 44, at ¶ 16(e); Convention, supra note 3, at art. 27.

84. See *Concluding Observations of the Committee on the Rights of the Child: Russian Federation*, U.N. Comm. on the Rights of the Child, 3d Sess., ¶ 10, U.N. Doc. CRC/C/15/Add.4 (1993); *Concluding Observations of the Committee on the Rights of the Child: Poland*, U.N. Comm. on the Rights of the Child, 8th Sess., ¶ 33, U.N. Doc.

C. Factors Influencing Committee Jurisprudence

The developing jurisprudence of the Committee on the Rights of the Child is influenced by many factors. While the most significant of these factors is probably the nature of the information made available to the Committee, other factors include trends in the jurisprudence of other treaty bodies; changes in child development theory; and the personalities and expertise of Committee members. Although most of these influences can be attributed to exterior forces, some are the result of Committee action. A typical example of the latter is the Committee's establishment of General Discussion Days as a forum for topics of general interest to States Parties. General Discussion Days grew out of the "general discussion" provision of rule 75 of the Committee's Provisional Rules of Procedure,⁸⁷ and have become an annual event, in which topics such as children and war, economic exploitation of children, juvenile delinquency, and children with disabilities are discussed. Another Committee practice that may have influenced its interpretation of the Convention has been a series of "on site" visits to such places as Latin America, Asia and Africa.

Perhaps the most significant outside influence is the input the Committee receives under article 45 of the Convention. This article gives the Committee the power to obtain information from various United Nations bodies, such as the International Labour Organisation, the World Health Organization and UNICEF. Article 45 also provides for information to be submitted to the Committee by NGOs and scholars.⁸⁸

The extent to which outside information resources were involved in the review of the United Kingdom's report illustrates the potential effect that such information can have on the Committee. In that case, the

CRC/C/15/Add.31 (1995); *Concluding Observations of the Committee on the Rights of the Child: Lao People's Democratic Republic*, *supra* note 68, at ¶¶ 21, 45.

85. *Guidelines*, *supra* note 44, at ¶ 21(c); Convention, *supra* note 3, at art. 31.

86. *See Concluding Observations of the Committee on the Rights of the Child: Russian Federation*, *supra* note 84, at ¶ 14; *Concluding Observations of the Committee on the Rights of the Child: Germany*, U.N. Comm. on the Rights of the Child, 10th Sess., ¶ 31, U.N. Doc. CRC/C/15/Add.43 (1995); *Concluding Observations of the Committee on the Rights of the Child: Lebanon*, U.N. Comm. on the Rights of the Child, 12th Sess., ¶ 36, U.N. Doc. CRC/C/15/Add.54 (1996); *Concluding Observations of the Committee on the Rights of the Child: United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland: Dependent Territories: Hong Kong*, U.N. Comm. on the Rights of the Child, 13th Sess., ¶ 32, U.N. Doc. CRC/C/15/Add.63 (1996); *Concluding Observations of the Committee on the Rights of the Child: Bangladesh*, U.N. Comm. on the Rights of the Child, 15th Sess., ¶¶ 25, 44, U.N. Doc. CRC/C/15/Add.74 (1997); *Concluding Observations of the Committee on the Rights of the Child: Togo*, U.N. Comm. on the Rights of the Child, 16th Sess., ¶¶ 25, 49, U.N. Doc. CRC/C/15/Add.83 (1997).

87. Rules 75, *Rules of Procedure*, *supra* note 43.

88. *See* Convention, *supra* note 3, at art. 45; *see also supra* note 40.

Committee was strongly urged by a British NGO, End Physical Punishment of Children (EPOCH), to take a stand against the corporal punishment of children. EPOCH is leading an international effort to make corporal punishment of children by anyone—including parents—illegal.⁸⁹ After meeting with representatives of EPOCH, the Committee became sensitive to this issue and began calling for States Parties to consider national legislation prohibiting all corporal punishment, including within the family.⁹⁰ Typically, the Committee has called for the State Party to:

take all appropriate measures, including of a legislative nature, with the aim of prohibiting corporal punishment in private schools and at home. The Committee also suggests that awareness raising campaigns be conducted to ensure that alternative forms of discipline are administered in a manner consistent with the child's human dignity and in conformity with the Convention.⁹¹

This is particularly notable because while the Committee has read this prohibition into the language of the Convention, the drafters of the Convention pointedly made no reference to corporal punishment.⁹²

A related influential factor is the lack of resources available to the Committee. Given the Committee's demanding workload, limited schedule, and lack of research assistance, the Committee members have little time to contemplate and develop a consistent philosophy. Under

89. For an overview of the status of the movement against corporal punishment, see Susan Bitensky, *Spare the Rod, Embrace Our Humanity: Toward a New Legal Regime Prohibiting Corporal Punishment of Children*, 31 MICH. J.L. REFORM 353 (1998).

90. For a brief overview of the trend of concern over corporal punishment, examine the corporal punishment rows, see *infra* Table III beginning with Session 3.

91. *Concluding Observations of the Committee on the Rights of the Child: Australia*, U.N. Comm. on the Rights of the Child, 16th Sess., ¶ 26, U.N. Doc. CRC/C/15/Add.79 (1997).

92. Because of the possible controversy associated with abortion and corporal punishment, neither term is used in the Convention. The abortion issue was avoided by the Convention's definition of the word "child", which reads, "[f]or the purposes of the present Convention, a child means every human being below the age of eighteen years unless under the law applicable to the child, majority is attained earlier." Convention, *supra* note 3, at art. 1. It was the drafter's intent to leave the rights of the unborn child to the State Party's discretion.

Corporal punishment was never discussed, *per se*. However, the first draft of articles 28 and 29 regarding school discipline contained language prohibiting methods of punishment that were "mentally or physically cruel or degrading." Since these words have been interpreted to mean corporal punishment both by the Human Rights Committee and the Human Rights Court of the Council of Europe, their inclusion in the Convention were opposed by the United Kingdom, Canada, Australia and the United States. They were therefore dropped from the Convention, leaving the matter of physical punishment undefined. See Convention, *supra* note 3, at arts. 28-29.

such conditions, the Committee is vulnerable to the persuasion of those who provide them with data, as occurred during the review of the report from the United Kingdom. While one may agree with the outcome from the U.K. review, future influences on the Committee may not be so positive. However, as the Committee's jurisprudence becomes more established, the dangers of undue influence will be considerably less.

IV. RESEARCH AND THE DEVELOPING CHILD RIGHTS JURISPRUDENCE

The Convention on the Rights of the Child is an extraordinary research tool. The documentation is rich, detailed, and easily accessible; reaching from the introduction of the child rights concept to the worldwide status of children's rights today. The Convention has inspired much scholarship, some of which is outlined below.

The history of the Convention's drafting has been covered by numerous articles⁹³ and books,⁹⁴ and the entire legislative history has been published in two different versions. One of these, *The United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child: A Guide to the "Travaux Préparatoires."*⁹⁵ documents the development of the Convention's text article-by-article. The other is the *Legislative History of the Convention on the Rights of the Child (1978-1989)*,⁹⁶ which is published by the United Nations and is available in a series of pamphlets that give the entire history of each article individually, and include the proposals of NGOs and other unpublished Working Group documents.

These are two analyses of the Convention that will be helpful to researchers. One is the *Implementation Handbook for the Convention on the Rights of the Child*, published by UNICEF⁹⁷ as a guide for States Parties in writing their reports to the Committee. The other is the long-awaited study of the Convention by Philip Alston, *Commentary on the Convention on the Rights of the Child of 1989*,⁹⁸ that will give an analy-

93. In addition to articles cited elsewhere in this article, see, for example, Cynthia Price Cohen, *Monitoring the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child: The Challenge of Information Management*, 18 HUM. RTS. Q. 439 (1996); Cynthia Price Cohen, *Juvenile Justice Provisions of the Draft Convention on the Rights of the Child*, 7 N.Y.L. SCH. J. HUM. RTS. 1 (1989); Cynthia Price Cohen, *Introductory Note, Convention on the Rights of the Child*, 28 I.L.M. 1448 (1989).

94. See, e.g., LAWRENCE J. LE BLANC, *THE CONVENTION ON THE RIGHTS OF THE CHILD: UNITED NATIONS LAWMAKING ON HUMAN RIGHTS* (1995).

95. See, Detrick, *supra* note 11.

96. See United Nations Centre for Human Rights, *supra* note 25.

97. See UNICEF, *IMPLEMENTATION HANDBOOK FOR THE CONVENTION ON THE RIGHTS OF THE CHILD* (Peter Newell & Rachel Hodgkin eds., 1998).

98. See PHILIP ALSTON, *COMMENTARY ON THE CONVENTION ON THE RIGHTS OF THE CHILD OF 1989* (forthcoming).

sis of the broader context of the general human rights norms that are being developed in connection with other international legal instruments.

Additionally, a growing number of essay collections provides a variety of analytical approaches to the Convention. *Children's Rights in America: U.N. Convention on the Rights of the Child Compared with United States Law*.⁹⁹ takes a national-legal approach to its study of the Convention's standards, while Eugene Verhellen's, *Convention on the Rights of the Child*¹⁰⁰ is written from the point of view of a psychologist.

In addition, 1997 witnessed a dramatic increase in the frequency of conferences, symposia, and panel discussions on children's rights. Some of these conferences have looked at the Convention as an international legal instrument, while others have taken an interdisciplinary approach to the rights of the child, and still others have focused on grassroots efforts and the behavior of NGOs.¹⁰¹ Legal publications about the Convention also surged in 1996 and 1997, and these trends appear to be continuing into 1998.¹⁰²

The developing jurisprudence regarding child rights is not limited to the implementation of the Convention on the Rights of the Child. The rights of children are being recognized by a variety of international bodies. Both the Council of Europe and the Organization of African Unity have adopted child rights treaties,¹⁰³ and the Hague Conference on Private International Law was very sensitive to the new international

99. See CHILDREN'S RIGHTS IN AMERICA: U.N. CONVENTION ON THE RIGHTS OF THE CHILD COMPARED WITH UNITED STATES LAW (Cynthia Price Cohen & Howard A. Davidson eds., 1990).

100. See Verhellen, *supra* note 7.

101. See, e.g., *United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child: Prospects for the Year 2000*, Loyola School of Law, New Orleans, LA, Feb. 13-15, 1997 (international legal instrument); *Children in the World: Exploring the Rights of the Child*, St. Xavier University, Chicago, IL, Mar. 20-23, 1997 (interdisciplinary approach); *International Human Rights at the Grassroots: Putting International Standards to Work for Our Children*, University of Iowa School of Law, Iowa City, IA, Mar. 14-15, 1997 (grassroots); *Advancing Children's Futures: The Role of Nongovernmental Organizations in Supporting Children's Rights*, Indiana University-Purdue University Indianapolis, Indianapolis, IN, Nov. 20-22, 1997 (behavior of NGOs).

102. See *The United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child: Benefits to American Children, Effects on American Law*, Georgetown University Law Center, Washington, D.C., Feb. 26-28, 1998. The event will be followed by publication of an issue of the *Georgetown Journal on Fighting Poverty* devoted to the symposium proceedings. See Symposium, 5 GEO. J. ON FIGHTING POVERTY (forthcoming 1998).

103. See Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the African Child, July 11, 1990, OAU Doc. CAB/LEG/24.9/49, reprinted in AFRICAN NETWORK FOR THE PREVENTION AND PROTECTION AGAINST CHILD ABUSE AND NEGLECT, CHARTER ON THE RIGHTS AND WELFARE OF THE AFRICAN CHILD 12 (Peter O. Ebigbo ed., 1991); see, e.g., Saule, *supra* note 35.

children's rights norms when it drafted its most recent treaties on the protection of children.¹⁰⁴

Application of non-treaty standards, such as the United Nations juvenile justice rules and guidelines,¹⁰⁵ also influences the development of international norms regarding children's rights, as do the activities of the U.N. Special Rapporteur on the Sale of Children,¹⁰⁶ the report of the U.N. Special Expert on Children and War¹⁰⁷ and the joint NGO-UNICEF Stockholm Conference on the Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children of 1996. In fact, United Nations bodies such as the United Nations Children's Fund and the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees have completely revised their policies due to the overwhelming influence of the Convention.¹⁰⁸

As evidenced by the preceding discussion, the literature regarding children's rights is growing rapidly. This mass of information lends an anarchic quality to the field—a quality which will likely persist until the Committee itself can find the opportunity to produce its own written commentary.

104. See Hague Conference on Private International Law: Final Act of the 17th Session, Including the Convention on Protection of Children and Co-operation in Respect of Inter-country Adoption, *opened for signature*, May 29, 1993, 32 I.L.M. 1134 (1993).

105. See *Standard Minimum Rules for the Administration of Juvenile Justice*, G.A. Res. 33, U.N. GAOR, 40th Sess., Supp. No. 53, U.N. Doc. A/40/53 (1985).

106. See, e.g., *Promotion and Protection of the Rights of Children: Sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography*, U.N. GAOR, 51st Sess., Agenda Item 106, U.N. Doc. A/51/456 (1996).

107. See *Promotion and Protection of the Rights of Children: Impact of armed conflict on children*, U.N. GAOR, 51st Sess., Provisional Agenda Item 108, U.N. Doc. A/51/306 (1996).

108. See, e.g., Rebeca Rios-Kohn, *The Impact of the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child on UNICEF's Mission*, 6 TRANSNAT'L L. & CONTEMP. PROBS 287 (1996); *Guidelines on Refugee Children*, UNHCR U.N. Doc. E/CN 4/28 (1988).

APPENDIX—CHILD RIGHTS JURISPRUDENCE PROJECT: GUIDE FOR RESEARCH AND ANALYSIS
 TABLE I: SUMMARY OF GENERAL GUIDELINES FOR SUBMISSION OF INITIAL REPORTS¹⁰⁹

GUIDELINES PARAGRAPH	DESCRIPTION OF COMMITTEE'S REQUEST	RELATED CONVENTION ARTICLE(S)
<i>I. General Measures of Implementation</i>		
9(a)	Measures taken to harmonize national law and policy with the provisions of the Convention	4
9(b)	Existing or planned mechanisms at the national or local level for coordinating policies relating to children and for monitoring the implementation of the Convention	4
10	Measures taken or foreseen to make the principles and provisions of the Convention widely known, by appropriate and active means, to adults and children alike	42
11	Measures taken or foreseen to make the State Party's reports to the Committee widely available to the public at large in their own country	44(6)

109. *General Guidelines Regarding the Form and Content of Initial Reports to be Submitted by States Parties Under Article 44, Paragraph 1(a), of the Convention, Convention on the Rights of the Child*, 1st Sess., 22d mtg., U.N. Doc. CRC/C/5 (1991). Paragraph 8 of the *Guidelines* states that "[t]he provisions of the Convention have been grouped under different sections, equal importance being attached to all the rights recognized by the Convention." *Id.* ¶ 8. The descriptions given in this table paraphrase the text of the *Guidelines*. In addition to the substantive areas listed here, the Committee also requests extensive statistical data from States Parties. See also UNICEF, *United Nations Children's Fund* (visited May 20, 1998) <<http://www.unicef.org>>; *The Graduate Institute of International Studies* (visited May 20, 1998) <<http://heiwwww.unige.ch>>.

TABLE I (CONTINUED)

GUIDELINES PARAGRAPH	DESCRIPTION OF COMMITTEE'S REQUEST	RELATED CONVENTION ARTICLE(S)
<i>II. Definition of the Child</i>		
12	Relevant information concerning the definition of the word, "child" under the State Party's laws and regulations. In particular, information is requested on the age of attainment of majority and on the legal minimum ages established for various purposes, including legal or medical counseling without parental consent, end of compulsory education, part-time employment, full-time employment, hazardous employment, sexual consent, marriage, voluntary enlistment into the armed forces, conscription in to the armed forces, voluntarily giving testimony in court, criminal liability, deprivation of liberty, imprisonment, and consumption of alcohol or other controlled substances	1
<i>III. General Principles</i>		
13(a)	Relevant information, including principal legislative, judicial, administrative or other measures in force or foreseen, the factors and difficulties encountered and progress achieved in implementing the provisions of the Convention, and the implementation priorities and specific goals regarding non-discrimination	2
13(b)	Relevant information (as above) regarding the implementation of the best interests of the child	3
13(c)	Relevant information (as above) regarding the implementation of the right to life, survival and development	6
13(d)	Relevant information (as above) regarding the implementation of respect for the views of the child	12

TABLE I (CONTINUED)

GUIDELINES PARAGRAPH	DESCRIPTION OF COMMITTEE'S REQUEST	RELATED CONVENTION ARTICLE(S)
<i>IV. Civil Rights and Freedoms</i>		
15(a)	Relevant information, including the principal legislative, judicial, administrative or other measures in force; the factors and difficulties encountered and progress achieved in implementation; and the implementation priorities and specific goals regarding name and nationality	7
15(b)	Relevant information (as above) regarding preservation of identity	8
15(c)	Relevant information (as above) regarding freedom of expression	13
15(d)	Relevant information (as above) regarding access to appropriate information	17
15(e)	Relevant information (as above) regarding freedom of thought, conscience and religion	14
15(f)	Relevant information (as above) regarding freedom of association and of peaceful assembly	15
15(g)	Relevant information (as above) regarding implementation of protection of privacy	16
15(h)	Relevant information (as above) regarding the right not to be subjected to torture or other cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment of punishment	37(a)

TABLE I (CONTINUED)

GUIDELINES PARAGRAPH	DESCRIPTION OF COMMITTEE'S REQUEST	RELATED CONVENTION ARTICLE(S)
<i>V. Family Environment and Alternative Care</i>		
16(a)	Relevant information, including the principal legislative, judicial, administrative or other measures in force, particularly how the principles of the "best interests of the child" and "respect for the views of the child" are reflected therein; the factors and difficulties encountered and progress achieved in implementation; and the implementation priorities and specific goals regarding parental guidance	5
16(b)	Relevant information (as above) regarding parental responsibilities	18(1), 18(2)
16(c)	Relevant information (as above) regarding separation from parents	9
16(d)	Relevant information (as above) regarding family reunification	10
16(e)	Relevant information (as above) regarding recovery of maintenance for the child	27(4)
16(f)	Relevant information (as above) regarding children deprived of a family environment	20
16(g)	Relevant information (as above) regarding adoption	21
16(h)	Relevant information (as above) regarding illicit transfer and non-return	11
16(i)	Relevant information (as above) regarding abuse and neglect, including physical and psychological recovery and social reintegration	19, 39
16(j)	Relevant information (as above) regarding periodic review of placement	25

TABLE I (CONTINUED)

GUIDELINES PARAGRAPH	DESCRIPTION OF COMMITTEE'S REQUEST	RELATED CONVENTION ARTICLE(S)
<i>VI. Basic Health and Welfare</i>		
19(a)	Relevant information, including the principal legislative, judicial, administrative or other measures in force; the institutional infrastructure for implementing policy, particularly monitoring strategies and mechanisms; and the factors and difficulties encountered and progress achieved in implementation regarding survival and development	6(2)
19(b)	Relevant information (as above) regarding disabled children	23
19(c)	Relevant information (as above) regarding health and health services	24
19(d)	Relevant information (as above) regarding social security and child care services and facilities	26, 18(3)
19(e)	Relevant information (as above) regarding standard of living	27(1), 27(2), 27(3)
<i>VII. Education, Leisure and Cultural Activities</i>		
21(a)	Relevant information, including the principal legislative, administrative or other measures in force; and the institutional infrastructure for implementing policy in this area, particularly monitoring progress achieved in implementation regarding education, including vocational training and guidance	28
21(b)	Relevant information (as above) regarding aims of education	29
21(c)	Relevant information (as above) regarding leisure, recreation and cultural activities	31

TABLE I (CONTINUED)

GUIDELINES PARAGRAPH	DESCRIPTION OF COMMITTEE'S REQUEST	RELATED CONVENTION ARTICLE(S)
<i>VIII. Special Protection Measures: Children in Situations of Emergency</i>		
23(a)(i)	Relevant information, including the principal legislative, administrative or other measures in force; factors and difficulties encountered and progress achieved in implementation; and implementation goals and priorities for the future regarding refugee children	22
23(a)(ii)	Relevant information (as above) regarding children in armed conflicts, including physical and psychological recovery and social reintegration	38, 39
<i>IX. Children in Conflict with the Law</i>		
23(b)(i)	Relevant information (as above) regarding administration of juvenile justice	40
23(b)(ii)	Relevant information (as above) regarding children deprived of their liberty, including any form of detention, imprisonment or placement in custodial settings	37(b), 37(c), 37(d)
23(b)(iii)	Relevant information (as above) regarding the sentencing of juveniles, in particular the prohibition of capital punishment and life imprisonment	37(a)
23(b)(iv)	Relevant information (as above) regarding physical and psychological recovery and social reintegration	39

TABLE I (CONTINUED)

GUIDELINES PARAGRAPH	DESCRIPTION OF COMMITTEE'S REQUEST	RELATED CONVENTION ARTICLE(S)
<i>X. Children in Situations of Exploitation, Including Physical and Psychological Recovery and Social Reintegration</i>		
23(c)(i)	Relevant information (as above) regarding economic exploitation, including child labor	32, 39
23(c)(ii)	Relevant information (as above) regarding drug abuse	33, 39
23(c)(iii)	Relevant information (as above) regarding sexual exploitation and sexual abuse	34, 39
23(c)(iv)	Relevant information (as above) regarding other forms of exploitation	36, 39
23(c)(v)	Relevant information (as above) regarding sale, trafficking and abduction	35, 39
<i>XI. Children Belonging to a Minority or Indigenous Group</i>		
24	Relevant information (as above) regarding children belonging to a minority of and indigenous group	30

TABLE II: STATE PARTY REPORTS REVIEWED BY THE COMMITTEE ON THE RIGHTS OF THE CHILD (AS OF JANUARY 1998)

	COMMITTEE SESSION	DATE OF SESSION	DATE OF CONCLUDING OBSERVATIONS	DOCUMENT NUMBER
Algeria	Fifteenth	May 29-30, 1997	Jun. 18, 1997	CRC/C/15/Add.76
Argentina	Eighth	Oct. 10-11, 1994	Feb. 15, 1995	CRC/C/15/Add.35
Australia	Sixteenth	Sept. 24-25, 1997	Oct. 10, 1997	CRC/C/15/Add.79
Azerbaijan	Fifteenth	Jun. 2-3, 1997	Jun. 17, 1997	CRC/C/15/Add.77
Bangladesh	Fifteenth	May 26-27, 1997	Jun. 18, 1997	CRC/C/15/Add.74
Belarus	Fifth	Jan. 25-26, 1994	Feb. 7, 1994	CRC/C/15/Add.17
Belgium	Ninth	May 31-Jun. 1, 1995	Jun. 20, 1995	CRC/C/15/Add.38
Bolivia	Third	Jan. 14-15, 1993	Feb. 18, 1993	CRC/C/15/Add.1
Bulgaria	Fourteenth	Jan. 7-8, 1997	Jan. 24, 1997	CRC/C/15/Add.66
Burkina Faso	Sixth	Apr. 7-8, 1994	Apr. 25, 1994	CRC/C/15/Add.19
Canada	Ninth	May 24 & 26, 1995	Jun. 20, 1995	CRC/C/15/Add.37
Chile	Sixth	Apr. 14-15, 1994	Apr. 25, 1994	CRC/C/15/Add.22
China	Twelfth	May 28-29, 1996	Jun. 7, 1996	CRC/C/15/Add.56
Colombia (Preliminary)	Fifth	Jan. 17-18, 1994	Feb. 7, 1994	CRC/C/15/Add.15
Colombia	Eighth	Jan. 12, 1995	Feb. 15, 1995	CRC/C/15/Add.30
Costa Rica	Fourth	Sept. 30-Oct. 1, 1993	Oct. 18, 1993	CRC/C/15/Add.11
Croatia	Eleventh	Jan. 23-24, 1996	Feb. 13, 1996	CRC/C/15/Add.52
Cuba	Fifteenth	May 21-22, 1997	Jun. 18, 1997	CRC/C/15/Add.72
Cyprus	Twelfth	Jun. 4-5, 1996	Jun. 7, 1996	CRC/C/15/Add.59
Czech Republic	Sixteenth	Sept. 30-Oct. 1, 1997	Oct. 10, 1997	CRC/C/15/Add.81

TABLE II (CONTINUED)

	COMMITTEE SESSION	DATE OF SESSION	DATE OF CONCLUDING OBSERVATIONS	DOCUMENT NUMBER
Denmark	Eighth	Jan. 19-20, 1995	Feb. 15, 1995	CRC/C/15/Add.33
Egypt	Third	Jan. 25-26, 1993	Feb. 18, 1993	CRC/C/15/Add.5
El Salvador	Fourth	Sept. 27-28, 1993	Oct. 18, 1993	CRC/C/15/Add.9
Ethiopia	Fourteenth	Jan. 9-10, 1997	Jan. 24, 1997	CRC/C/15/Add.67
Federal Republic of Yugoslavia	Eleventh	Jan. 15, 1996	Feb. 13, 1996	CRC/C/15/Add.49
Finland	Eleventh	Jan. 23-24, 1996	Feb. 13, 1996	CRC/C/15/Add.53
France	Sixth	Apr. 11-12, 1994	Apr. 25, 1994	CRC/C/15/Add.20
Germany	Tenth	Nov. 6-7, 1995	Nov. 27, 1995	CRC/C/15/Add.43
Ghana	Fifteenth	May 22-23, 1997	Jun. 18, 1997	CRC/C/15/Add.73
Guatemala	Twelfth	Jun. 3-4, 1996	Jun. 7, 1996	CRC/C/15/Add.58
Holy See	Tenth	Nov. 14, 1995	Nov. 27, 1995	CRC/C/15/Add.46
Honduras	Seventh	Sept. 27-28, 1994	Oct. 24, 1994	CRC/C/15/Add.24
Iceland	Eleventh	Jan. 16-17, 1996	Feb. 13, 1996	CRC/C/15/Add.50
Indonesia (Preliminary)	Fourth	Sept. 22-23, 1993	Oct. 18, 1993	CRC/C/15/Add.7
Indonesia	Seventh	Sept. 28-29, 1994	Oct. 24, 1994	CRC/C/15/Add.25
Italy	Tenth	Oct. 31-Nov. 1, 1995	Nov. 27, 1995	CRC/C/15/Add.41
Jamaica	Eighth	Jan. 18-19, 1995	Feb. 15, 1995	CRC/C/15/Add.32
Jordan	Sixth	Apr. 13-14, 1994	Apr. 25, 1994	CRC/C/15/Add.21
Lao People's Democratic Republic	Sixteenth	Sept. 23-24, 1997	Oct. 10, 1997	CRC/C/15/Add.78
Lebanon	Twelfth	May 20-21, 1996	Jun. 7, 1996	CRC/C/15/Add.54
Madagascar	Seventh	Sept. 29-30, 1994	Oct. 14, 1994	CRC/C/15/Add.26
Mauritius	Thirteenth	Oct. 3-4, 1996	Oct. 30, 1996	CRC/C/15/Add.64

TABLE II (CONTINUED)

	COMMITTEE SESSION	DATE OF SESSION	DATE OF CONCLUDING OBSERVATIONS	DOCUMENT NUMBER
Mexico	Fifth	Jan. 11, 1994	Feb. 7, 1994	CRC/C/15/Add.13
Mongolia	Eleventh	Jan. 10-11, 1996	Feb. 13, 1996	CRC/C/15/Add.48
Morocco	Thirteenth	Sept. 24-25, 1996	Oct. 30, 1996	CRC/C/15/Add.60
Myanmar	Fourteenth	Jan. 15-16, 1997	Jan. 24, 1997	CRC/C/15/Add.69
Namibia	Fifth	Jan. 13, 1994	Feb. 7, 1994	CRC/C/15/Add.14
Nepal	Twelfth	May 29-30, 1996	Jun. 7, 1996	CRC/C/15/Add.57
New Zealand	Fourteenth	Jan. 20-21, 1997	Jan. 24, 1997	CRC/C/15/Add.71
Nicaragua	Ninth	May 22-23, 1995	Jun. 20, 1995	CRC/C/15/Add.36
Nigeria	Thirteenth	Sept. 26-27, 1996	Oct. 30, 1996	CRC/C/15/Add.61
Norway	Sixth	Apr. 18-19, 1994	Apr. 25, 1994	CRC/C/15/Add.23
Pakistan	Sixth	Apr. 5-6, 1994	Apr. 25, 1994	CRC/C/15/Add.18
Panama	Fourteenth	Jan. 13-14, 1997	Jan. 24, 1997	CRC/C/15/Add.68
Paraguay (Preliminary)	Seventh	Oct. 4-5, 1994	Oct. 24, 1994	CRC/C/15/Add.27
Paraguay	Fifteenth	May 28, 1997	Jun. 18, 1997	CRC/C/15/Add.75
Peru	Fourth	Sept. 23-24, 1993	Oct. 18, 1993	CRC/C/15/Add.8
Philippines	Eighth	Jan. 10-11, 1995	Feb. 15, 1995	CRC/C/15/Add.29
Poland	Eighth	Jan. 16-17, 1995	Feb. 15, 1995	CRC/C/15/Add.31
Portugal	Tenth	Nov. 9-10, 1995	Nov. 27, 1995	CRC/C/15/Add.45
Republic of Korea	Eleventh	Jan. 18-19, 1996	Feb. 13, 1996	CRC/C/15/Add.51
Romania	Fifth	Jan. 20-21, 1994	Feb. 7, 1994	CRC/C/15/Add.16
Russian Federation	Third	Jan. 21-22, 1993	Feb. 18, 1993	CRC/C/15/Add.4
Rwanda (Preliminary)	Fourth	Oct. 5, 1993	Oct. 18, 1993	CRC/C/15/Add.12

TABLE II (CONTINUED)

	COMMITTEE SESSION	DATE OF SESSION	DATE OF CONCLUDING OBSERVATIONS	DOCUMENT NUMBER
Senegal	Tenth	Nov. 8-9, 1995	Nov. 27, 1995	CRC/C/15/Add.44
Slovenia	Thirteenth	Oct. 9, 1996	Oct. 30, 1996	CRC/C/15/Add.65
Spain	Seventh	Oct. 6-7, 1994	Oct. 24, 1994	CRC/C/15/Add.28
Sri Lanka	Ninth	Jun. 5-6, 1995	Jun. 21, 1995	CRC/C/15/Add.40
Sudan	Fourth	Sept. 29, 1993	Oct. 18, 1993	CRC/C/15/Add.10
Sudan (Preliminary)	Third	Jan. 26-27, 1993	Feb. 18, 1993	CRC/C/15/Add.6
Sweden	Third	Jan. 18-19, 1993	Feb. 18, 1993	CRC/C/15/Add.2
Syrian Arab Republic	Fourteenth	Jan. 16-17, 1997	Jan. 24, 1997	CRC/C/15/Add.70
Togo	Sixteenth	Oct. 7-8, 1997	Oct. 10, 1997	CRC/C/15/Add.83
Trinidad and Tobago	Sixteenth	Oct. 2-3, 1997	Oct. 10, 1997	CRC/C/15/Add.82
Tunisia	Ninth	Jun. 1-2, 1995	Jun. 21, 1995	CRC/C/15/Add.39
Uganda	Sixteenth	Sept. 29-30, 1997	Oct. 10, 1997	CRC/C/15/Add.80
Ukraine	Tenth	Nov. 2-3, 1995	Nov. 27, 1995	CRC/C/15/Add.42
United Kingdom	Eighth	Jan. 24-25, 1995	Feb. 15, 1995	CRC/C/15/Add.34
United Kingdom: Hong Kong	Thirteenth	Oct. 2-3, 1996	Oct. 30, 1996	CRC/C/15/Add.63
Uruguay	Thirteenth	Sept. 30-Oct. 1, 1996	Oct. 11, 1996	CRC/C/15/Add.62
Viet Nam	Third	Jan. 19-20, 1993	Feb. 18, 1993	CRC/C/15/Add.3
Yemen	Eleventh	Jan. 9-10, 1996	Feb. 13, 1996	CRC/C/15/Add.47
Zimbabwe	Twelfth	May 22-23, 1996	Jun. 7, 1996	CRC/C/15/Add.55

TABLE III: CONCLUDING OBSERVATIONS OF THE COMMITTEE ON THE RIGHTS OF THE CHILD
THIRD SESSION: JANUARY 1993‡

Reporting Guidelines Paragraph and Other Issues (Convention Article Number)	Bolivia		Egypt		Russian Federation		Sudan ^P		Sweden		Viet Nam	
	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-
9a - harmonize national law/policy	4	6, 13	4		3		4	7	4	10		
9b - coordinate national and local policies/monitoring		7, 13	4		3	16, 17				10	4	
10/11 - publicize Convention (art. 42)		17, 18		16	3		5		4			8
12 - definition of child (art. 1)		8, 9, 11		15		9				8, 11		
13a - nondiscrimination (art. 2)		9, 11, 14		6, 12		8, 13				7, 9		6, 7
13b - best interests (art. 3)		9, 14		14		8				10, 12		
13c - life, survival, development (art. 6)		9										
13d - respect for views of child (art. 12)		9										
15a - name/nationality/registration (art. 7)												
15b - preservation of identity (art. 8)												

‡ This key applies to Tables III through XVI:

Numbers in grid represent paragraph numbers in Concluding Observations

* Reservation withdrawn after Committee's comments

+ Committee noted with approval

- Committee noted with concern or made recommendation

R Committee noted specific reservation

D Committee noted specific declaration

P Preliminary Observations

TABLE III (CONTINUED)

Reporting Guidelines Paragraph and Other Issues (Convention Article Number)	Bolivia		Egypt		Russian Federation		Sudan ^P		Sweden		Viet Nam	
	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-
19a - survival/development (art. 6, ¶2)		10										
19b - disabled children (art. 23)				7, 13		6, 9		10				
19c - health, health services (art. 24)		9, 10		11, 13		12, 20						6
19d - social security, child care services (art. 26, 18 ¶3)						6						
19e - standard of living (art. 27, ¶1-3)		5										
20/22 - cooperation with organizations	4	17			3	17, 20			4, 5	10		9
21a - education, vocational training (art. 28)		9, 10		6, 7, 9, 10, 12, 18								6
21b - aims of education (art. 29)												
21c - leisure, recreation (art. 31)						14						
23a(i) - refugees (art. 22)								10				
23a(ii) - armed conflict (art. 38, 39)								9		8, 11		
23b(i) - administration of juvenile justice (art. 40)		11, 16		8, 14		14, 22		11		12		6, 8
23b(ii) - deprivation of liberty (art. 37b-d)		11		8, 14		14, 22				9, 12		6, 8
23b(iii) - sentencing (art. 37a)		11		8, 14		14, 22						8
23b(iv) - recovery/reintegration (art. 39)				8, 14		24						8
23c(i) - child labor (art. 32)				9, 15				12				

TABLE III (CONTINUED)

Reporting Guidelines Paragraph and Other Issues (Convention Article Number)	Bolivia		Egypt		Russian Federation		Sudan ^p		Sweden		Viet Nam	
	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-
23c(ii) – drug abuse (art. 33)						15						
23c(iii) – sexual exploitation/abuse (art. 34)		9				15, 24		13		8, 9, 11		6
23c(iv) – other exploitation (art. 36)		9										
23c(v) – sale, trafficking, abduction (art. 35)		9						13				
23d – minorities/indigenous groups (art. 30)		9, 10, 14										6, 7
allocation of resources (art. 4)		10, 18		5	4	8, 16		8	5	10		6, 8
training of professionals who have contact with children		17		16	3	12, 19, 23						
corporal punishment												
abortion						10, 12						
teen pregnancy												
family planning/sex education						12, 20						
youth suicide												
family breakdown/divorce rate/single parents						10						

TABLE IV: CONCLUDING OBSERVATIONS OF THE COMMITTEE ON THE RIGHTS OF THE CHILD
FOURTH SESSION: SEPTEMBER 1993‡

Reporting Guidelines Paragraph and Other Issues (Convention Article Number)	Costa Rica		El Salvador		Indonesia ^P		Peru		Rwanda ^P		Sudan	
	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-
9a - harmonize national law/policy		7, 11	4	8								
9b - coordinate national and local policies/monitoring	4	7, 12		8				4	15	4		10
10/11 - publicize Convention (art. 42)	4	9, 16						4	21			16
12 - definition of child (art. 1)				10								18
13a - nondiscrimination (art. 2)		9, 13, 14, 16		10, 12, 18, 19								12, 21
13b - best interests (art. 3)		13		10					19			8, 12, 21
13c - life, survival, development (art. 6)									7			12, 21
13d - respect for views of child (art. 12)		13		18								12, 21
15a - name/nationality/registration (art. 7)												

‡ This key applies to Tables III through XVI:

Numbers in grid represent paragraph numbers in Concluding Observations

* Reservation withdrawn after Committee's comments

+ Committee noted with approval

- Committee noted with concern or made recommendation

R Committee noted specific reservation

D Committee noted specific declaration

P Preliminary Observations

TABLE IV (CONTINUED)

Reporting Guidelines Paragraph and Other Issues (Convention Article Number)	Costa Rica		El Salvador		Indonesia ^p		Peru		Rwanda ^p		Sudan	
	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-
15b – preservation of identity (art. 8)												
15c – freedom of expression (art. 13)							8, 17					
15d – access to information (art. 17)												
15e – freedom of thought, conscience, religion (art. 14)							7(R), 9					
15f – freedom of association, assembly (art. 15)							17					
15g – privacy (art. 16)							7(R)					
15h – torture, death penalty (art. 37a)								16			4	16
16a – parental guidance (art. 5)	13											
16b – parental responsibilities (art. 18, ¶ 1-2)	16											
16c – separation from parents (art. 9)												
16d – family reunification (art. 10)												
16e – recovery of maintenance (art. 27, ¶ 4)												
16f – deprivation of family environment (art. 20)												
16g – adoption (art. 21)		10, 13					7(R)					
16h – illicit transfer and non-return (art. 11)												
16i – abuse/neglect (art. 19, 39)		9, 16		12, 19			15					
16j – review of placement (art. 25)												
19a – survival/development (art. 6, ¶2)								7				

TABLE IV (CONTINUED)

Reporting Guidelines Paragraph and Other Issues (Convention Article Number)	Costa Rica		El Salvador		Indonesia ^p		Peru		Rwanda ^p		Sudan	
	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-
19b - disabled children (art. 23)				18, 19				10, 19				13
19c - health, health services (art. 24)						14		10				13, 22, 23
19d - social security, child care services (art. 26, 18 ¶3)		13		19								
19e - standard of living (art. 27, ¶1-3)		8		6				10, 12, 19				9
20/22 - cooperation with organizations				20		12		15			6	20
21a - education, vocational training (art. 28)						14		10				23
21b - aims of education (art. 29)						7(R)		21				
21c - leisure, recreation (art. 31)												
23a(i) - refugees (art. 22)				19		7(R)		7, 10, 19			7	14, 24
23a(ii) - armed conflict (art. 38, 39)				6, 10, 11				5, 7, 8, 10, 16, 17, 19				8
23b(i) - administration of juvenile justice (art. 40)		15				16, 17		9, 18				15, 18, 26
23b(ii) - deprivation of liberty (art. 37b-d)						16, 17		18				15, 26
23b(iii) - sentencing (art. 37a)						16, 17		18				15, 26
23b(iv) - recovery/reintegration (art. 39)		15		19		16, 17		16, 18				15, 26
23c(i) - child labor (art. 32)		13		14		18		11, 20				14, 25
23c(ii) - drug abuse (art. 33)												
23c(iii) - sexual exploitation/abuse (art. 34)		9						10				

TABLE IV (CONTINUED)

Reporting Guidelines Paragraph and Other Issues (Convention Article Number)	Costa Rica		El Salvador		Indonesia ^P		Peru		Rwanda ^P		Sudan	
	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-
23c(iv) – other exploitation (art. 36)								12				
23c(v) – sale, trafficking, abduction (art. 35)							7, 16					
23d – minorities/indigenous groups (art. 30)												
allocation of resources (art. 4)		6, 8, 13		7		14		10, 19				
training of professionals who have contact with children	4			13		12		21				11, 19
corporal punishment												
abortion												
teen pregnancy		10, 16										
family planning/sex education												
youth suicide												
family breakdown/divorce rate/single parents								11				

TABLE V: CONCLUDING OBSERVATIONS OF THE COMMITTEE ON THE RIGHTS OF THE CHILD
FIFTH SESSION: JANUARY 1994†

Reporting Guidelines Paragraph and Other Issues (Convention Article Number)	Belarus		Colombia ^p		Mexico		Namibia		Romania	
	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-
9a - harmonize national law/policy	3	6, 11	3	6	4	7, 15		6, 13	3	8, 14
9b - coordinate national and local policies/monitoring		6, 11		12, 16		7, 15	3, 15		3	8, 12, 13, 22
10/11 - publicize Convention (art. 42)		17			5	19	3	22		22
12 - definition of child (art. 1)		6		9, 13				6		8
13a - nondiscrimination (art. 2)		11		6, 11, 15		7, 18		7, 15		6, 10, 14, 21
13b - best interests (art. 3)		11, 16		11		7, 16				7, 14
13c - life, survival, development (art. 6)		11		7, 10						
13d - respect for views of child (art. 12)		11				18	3			14
15a - name/nationality/registration (art. 7)										
15b - preservation of identity (art. 8)										
15c - freedom of expression (art. 13)										

† This key applies to Tables III through XVI:

Numbers in grid represent paragraph numbers in Concluding Observations

* Reservation withdrawn after Committee's comments

+ Committee noted with approval

- Committee noted with concern or made recommendation

R Committee noted specific reservation

D Committee noted specific declaration

P Preliminary Observations

TABLE V (CONTINUED)

Reporting Guidelines Paragraph and Other Issues (Convention Article Number)	Belarus		Colombia ^P		Mexico		Namibia		Romania	
	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-
15d – access to information (art. 17)										
15e – freedom of thought, conscience, religion (art. 14)										
15f – freedom of association, assembly (art. 15)										
15g – privacy (art. 16)										
15h – torture, death penalty (art. 37a)				7						
16a – parental guidance (art. 5)						8				
16b – parental responsibilities (art. 18, ¶ 1-2)		6		16			8, 22			15
16c – separation from parents (art. 9)										
16d – family reunification (art. 10)										
16e – recovery of maintenance (art. 27, ¶ 4)										
16f – deprivation of family environment (art. 20)		8							4	19
16g – adoption (art. 21)		8, 12				14, 18				18
16h – illicit transfer and non-return (art. 11)										
16i – abuse/neglect (art. 19, 39)				15		6, 10, 17, 18				9, 15
16j – review of placement (art. 25)										
19a – survival/development (art. 6, ¶2)			4	7, 10						
19b – disabled children (art. 23)										19
19c – health, health services (art. 24)		5, 9, 14	4	8, 11	4				4	

TABLE V (CONTINUED)

Reporting Guidelines Paragraph and Other Issues (Convention Article Number)	Belarus		Colombia ^P		Mexico		Namibia		Romania	
	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-
19a - social security, child care services (art. 26; 18 19)		7, 15						17		4
19e - standard of living (art. 27, ¶1-3)		5		5, 8		6		5		6
20/22 - cooperation with organizations		12, 18	3	13, 16		15, 19	3	12, 15, 20	5	23
21a - education, vocational training (art. 28)				8, 11, 15	4	13	3	9, 10, 18		10, 21
21b - aims of education (art. 29)										10
21c - leisure, recreation (art. 31)										
23a(i) - refugees (art. 22)										
23a(ii) - armed conflict (art. 38, 39)				5		6				
23b(i) - administration of juvenile justice (art. 40)		10		7, 14	4	11		11, 20		20
23b(ii) - deprivation of liberty (art. 37b-d)				14				11, 20		20
23b(iii) - sentencing (art. 37a)				14				11, 20		20
23b(iv) - recovery/reintegration (art. 39)		14		14						
23c(i) - child labor (art. 32)		10, 16		9, 13		12		10, 21		14
23c(ii) - drug abuse (art. 33)		10						17		9
23c(iii) - sexual exploitation/abuse (art. 34)		10						17		9
23c(iv) - other exploitation (art. 36)				10						
23c(v) - sale, trafficking, abduction (art. 35)				7						

TABLE V (CONTINUED)

<i>Reporting Guidelines Paragraph and Other Issues (Convention Article Number)</i>	<i>Belarus</i>		<i>Colombia^p</i>		<i>Mexico</i>		<i>Namibia</i>		<i>Romania</i>	
	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-
23d – minorities/indigenous groups (art. 30)				8, 12		6, 9, 13, 16, 18				10, 21
allocation of resources (art. 4)		11		11		6, 7, 16				7
training of professionals who have contact with children		14		16				17, 18, 20	4	11, 17, 20
corporal punishment										
abortion		9								15
teen pregnancy				15				8		
family planning/sex education		6, 14						17		15
youth suicide										
family breakdown/divorce rate/single parents		13		15				7, 8		9

TABLE VI: CONCLUDING OBSERVATIONS OF THE COMMITTEE ON THE RIGHTS OF THE CHILD
SIXTH SESSION: APRIL 1994‡

Reporting Guidelines Paragraph and Other Issues (Convention Article Number)	Burkina Faso		Chile		France		Jordan		Norway		Pakistan*	
	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-
9a - harmonize national law/policy	3	15	6, 7	14		12	4	10, 18		8, 14		11, 12, 23
9b - coordinate national and local policies/monitoring	3	7, 18	7	15		18, 19		19, 20	3, 4, 6	17		10, 11, 24, 25
10/11 - publicize Convention (art. 42)				18				29		20, 26		14, 27
12 - definition of child (art. 1)				17		22		10, 11, 14, 16, 28				16, 23
13a - non-discrimination (art. 2)		8, 9, 14				22		8, 11, 22, 25	7	12, 23	6	8, 12, 15, 16, 19, 27, 30
13b - best interests (art. 3)		12		14, 17	6	27				12		15, 26
13c - life, survival, development (art. 6)		6					5					15
13d - respect for views of child (art. 12)					7	23		24		22		15

‡ This key applies to Tables III through XVI:

Numbers in grid represent paragraph numbers in Concluding Observations

* Reservation withdrawn after Committee's comments

+ Committee noted with approval

- Committee noted with concern or made recommendation

R Committee noted specific reservation

D Committee noted specific declaration

P Preliminary Observations

TABLE VI (CONTINUED)

Reporting Guidelines Paragraph and Other Issues (Convention Article Number)	Burkina Faso		Chile		France		Jordan		Norway		Pakistan [†]	
	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-
15a – name/nationality/registration (art. 7)						14		11		10		
15b – preservation of identity (art. 8)												
15c – freedom of expression (art. 13)					7		24					
15d – access to information (art. 17)					8							
15e – freedom of thought, conscience, religion (art. 14)								9(R), 12, 17(R)		9, 23		
15f – freedom of association, assembly (art. 15)												
15g – privacy (art. 16)										9, 23		
15h – torture, death penalty (art. 37a)		11								15		12, 23
16a – parental guidance (art. 5)												
16b – parental responsibilities (art. 18, ¶ 1-2)												
16c – separation from parents (art. 9)												
16d – family reunification (art. 10)										11, 24		
16e – recovery of maintenance (art. 27, ¶ 4)												
16f – deprivation of family environment (art. 20)											9(R), 17(R)	
16g – adoption (art. 21)											9(R), 17(R)	
16h – illicit transfer and non-return (art. 11)												
16i – abuse/neglect (art. 19, 39)		9, 14		16		24		15, 23				28

TABLE VI (CONTINUED)

Reporting Guidelines Paragraph and Other Issues (Convention Article Number)	Burkina Faso		Chile		France		Jordan		Norway		Pakistan*	
	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-
16) - review of placement (art. 25)												
19a - survival/development (art. 6, ¶2)		6					5					
19b - disabled children (art. 23)		9	8									17, 29
19c - health, health services (art. 24)		6, 8, 10, 14	8	12			5		12, 24			18, 27, 29
19d - social security, child care services (art. 26; 18 ¶3)					20	20		23				
19e - standard of living (art. 27, ¶1-3)		6		10								8
20/22 - cooperation with organizations	4	18	6	17	5, 9	21		19, 29	3		7	27, 30, 32, 34
21a - education, vocational training (art. 28)		6, 8	8	12				14, 25		12, 24		8, 16, 19, 30
21b - aims of education (art. 29)								24, 25		21		
21c - leisure, recreation (art. 31)												
23a(i) - refugees (art. 22)						15		7, 13, 26		11, 12, 16, 24	33	8
23a(ii) - armed conflict (art. 38, 39)					10		6					
23b(i) - administration of juvenile justice (art. 40)	3	11, 15		17	7	16, 26	10, 16, 27			5(R)*, 13(R)*, 25		20, 31
23b(ii) - deprivation of liberty (art. 37b-d)		11, 17		17		16, 26	16, 27					20, 23
23b(iii) - sentencing (art. 37a)		11		17		16, 26	27		15			20

TABLE VI (CONTINUED)

Reporting Guidelines Paragraph and Other Issues (Convention Article Number)	Burkina Faso		Chile		France		Jordan		Norway		Pakistan*	
	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-
23b(iv) – recovery/reintegration (art. 39)			11			26		27				20, 32
23c(i) – child labor (art. 32)	3	13				27		14, 28				21, 30, 32
23c(ii) – drug abuse (art. 33)												
23c(iii) – sexual exploitation/abuse (art. 34)												
23c(iv) – other exploitation (art. 36)												
23c(v) – sale, trafficking, abduction (art. 35)												21
23d – minorities/indigenous groups (art. 30)												
allocation of resources (art. 4)		18							6			13, 26
training of professionals who have contact with children		12, 16, 17, 18		16, 18	8			21		19		27, 28, 29
corporal punishment												
abortion						24						
teen pregnancy												
family planning/sex education		8, 14										29
youth suicide												
family breakdown/divorce rate/single parents										17		
										18		

TABLE VII: CONCLUDING OBSERVATIONS OF THE COMMITTEE ON THE RIGHTS OF THE CHILD
SEVENTH SESSION: SEPTEMBER 1994‡

Reporting Guidelines Paragraph and Other Issues (Convention Article Number)	Honduras		Indonesia		Madagascar		Paraguay ^P		Spain	
	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-
9a - harmonize national law/policy			4	8, 18		7, 18	3			18
9b - coordinate national and local policies/monitoring	4, 5	21	4	8, 19	4	10, 19		5, 9		7, 12, 13
10/11 - publicize Convention (art. 42)		10, 23, 36		10, 25, 26		17, 23		6		16, 25
12 - definition of child (art. 1)		32, 35	5(R)	9				7		
13a - nondiscrimination (art. 2)		11, 20, 24		9, 11, 13, 22, 18		8, 9		7, 8	6	16
13b - best interests (art. 3)		13, 20, 26		11, 18		9, 22		7, 9, 11		14
13c - life, survival, development (art. 6)		15, 20						7		
13d - respect for views of child (art. 12)		11, 13, 20, 23, 26		11				7, 11		
15a - name/nationality/registration (art. 7)		12, 25				10		10		

‡ This key applies to Tables III through XVI:

Numbers in grid represent paragraph numbers in Concluding Observations

* Reservation withdrawn after Committee's comments

+ Committee noted with approval

- Committee noted with concern or made recommendation

R Committee noted specific reservation

D Committee noted specific declaration

P Preliminary Observations

TABLE VIII: CONCLUDING OBSERVATIONS OF THE COMMITTEE ON THE RIGHTS OF THE CHILD
EIGHTH SESSION: JANUARY 1995†

Reporting Guidelines Paragraph and Other Issues (Convention Article Number)	Argentina		Colombia		Denmark		Jamaica		Philippines		Poland		United Kingdom	
	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-
9a - harmonize national law/policy	6		3	8		10, 24	3	7, 18	4	8, 18		13, 25, 29, 35	3	24
9b - coordinate national and local policies/monitoring	4	9, 15	3	9, 10, 14, 15, 18, 21	4, 6	10, 17, 18, 19, 20, 21	3	8, 19		9, 19, 20	6	14, 15, 16, 20, 22, 35		8, 23
10/11 - publicize Convention (art. 42)	5	22		25		9, 22, 33		21, 31		20, 28	5	17, 26, 36		26, 41
12 - definition of child (art. 1)		10		13, 19		32		7, 18, 29		8, 18, 26		13		17
13a - nondiscrimination (art. 2)		10		12, 21	7	14, 24, 25, 29, 30		7, 11, 22		8, 12, 15, 18, 23		10, 12, 24, 27, 29		7(R), 11, 12, 22(R), 28

† This key applies to Tables III through XVI:

Numbers in grid represent paragraph numbers in Concluding Observations

* Reservation withdrawn after Committee's comments

+ Committee noted with approval

- Committee noted with concern or made recommendation

R Committee noted specific reservation

D Committee noted specific declaration

P Preliminary Observations

TABLE VIII (CONTINUED)

Reporting Guidelines Paragraph and Other Issues (Convention Article Number)	Argentina		Colombia		Denmark		Jamaica		Philippines		Poland		United Kingdom	
	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-
13b – best interests (art. 3)				16		10, 14, 19, 24		7, 9, 19, 30				11, 12, 29		7(R), 11, 15, 18, 22(R), 24, 27, 31
13c – life, survival, development (art. 6)			5	12, 17		24	7						4	11, 13
13d – respect for views of child (art. 12)		21				10, 24	7					12, 21(D), 29		11, 14, 27, 32
15a – name/nationality/registration (art. 7)						11	10, 23			11		21(R)		12, 29
15b – preservation of identity (art. 8)														12
15c – freedom of expression (art. 13)						10, 24								
15d – access to information (art. 17)							7, 12							
15e – freedom of thought, conscience, religion (art. 14)														
15f – freedom of association, assembly (art. 15)						10, 24								
15g – privacy (art. 16)												21(D)		
15h – torture, death penalty (art. 37a)				12						8, 18		20, 30		
16a – parental guidance (art. 5)							13							
16b – parental responsibilities (art. 18, ¶ 1- 2)		19				26	7, 13, 16, 24			22		33		30

TABLE VIII (CONTINUED)

Reporting Guidelines Paragraph and Other Issues (Convention Article Number)	Argentina		Colombia		Denmark		Jamaica		Philippines		Poland		United Kingdom	
	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-
16c - separation from parents (art. 9)														7(R), 22(R)
16d - family reunification (art. 10)				13, 30										7(R), 22(R)
16e - recovery of maintenance (art. 27, ¶ 4)												33		
16f - deprivation of family environment (art. 20)												34		
16g - adoption (art. 21)						27						29	5	
16h - illicit transfer and non-return (art. 11)														
16i - abuse/neglect (art. 19, 39)		12, 20		12, 17, 21		28	3	7, 13, 18, 25, 26		13, 14, 16, 24		18, 20		10, 15, 31, 39
16j - review of placement (art. 25)												34		
19a - survival/development (art. 6, ¶2)			5	12, 17									4	
19b - disabled children (art. 23)		11				19		11, 22		23				
19c - health, health services (art. 24)	7	19	5	11, 16		14, 30	27	7, 14, 27					4	11, 13, 25
19d - social security, child care services (art. 26; 18 ¶3)						12, 26	20	20, 24				16, 25, 33		11, 15
19e - standard of living (art. 27, ¶1-3)		11		11, 17				5, 9, 20		16		9, 33		15, 24, 25

TABLE VIII (CONTINUED)

Reporting Guidelines Paragraph and Other Issues (Convention Article Number)	Argentina		Colombia		Denmark		Jamaica		Philippines		Poland		United Kingdom	
	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-
20/22 – cooperation with organizations		15	4	19, 21, 23, 24		18, 19	3, 4	15, 18, 19, 23, 25, 28, 29, 30		19, 22, 24, 26, 27		22, 31, 35		23, 42
21a – education, vocational training (art. 28)	7	13, 21	5	11, 16, 20		14, 30		25, 28		8, 15			5	11, 15, 31, 32, 33
21b – aims of education (art. 29)				20		29								31, 32
21c – leisure, recreation (art. 31)														
23a(i) – refugees (art. 22)						7	13, 14, 22, 25, 30					31		
23a(ii) – armed conflict (art. 38, 39)	3			7						6, 12, 15		21(R)		
23b(i) – administration of juvenile justice (art. 40)		18		18		8(R), 16(R), 31		7, 17, 18, 30		8, 17, 18, 27		13, 19, 32		7(R)*, 17, 18, 20, 22(R)*; 34, 35, 36
23b(ii) – deprivation of liberty (art. 37b-d)				12, 18				17, 30		8, 27		19, 32		7(R)*, 10, 17, 18, 19, 22(R)*, 36
23b(iii) – sentencing (art. 37a)				18				17, 30		27		19, 32		15, 18, 31

TABLE VIII (CONTINUED)

Reporting Guidelines Paragraph and Other Issues (Convention Article Number)	Argentina		Colombia		Denmark		Jamaica		Philippines		Poland		United Kingdom	
	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-
23b(iv) – recovery/reintegration (art. 39)			18	32			25		14		30, 32			18, 39
23c(i) – child labor (art. 32)			13, 19	15, 32			7, 16, 18, 29		8, 26					37(R)
23c(ii) – drug abuse (art. 33)											20			38, 39
23c(iii) – sexual exploitation/abuse (art. 34)		12		15, 32	3	15, 32	7, 11, 13, 25		8, 13, 18, 24		20		4	15, 38, 39
23c(iv) – other exploitation (art. 36)									16		20, 30			
23c(v) – sale, trafficking, abduction (art. 35)			12, 17											
23d – minorities/indigenous groups (art. 30)			11, 15	7	22		11, 22		10, 23		17, 27			12, 13, 25, 40
allocation of resources (art. 4)		16	16	19, 20		19, 20	9, 19, 20		10, 21		11, 24			9, 21, 24
training of professionals who have contact with children		17, 18	22	23		23	21		22, 27		17, 28			26, 32
corporal punishment														
abortion							7				18, 30, 32			15, 31, 32
teen pregnancy		19	21				13							15, 30
family planning/sex education							24							14
youth suicide						21								
family breakdown/divorce rate/single parents		12	21	12, 26		12, 26	11, 13		13		33			15

TABLE IX: CONCLUDING OBSERVATIONS OF THE COMMITTEE ON THE RIGHTS OF THE CHILD
NINTH SESSION: JUNE 1995†

Reporting Guidelines Paragraph and Other Issues (Convention Article Number)	Belgium		Canada		Nicaragua		Sri Lanka		Tunisia	
	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-
9a - harmonize national law/policy	5, 6	15	4, 5	11, 23	3, 4	26	3, 27	8, 25, 27	4	14
9b - coordinate national and local policies/monitoring	5	8, 13, 14	6	9, 11, 20	3, 5	11, 12, 27, 28, 29	3	9, 10, 29, 41	4	8, 12, 13
10/11 - publicize Convention (art. 42)	21	17, 21	5	19, 27		10, 31, 41		43		11, 18
12 - definition of child (art. 1)						14, 13, 26, 38		11, 22, 28, 40, 41		9, 15
13a - nondiscrimination (art. 2)		9, 10, 12(D)		9, 11, 13, 22, 23, 24		13, 15, 31, 32		8, 11, 12, 25, 28		6(R), 7, 10(R), 14
13b - best interests (art. 3)		9, 10		11, 13, 21, 25		13, 32		8, 11, 25		7, 14
13c - life, survival, development (art. 6)				26		13, 19, 35				
13d - respect for views of child (art. 12)		16		3, 11, 23, 24		33		8, 13, 31, 40		7, 14

† This key applies to Tables III through XVI:

Numbers in grid represent paragraph numbers in Concluding Observations

* Reservation withdrawn after Committee's comments

+ Committee noted with approval

- Committee noted with concern or made recommendation

R Committee noted specific reservation

D Committee noted specific declaration

P Preliminary Observations

TABLE IX (CONTINUED)

Reporting Guidelines Paragraph and Other Issues (Convention Article Number)	Belgium		Canada		Nicaragua		Sri Lanka		Tunisia	
	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-
15a - name/nationality/registration (art. 7)						16		14		6(R), 10
15b - preservation of identity (art. 8)		9								
15c - freedom of expression (art. 13)		12(D)				33		31		7
15d - access to information (art. 17)				15		17, 34				
15e - freedom of thought, conscience, religion (art. 14)		12(D)								
15f - freedom of association, assembly (art. 15)		12(D)				33		31		
15g - privacy (art. 16)						34				
15h - torture, death penalty (art. 37a)		15								
16a - parental guidance (art. 5)		10				39				
16b - parental responsibilities (art. 18, ¶ 1-2)						20, 37, 38, 39				17
16c - separation from parents (art. 9)				24						
16d - family reunification (art. 10)		19		13, 24						
16e - recovery of maintenance (art. 27, ¶ 4)										
16f - deprivation of family environment (art. 20)		10		14, 25		18		34		
16g - adoption (art. 21)	5			10(R), 16(R)		18, 36	17	17, 35		
16h - illicit transfer and non-return (art. 11)										
16i - abuse/neglect (art. 19, 39)	5			14, 25		22, 30, 35		15, 16, 26, 32, 36		7, 17

TABLE IX (CONTINUED)

Reporting Guidelines Paragraph and Other Issues (Convention Article Number)	Belgium		Canada		Nicaragua		Sri Lanka		Tunisia	
	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-
16j - review of placement (art. 25)						18				
19a - survival/development (art. 6, ¶2)				26		19, 35				
19b - disabled children (art. 23)			7						4	
19c - health, health services (art. 24)		9		12		19, 20, 35, 37		18, 20, 24, 38, 42		
19d - social security, child care services (art. 26; 18 ¶3)			6, 12	12, 21				34, 39		
19e - standard of living (art. 27, ¶1-3)			6	12, 21			8, 12, 20			
20/22 - cooperation with organizations		13	8	20	5	32, 40, 41	3, 5	32, 41		15, 16
21a - education, vocational training (art. 28)		9		12, 14, 17, 25, 26	3	21, 38		13, 15, 20, 21, 31, 38		9
21b - aims of education (art. 29)		17		19		30, 38				
21c - leisure, recreation (art. 31)										
23a(i) - refugees (art. 22)		9, 17, 19	13	13, 24				12, 20, 38		16
23a(ii) - armed conflict (art. 38, 39)						7		6, 12, 24		
23b(i) - administration of juvenile justice (art. 40)		11, 12(D)	4			23, 39		13, 22, 26, 28, 31, 40		6(R), 10(R)
23b(ii) - deprivation of liberty (art. 37b-d)		11		10(R), 13, 18(R), 24, 25		23, 39		40		

TABLE X: CONCLUDING OBSERVATIONS OF THE COMMITTEE ON THE RIGHTS OF THE CHILD
TENTH SESSION: NOVEMBER 1995†

Reporting Guidelines Paragraph and Other Issues (Convention Article Number)	Germany		Holy See		Italy		Portugal		Senegal		Ukraine	
	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-
9a - harmonize national law/policy	16	16, 21, 28, 35			3	16			4	11, 24	5	8, 17
9b - coordinate national and local policies/monitoring	5, 6	14, 23			4	6, 13, 14	6	9, 19	6	10, 20, 21	4, 6	10, 18, 19, 20
10/11 - publicize Convention (art. 42)		15, 26, 36	5	11		7, 15, 22		10, 27	5	18, 30		15, 21, 32
12 - definition of child (art. 1)										11, 25		8, 17
13a - nondiscrimination (art. 2)	6, 13	13(D), 16, 19, 22(D), 24, 28, 33		8, 14		9, 11, 16, 17		13, 21		11, 12, 23, 24, 25, 28, 29		8, 17, 22
13b - best interests (art. 3)		16, 19, 24, 28, 33		14		9				23, 24, 26		8, 17, 20
13c - life, survival, development (art. 6)					5							12, 17

† This key applies to Tables III through XVI:

Numbers in grid represent paragraph numbers in Concluding Observations

* Reservation withdrawn after Committee's comments

+ Committee noted with approval

- Committee noted with concern or made recommendation

R Committee noted specific reservation

D Committee noted specific declaration

P Preliminary Observations

TABLE X (CONTINUED)

Reporting Guidelines Paragraph and Other Issues (Convention Article Number)	Germany		Holy See		Italy		Portugal		Senegal		Ukraine	
	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-
family planning/sex education				7(R), 9, 10(R)								12, 23, 26
youth suicide												
family breakdown/divorce rate/single parents	31	18				11, 17, 18						10, 11, 26

TABLE XI: CONCLUDING OBSERVATIONS OF THE COMMITTEE ON THE RIGHTS OF THE CHILD
ELEVENTH SESSION: FEBRUARY 1996‡

Reporting Guidelines Paragraph and Other Issues (Convention Articles Number)	Croatia		Finland		Iceland		Republic of Korea		Mongolia		Yemen		Yugoslavia	
	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-
9a - harmonize national law/policy	4, 5	12	5	13	5	13, 14, 21	3	12, 22	5	12, 24				13
9b - coordinate national and local policies/monitoring	5	12, 13, 21, 22	4, 5	11, 12, 22, 23	6, 7	15, 22	4	9, 23, 24	3, 6	10, 11, 18, 19				6, 26
10/11 - publicize Convention (art. 42)	7	23, 28	8	14, 24, 31	6, 8, 17	23, 27		10, 20, 32	7	20, 31			24	24, 42
12 - definition of child (art. 1)								12, 17, 22, 30						41
13a - nondiscrimination (art. 2)	7, 8	19		13, 15, 21		24, 25, 26		12, 15, 20, 22, 25		9, 12, 19, 23, 24, 27				7, 17, 28, 29
13b - best interests (art. 3)		26		10, 13, 15, 17, 21	5	19, 24		8, 12, 22, 25		12, 24				28

‡ This key applies to Tables III through XVI:

Numbers in grid represent paragraph numbers in Concluding Observations

* Reservation withdrawn after Committee's comments

+ Committee noted with approval

- Committee noted with concern or made recommendation

R Committee noted specific reservation

D Committee noted specific declaration

P Preliminary Observations

TABLE XI (CONTINUED)

Reporting Guidelines Paragraph and Other Issues (Convention Articles Number)	Croatia		Finland		Iceland		Republic of Korea		Mongolia		Yemen		Yugoslavia	
	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-
16c – separation from parents (art. 9)	3 (R)	16, 17				20(D), 26	6	8(R), 19(R)						23(R)*
16d – family reunification (art. 10)														19
16e – recovery of maintenance (art. 27, ¶4)														
16f – deprivation of family environment (art. 20)		16, 17, 25		16, 27										15, 19, 34
16g – adoption (art. 21)			6					15, 22		14, 25				31, 34
16h – illicit transfer and non-return (art. 11)														
16i – abuse/neglect (art. 19, 39)	4			17, 26				15, 28		11, 16, 28				7, 9, 10, 16, 22, 35
16j – review of placement (art. 25)	25													
19a – survival/development (art. 6, ¶2)														
19b – disabled children (art. 23)				12				12, 20, 22		11, 15, 23				17
19c – health, health services (art. 24)			3	16, 27	9					15, 23				5, 7, 8, 17, 36
19d – social security, child care services (art. 26; 18 ¶3)		14	3			16, 19		13, 27						20

TABLE XI (CONTINUED)

Reporting Guidelines Paragraph and Other Issues (Convention Articles Number)	Croatia		Finland		Iceland		Republic of Korea		Mongolia		Yemen		Yugoslavia	
	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-
23c(iii) – sexual exploitation/abuse (art. 34)				17, 19, 26, 29						16, 28				41
23c(iv) – other exploitation (art. 36)														
23c(v) – sale, trafficking, abduction (art. 35)					5									
23d – minorities/indigenous groups (art. 30)		18, 23		12, 18, 24, 28					11			9, 19, 20		7, 10, 11, 18, 28
allocation of resources (art. 4)	6	14	3	10, 21		16, 24	11, 25	10, 21, 31	3	9, 27		13, 20		29, 36, 41
training of professionals who have contact with children		24		17, 26		18, 23				21, 30		11, 17		25, 35, 41
corporal punishment							15, 22							
abortion														
teen pregnancy														
family planning/sex education														
youth suicide				16, 27										
family breakdown/divorce rate/single parents				12		25	15, 27			11				33

TABLE XII: CONCLUDING OBSERVATIONS OF THE COMMITTEE ON THE RIGHTS OF THE CHILD
TWELFTH SESSION: JUNE 1996†

Reporting Guidelines Paragraph and Other Issues (Convention Article Number)	China		Cyprus		Guatemala		Lebanon		Nepal		Zimbabwe	
	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-
9a - harmonize national law/policy	7	25, 27	3	11, 20		12, 15, 18, 25, 32	13	13, 22, 28, 31	3, 6	10, 11, 25, 39	3	11, 22
9b - coordinate national and local policies/monitoring	4, 10	10, 25, 26, 28	5	15, 21, 26	5, 6	11, 13, 27, 28, 42	4, 5, 22	10, 22, 24, 25	4, 6	13, 14, 28, 29	4, 6	14, 23, 24
10/11 - publicize Convention (art. 42)		14, 29, 44		16, 22, 32		14, 29, 43		11, 26, 46	8	26, 27, 41	3	26, 34
12 - definition of child (art. 1)		13, 43		10, 16, 31		15, 26		16, 19, 23		12, 24, 36, 38		12, 13, 32, 33
13a - nondiscrimination (art. 2)	6	12, 14, 15, 34, 35, 36, 40		11, 12, 20, 24, 28		9, 15, 16, 26, 30, 32	8	14, 15, 26, 28, 30	5	10, 11, 12, 25, 26, 30, 32	3	12, 13, 19, 22
13b - best interests (art. 3)		13, 14, 18, 39		11, 14, 20, 30		16, 26, 32		14, 28, 35		11, 25, 30		16, 29

† This key applies to Tables III through XVI:

Numbers in grid represent paragraph numbers in Concluding Observations

+ Reservation withdrawn after Committee's comments

- Committee noted with approval

* Committee noted with concern or made recommendation

R Committee noted specific reservation

D Committee noted specific declaration

P Preliminary Observations

TABLE XII (CONTINUED)

<i>Reporting Guidelines Paragraph and Other Issues (Convention Article Number)</i>	<i>China</i>		<i>Cyprus</i>		<i>Guatemala</i>		<i>Lebanon</i>		<i>Nepal</i>		<i>Zimbabwe</i>	
	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-
16e - recovery of maintenance (art. 27, ¶ 4)												
16f - deprivation of family environment (art. 20)	18	18, 33, 38, 39		15		38		14				17, 29
16g - adoption (art. 21)		38	7	14, 30		19, 21, 34						12, 29
16h - illicit transfer and non-return (art. 11)												
16i - abuse/neglect (art. 19, 39)		16, 33		29		8, 13, 20		37		18, 20, 34		18
16j - review of placement (art. 25)		35				38						25
19a - survival/development (art. 6, ¶2)	5	15, 18, 38				22				35		
19b - disabled children (art. 23)	7	12, 15, 35, 39		15		38	5	10, 39		14, 17, 32		13
19c - health, health services (art. 24)	5	11, 16, 31, 36, 39				22	17, 19, 22, 26, 35, 36	6, 7	10, 12, 16, 19, 34, 38, 39	17, 18, 32		15, 17, 28
19d - social security, child care services (art. 26, 18 ¶3)		11, 12, 32	6			17, 35, 38						15, 28, 29
19e - standard of living (art. 27, ¶1-3)	4					9, 16				9, 14, 20	7	15
20/22 - cooperation with organizations		29, 34, 39, 42	8			27, 28, 29, 35, 40, 41	4	24, 40, 44, 45	5, 7	26, 28, 39, 40	5	23, 32

TABLE XII (CONTINUED)

Reporting Guidelines Paragraph and Other Issues (Convention Article Number)	China		Cyprus		Guatemala		Lebanon		Nepal		Zimbabwe	
	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-
21a - education, vocational training (art. 28)	6, 7	11, 16, 19, 31, 39, 40				9, 19, 23, 36, 37, 41	6, 7, 37	10, 12, 18, 19, 30, 31, 32		12, 17, 32		15, 18, 19, 28, 31, 32
21b - aims of education (art. 29)						30, 33, 37		18, 26, 33		27	8	26
21c - leisure, recreation (art. 31)								36				
23a(i) - refugees (art. 22)						10, 13		3, 40, 41, 45		33		13
23a(ii) - armed conflict (art. 38, 39)			4		7, 9, 39		3, 42, 45					
23b(i) - administration of juvenile justice (art. 40)		13, 22, 42	3	19, 31	15, 24, 26, 40		10, 19, 23, 44		5	24, 38		21, 33
23b(ii) - deprivation of liberty (art. 37b-d)		21, 33, 42		19, 31	26, 40		19, 44			24, 38		21, 25, 33
23b(iii) - sentencing (art. 37a)		21, 42		19, 31	15, 26, 40		19, 44			24, 38		21, 33
23b(iv) - recovery/reintegration (art. 39)		42		31	40		19, 44			18, 23, 38	9	
23c(i) - child labor (art. 32)		43		18	15, 23, 41		20, 23, 43		3, 5	17, 21, 32, 35, 36		20, 32
23c(ii) - drug abuse (art. 33)										23, 35		
23c(iii) - sexual exploitation/abuse (art. 34)		23		15, 18						14, 23, 32, 34, 35	9	
23c(iv) - other exploitation (art. 36)										20, 35		
23c(v) - sale, trafficking, abduction (art. 35)		16, 23, 36			19				5	14, 22, 35, 37		

TABLE XIII: CONCLUDING OBSERVATIONS OF THE COMMITTEE ON THE RIGHTS OF THE CHILD
THIRTEENTH SESSION: OCTOBER 1996‡

Reporting Guidelines Paragraph and Other Issues (Convention Article Number)	Mauritius		Morocco		Nigeria		Slovenia		United Kingdom Hong Kong		Uruguay	
	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-
9a - harmonize national law/policy	5, 8	10, 13, 22	3	11, 24	4, 7	7, 8, 26, 27	3, 5			11, 13, 20		6, 17
9b - coordinate national and local policies/monitoring	4, 7	11, 23, 24, 25	3	8, 9, 21, 22	3	9, 27, 29, 31	4	11, 12, 21		11, 12, 20, 22		7, 8, 18, 19
10/11 - publicize Convention (art. 42)		14, 27, 33		5, 6, 17, 18, 29		11, 30, 44	5, 7	22, 28		20, 23, 33		16, 26, 27
12 - definition of child (art. 1)				12, 24, 25		7, 15, 22, 36, 39		19, 27		19, 34		6, 15, 25
13a - nondiscrimination (art. 2)		12, 13, 29		10, 11, 13, 23, 25	5	10, 12, 15, 34, 35, 38		13, 24	4	24		10, 11, 14, 20, 26
13b - best interests (art. 3)		13		11, 23, 25		10, 12, 13, 32, 40		10, 24		13, 26		10, 20, 23

‡ This key applies to Tables III through XVI:

Numbers in grid represent paragraph numbers in Concluding Observations

* Reservation withdrawn after Committee's comments

+ Committee noted with approval

- Committee noted with concern or made recommendation

R Committee noted specific reservation

D Committee noted specific declaration

P Preliminary Observations

TABLE XIII (CONTINUED)

Reporting Guidelines Paragraph and Other Issues (Convention Article Number)	Mauritius		Morocco		Nigeria		Slovenia		United Kingdom Hong Kong		Uruguay	
	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-
16h - illicit transfer and non-return (art. 11)												
16i - abuse/neglect (art. 19, 39)		12, 18, 31		9, 10, 15, 26, 27		15, 19, 23, 24, 36, 40	4	16, 25	5, 6	15, 27, 28		13, 21
16j - review of placement (art. 25)						40						23
19a - survival/development (art. 6, ¶2)						16, 24						
19b - disabled children (art. 23)		12, 15		9, 10, 26		12, 15, 35		13	4	24, 29		
19c - health, health services (art. 24)		28				10, 16, 23, 36, 37, 41	3		6, 7	15, 16, 30, 31	5	9, 20, 22
19d - social security, child care services (art. 26; 18 ¶3)		28				17, 33	3		7	28		21
19e - standard of living (art. 27, ¶1-3)		12				17, 33			7		9	
20/22 - cooperation with organizations		24, 28, 32		19, 21, 22, 24, 27		38	6	28		21		18, 24, 25
21a - education, vocational training (art. 28)		15, 28, 29		14	18	10, 15, 18, 23, 38, 41	3	15, 23		29, 31	5	9, 12, 20
21b - aims of education (art. 29)		27				38		22		17, 32		26
21c - leisure, recreation (art. 31)										32		
23a(f) - refugees (art. 22)	3 (R)									10(R), 18, 33		

TABLE XIII (CONTINUED)

<i>Reporting Guidelines Paragraph and Other Issues (Convention Article Number)</i>	<i>Mauritius</i>		<i>Morocco</i>		<i>Nigeria</i>		<i>Slovenia</i>		<i>United Kingdom Hong Kong</i>		<i>Uruguay</i>	
	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-
23a(ii) – armed conflict (art. 38, 39)											3(D)	
23b(i) – administration of juvenile justice (art. 40)		20, 31, 32		9, 16, 26, 28				19, 27		10(R), 19, 33	4	6, 14, 24
23b(ii) – deprivation of liberty (art. 37b-d)		20, 32		16, 26, 28		20, 21, 23, 24, 39, 40		19, 27		18, 33		14, 24
23b(iii) – sentencing (art. 37a)		20, 32		16, 28		20, 21, 39		19				24
23b(iv) – recovery/reintegration (art. 39)		18, 20, 31, 32				23, 39, 43						13, 14
23c(i) – child labor (art. 32)	6	17, 28, 29, 31		9, 10, 15, 24, 26, 27		25, 41				10(R)		6, 15, 25
23c(ii) – drug abuse (art. 33)												
23c(iii) – sexual exploitation/abuse (art. 34)		16, 18, 31, 32		15, 27		19, 42		25				
23c(iv) – other exploitation (art. 36)												
23c(v) – sale, trafficking, abduction (art. 35)		31				19, 42						16
23d – minorities/indigenous groups (art. 30)		29		14		12, 34		17				
allocation of resources (art. 4)		12		4, 10, 23		10, 18, 28		24				9, 20
training of professionals who have contact with children		27, 32		19, 28		11, 30		22		23		16, 26

TABLE XIII (CONTINUED)

<i>Reporting Guidelines Paragraph and Other Issues (Convention Article Number)</i>	<i>Mauritius</i>		<i>Morocco</i>		<i>Nigeria</i>		<i>Slovenia</i>		<i>United Kingdom Hong Kong</i>		<i>Uruguay</i>	
	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-
corporal punishment		31		27						27		
abortion												
teen pregnancy												
family planning/sex education		29										12, 22
youth suicide												
family breakdown/divorce rate/single parents		11, 12		9, 10, 26		17		14		15, 31		21

TABLE XIV: CONCLUDING OBSERVATIONS OF THE COMMITTEE ON THE RIGHTS OF THE CHILD
FOURTEENTH SESSION: JANUARY 1997[‡]

Reporting Guidelines Paragraph and Other Issues (Convention Article Number)	Bulgaria		Ethiopia		Myanmar		New Zealand		Panama		Syrian Arab Republic	
	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-
9a - harmonize national law/policy	3, 4	7, 20	3, 4	13, 27	5	8, 28		9, 10, 23	3, 4	9, 22	3	24
9b - coordinate national and local policies/monitoring	5	8, 9, 10, 21, 22, 23	5	11, 23, 25, 26	4	9, 10, 11, 29, 30, 31	4	12, 13, 24, 25	5, 6	11, 12, 23, 24, 25	4	9, 10, 21, 22
10/11 - publicize Convention (art. 42)		13, 25, 35		9, 10, 22, 23, 38		15, 35, 48		33		18, 25, 36	6	11, 23, 32
12 - definition of child (art. 1)		16		13, 14, 20, 27, 33		8		10, 19, 23, 31		10, 22, 33		12, 13, 18, 24, 29
13a - nondiscrimination (art. 2)		12, 26		8, 14, 23		8, 13, 14, 28, 32, 33, 34		8(R), 21(R)		10, 15, 17, 27		12, 13, 24, 25, 27

[‡] This key applies to Tables III through XVI:

Numbers in grid represent paragraph numbers in Concluding Observations

* Reservation withdrawn after Committee's comments

+ Committee noted with approval

- Committee noted with concern or made recommendation

R Committee noted specific reservation

D Committee noted specific declaration

P Preliminary Observations

TABLE XIV (CONTINUED)

Reporting Guidelines Paragraph and Other Issues (Convention Article Number)	Bulgaria		Ethiopia		Myanmar		New Zealand		Panama		Syrian Arab Republic	
	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-
13b – best interests (art. 3)		12, 15, 24, 26, 27		10, 18, 27		13, 14, 17, 18, 32, 33, 34, 36				15, 27		12
13c – life, survival, development (art. 6)				12		13, 33				15		
13d – respect for views of child (art. 12)		12, 24		10, 16, 18		13, 17, 33	7			15, 29		12, 24
15a – name/nationality/registration (art. 7)				15, 29		28						27
15b – preservation of identity (art. 8)												
15c – freedom of expression (art. 13)				30		8, 16, 37				29		
15d – access to information (art. 17)			6							16, 30		
15e – freedom of thought, conscience, religion (art. 14)						16, 37						8(R), 20(F)
15f – freedom of association, assembly (art. 15)				30	3(F)	8, 16, 28, 37				29		
15g – privacy (art. 16)												
15h – torture, death penalty (art. 37a)						8						
16a – parental guidance (art. 5)												
16b – parental responsibilities (art. 18, ¶ 1-2)		28										
16c – separation from parents (art. 9)												
16d – family reunification (art. 10)												
16e – recovery of maintenance (art. 27, ¶ 4)						40						19

TABLE XIV (CONTINUED)

Reporting Guidelines Paragraph and Other Issues (Convention Article Number)	Bulgaria		Ethiopia		Myanmar		New Zealand		Panama		Syrian Arab Republic	
	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-
16f – deprivation of family environment (art. 20)		12, 22, 27, 28										8(R), 20(R)
16g – adoption (art. 21)		15, 20, 31		18, 32		17, 28, 36				17, 31		8(R), 20(R)
16h – illicit transfer and non-return (art. 11)												
16i – abuse/neglect (art. 19, 39)		11, 14, 20, 22, 28, 30		16, 31		21, 23, 24, 41, 44	3	16, 29		15, 16, 30		14, 17, 28, 31
16j – review of placement (art. 25)		27										
19a – survival/development (art. 6, ¶2)				12		18						
19b – disabled children (art. 23)		11, 12, 16, 22		14, 23, 28		18, 33, 38	5		7			14
19c – health, health services (art. 24)		16	6	12, 14, 23, 28		18, 38				19		26, 31
19d – social security, child care services (art. 26; 18 ¶3)	3	28								19		
19e – standard of living (art. 27, ¶1-3)		6, 11		12						14		
20/22 – cooperation with organizations		21, 22, 34		23, 26, 32, 36		27, 31, 35, 45, 46, 48		11, 33	6	24, 25, 27, 33, 36, 37		22, 31, 32
21a – education, vocational training (art. 28)	3	17, 32, 34	7	12, 17, 28		16, 19, 39			4	18, 19, 28, 33, 34	5	5, 16, 17, 26, 31
21b – aims of education (art. 29)		17, 25, 32		17, 24		19, 35				18, 27, 28		16, 23, 31

TABLE XIV (CONTINUED)

Reporting Guidelines Paragraph and Other Issues (Convention Article Number)	Bulgaria		Ethiopia		Myanmar		New Zealand		Panama		Syrian Arab Republic	
	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-
21c - leisure, recreation (art. 31)												
23a(i) - refugees (art. 22)				15, 29		10, 20		20, 32		18, 19, 34		
23a(ii) - armed conflict (art. 38, 39)				21, 31		21, 22, 25, 31, 41, 42						
23b(i) - administration of juvenile justice (art. 40)	3	19, 20, 34		13, 20, 28, 34		8, 26, 28, 46		10, 23		21, 35		12, 19, 24, 30
23b(ii) - deprivation of liberty (art. 37b-d)		12, 14, 19, 22, 34		20, 34, 35	3(R)	26, 46		8(R), 21(R)		21, 35		19, 30
23b(iii) - sentencing (art. 37a)		19, 34		13, 20, 34	3(R)	26, 46				21, 35		19, 30
23b(iv) - recovery/reintegration (art. 39)		14, 30, 34		20, 21, 28, 31, 34		25, 26, 45, 46		16, 29		21, 34, 35		17, 28, 30
23c(i) - child labor (art. 32)		18, 20, 33		19, 33, 35		8, 21, 23, 28, 43		8(R), 10, 19, 21(R), 23, 31		10, 20, 33		12, 18, 24, 29
23c(ii) - drug abuse (art. 33)												
23c(iii) - sexual exploitation/abuse (art. 34)		14, 22, 30		16, 31		24, 44				10, 22, 34		31
23c(iv) - other exploitation (art. 36)												
23c(v) - sale, trafficking, abduction (art. 35)						24, 44				17		
23d - minorities/indigenous groups (art. 30)		11, 12, 19, 22				13, 19, 33, 38, 39		18, 30	4	13, 15, 18, 28		14

TABLE XIV (CONTINUED)

Reporting Guidelines Paragraph and Other Issues (Convention Article Number)	Bulgaria		Ethiopia		Myanmar		New Zealand		Panama		Syrian Arab Republic	
	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-
allocation of resources (art. 4)		11, 26		28		9, 12, 32		14, 26		14, 27		14, 26
training of professionals who have contact with children		13, 25		10, 24		15, 35, 46			4	13, 27, 31		11, 23
corporal punishment		30		13, 20, 27		28		16, 29		16, 30		17, 28
abortion												
teen pregnancy		16, 29		14								
family planning/sex education		29								15, 30		
youth suicide		16, 29						17, 28				31
family breakdown/divorce rate/single parents								15, 27				

TABLE XV: CONCLUDING OBSERVATIONS OF THE COMMITTEE ON THE RIGHTS OF THE CHILD
FIFTEENTH SESSION: JUNE 1997‡

Reporting Guidelines Paragraph and Other Issues (Convention Article Number)	Algeria		Azerbaijan		Bangladesh		Cuba		Ghana		Paraguay	
	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-
9a – harmonize national law/policy	3	12, 16, 29, 33	3	8, 9, 15, 29, 30	3, 14	12, 14, 29, 32	4	9, 16, 26, 29	3, 4	7, 28		8, 14, 29, 34
9b – coordinate national and local policies/monitoring	4	13, 15, 16, 30, 32	3	9, 10, 11, 15, 30, 31, 32	3, 6	32, 33	14	11, 12, 13, 16, 26, 28, 29, 30	5, 5, 8	8, 10, 29, 30		9, 10, 30, 32
10/11 – publicize Convention (art. 42)	5, 14	14, 31, 33, 42	4, 13	13, 36, 50		13, 30, 48		43		14, 34, 49	12	12, 33, 49
12 – definition of child (art. 1)		20		16, 37		12, 15, 26, 44		15, 25(D), 32 38		21, 27, 42, 45, 48		44
13a – nondiscrimination (art. 2)		17, 33		15, 16, 33		12, 15, 29, 35		16, 33		6, 12, 13, 21, 29, 31, 32, 42, 44		14, 16, 34, 35, 37

‡ This key applies to Tables III through XVI:

Numbers in grid represent paragraph numbers in Concluding Observations

* Reservation withdrawn after Committee's comments

+ Committee noted with approval

- Committee noted with concern or made recommendation

R Committee noted specific reservation

D Committee noted specific declaration

P Preliminary Observations

TABLE XV (CONTINUED)

Reporting Guidelines Paragraph and Other Issues (Convention Article Number)	Algeria		Azerbaijan		Bangladesh		Cuba		Ghana		Paraguay	
	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-
13b – best interests (art. 3)		16, 33		15, 18, 33, 35, 39		12, 29				13, 23, 31, 33, 36, 44		14, 20, 34, 35
13c – life, survival, development (art. 6)		16, 33		7, 15, 24	8	12, 15, 29	3		13		4	14, 22, 34
13d – respect for views of child (art. 12)	16	16, 33		15, 35		12, 16, 29, 36		16, 33		13, 33, 43		14, 34
15a – name/nationality/registration (art. 7)		19, 36				17, 37				15, 35		18, 38
15b – preservation of identity (art. 8)												18
15c – freedom of expression (art. 13)		11(D), 28(D)				36						
15d – access to information (art. 17)		11(D), 28(D)		17, 38						17, 37		
15e – freedom of thought, conscience, religion (art. 14)		11(D), 28(D)				11(R), 28(R)						
15f – freedom of association, assembly (art. 15)						36						
15g – privacy (art. 16)		11(D), 28(D)										
15h – torture, death penalty (art. 37a)		26, 40				12, 31				16, 29		
16a – parental guidance (art. 5)												
16b – parental responsibilities (art. 18, ¶ 1-2)						19, 38						19, 39
16c – separation from parents (art. 9)												
16d – family reunification (art. 10)				42		23, 45						
16e – recovery of maintenance (art. 27, ¶ 4)												
16f – deprivation of family environment (art. 20)				11, 18, 39		19		18, 19		30		32, 40

TABLE XV (CONTINUED)

Reporting Guidelines Paragraph and Other Issues (Convention Article Number)	Algeria		Azerbaijan		Bangladesh		Cuba		Ghana		Paraguay		
	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	
16g – adoption (art. 21)				20, 41		11(R), 28(R), 40		27				20, 42	20, 41, 42
16h – illicit transfer and non-return (art. 11)													
16i – abuse/neglect (art. 19, 39)		18, 21, 35		11, 22, 23, 32, 43		18, 26, 38, 39, 46		19, 35					21, 32, 40
16j – review of placement (art. 25)				18, 39									40
19a – survival/development (art. 6, ¶2)				7, 24		15		3				4	22
19b – disabled children (art. 23)		18		32, 34		15, 20, 35, 42		6					32
19c – health, health services (art. 24)	6	22, 23, 37		24, 26, 45		15, 20, 23, 41, 42, 45		3				4, 22	22, 23, 39, 45
19d – social security, child care services (art. 26, 18 ¶3)				19, 26, 40		19, 38, 41							
19e – standard of living (art. 27, ¶1-3)		9		19, 40		9							
20/22 – cooperation with organizations	5	30, 32, 42	5	31, 32, 45, 48, 49, 50	5	4, 5, 22 37, 44, 45, 46, 48	7					6	31, 32, 45, 47, 48, 49
21a – education, vocational training (art. 28)	6	21, 22, 23, 37		25, 26, 44, 46		15, 23, 43, 44, 45	3	19, 22, 40				3	24, 49

TABLE XV (CONTINUED)

Reporting Guidelines Paragraph and Other Issues (Convention Article Number)	Algeria		Azerbaijan		Bangladesh		Cuba		Ghana		Paraguay	
	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-
21b – aims of education (art. 29)	14	41		36, 46		30, 43				22, 34, 43, 46		33, 46
21c – leisure, recreation (art. 31)						25, 44						
23a(i) – refugees (art. 22)		18, 22, 28		7, 11, 26, 32, 40, 47		15, 23, 35, 45		27		23, 30, 44		
23a(ii) – armed conflict (art. 38, 39)	8	10, 27, 41		7, 21, 25, 26, 27, 48							17	17, 36
23b(i) – administration of juvenile justice (art. 40)	25	25, 26, 40		11, 28, 49		12, 16, 26, 46		24		7, 27, 48	5	28, 48
23b(ii) – deprivation of liberty (art. 37b-d)		40		28, 32, 49		12, 26, 46		24		27, 30, 48		28, 32, 48
23b(iii) – sentencing (art. 37a)		26, 40		28, 49		12, 26, 46				27, 48		28, 48
23b(iv) – recovery/reintegration (art. 39)	8	35, 40		27, 28, 48, 49		26, 39, 46, 47				27, 47, 48		28, 47, 48
23c(i) – child labor (art. 32)	7	24, 39		11, 28, 49		24, 44		23, 32		18, 24, 45	3	21, 44
23c(ii) – drug abuse (art. 33)				24			41	23, 41		25, 46		
23c(iii) – sexual exploitation/abuse (art. 34)		20, 35		23, 32, 43		15, 18, 24, 35, 39, 47		41	23, 41, 42	26, 30, 47		21, 26, 27, 32, 47
23c(iv) – other exploitation (art. 36)												
23c(v) – sale, trafficking, abduction (art. 35)						24, 47						20, 43
23d – minorities/indigenous groups (art. 30)		18, 19, 23, 36, 37				15, 27, 35					3	16, 24, 37, 46
allocation of resources (art. 4)		18, 34		12, 33	7, 34	34				11, 31	3	15, 35

TABLE XV (CONTINUED)

<i>Reporting Guidelines Paragraph and Other Issues (Convention Article Number)</i>	<i>Algeria</i>		<i>Azerbaijan</i>		<i>Bangladesh</i>		<i>Cuba</i>		<i>Ghana</i>		<i>Paraguay</i>	
	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-
training of professionals who have contact with children		14, 31		14, 36, 49		13, 30		14, 31		14, 34, 48		13, 33, 44, 48
corporal punishment		21, 35				18, 38		35		16, 36		
abortion								37				
teen pregnancy								37		21		45
family planning/sex education					8		5	21, 37		41		23, 45
youth suicide				22, 43				23				
family breakdown/divorce rate/single parents		18		11, 19, 40		19						43

TABLE XVI: CONCLUDING OBSERVATIONS OF THE COMMITTEE ON THE RIGHTS OF THE CHILD
SIXTEENTH SESSION: OCTOBER 1997‡

Reporting Guidelines Paragraph and Other Issues (Convention Article Number)	Australia		Czech Republic		Lao People's Democratic Republic		Togo		Trinidad and Tobago		Uganda	
	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-
9a - harmonize national law/policy	4	7, 9, 24	3, 27	9, 27, 30		8, 14, 30, 39	3	8, 9, 31		8, 14, 24	3, 4, 9	9, 26
9b - coordinate national and local policies/monitoring		9, 24, 27	11	9, 10, 11, 27, 28, 29	4	10, 11, 34, 35	3, 4, 9	9, 10, 32, 33	4	9, 10, 25, 26	3, 8	8, 10, 25, 27
10/11 - publicize Convention (art. 42)		10, 35		14, 42	12	12, 36, 55	5	15, 38, 55		13, 24, 28, 40	11	11, 28, 40
12 - definition of child (art. 1)		11, 29		40		17, 18, 50		12, 35, 51		8, 22, 23, 24, 38, 39		9, 18, 39
13a - nondiscrimination (art. 2)		12, 17, 22, 32		13, 15, 30, 32		14, 15, 30, 40		7, 12, 13, 14, 26, 34, 36, 50		14		7, 9, 14, 30
13b - best interests (art. 3)		15, 31		13, 18, 30		14, 22, 30		14, 26, 34, 37, 40, 50		14, 32		7, 13
13c - life, survival, development (art. 6)		15				14, 23, 30		14, 23, 46	5			17, 19, 32, 34

‡ This key applies to Tables III through XVI:

Numbers in grid represent paragraph numbers in Concluding Observations

* Reservation withdrawn after Committee's comments

+ Committee noted with approval

- Committee noted with concern or made recommendation

R Committee noted specific reservation

D Committee noted specific declaration

P Preliminary Observations

TABLE XVI (CONTINUED)

Reporting Guidelines Paragraph and Other Issues (Convention Article Number)	Australia		Czech Republic		Lao People's Democratic Republic		Togo		Trinidad and Tobago		Uganda	
	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-
13d - respect for views of child (art. 12)		12, 28		13, 30		14, 16, 30, 41		14, 19, 37, 42		14		7, 13
15a - name/nationality/registration (art. 7)		14, 30	16	8(R), 16, 26(R), 33		19, 43		8, 16, 26, 39				16, 31
15b - preservation of identity (art. 8)												
15c - freedom of expression (art. 13)								19, 42				
15d - access to information (art. 17)				17				18, 41		15, 30		
15e - freedom of thought, conscience, religion (art. 14)												
15f - freedom of association, assembly (art. 15)		16										
15g - privacy (art. 16)												
15h - torture, death penalty (art. 37a)		15								17		19
16a - parental guidance (art. 5)		10, 15, 27										
16b - parental responsibilities (art. 18, ¶ 1-2)		10, 27, 28								32		
16c - separation from parents (art. 9)						21, 45						
16d - family reunification (art. 10)		30										
16e - recovery of maintenance (art. 27, ¶ 4)						21, 45						

TABLE XVI (CONTINUED)

<i>Reporting Guidelines Paragraph and Other Issues (Convention Article Number)</i>	<i>Australia</i>		<i>Czech Republic</i>		<i>Lao People's Democratic Republic</i>		<i>Togo</i>		<i>Trinidad and Tobago</i>		<i>Uganda</i>	
	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-
16f – deprivation of family environment (art. 20)		15	16	13, 15, 16, 29				16, 33		10, 17, 18, 34		24
16g – adoption (art. 21)				36		22, 46		8, 21, 43	33			
16h – illicit transfer and non-return (art. 11)												
16i – abuse/neglect (art. 19, 39)		15, 26, 32	5	13, 18, 22, 29, 35, 39		10, 20, 33, 44		22, 33, 40, 44	16	10, 16, 31, 32		12, 15, 24, 30, 35
16j – review of placement (art. 25)										18, 34		
19a – survival/development (art. 6, ¶2)						23		23, 46	5			17, 19, 32, 34
19b – disabled children (art. 23)				13, 20, 29, 37	3			13, 33, 36		10, 35		12, 14, 30
19c – health, health services (art. 24)	3, 18	13, 19, 31, 32, 34	6	15, 19, 20, 21, 32, 34, 38	3	15, 23, 25, 47, 49, 54		13, 23, 24, 45, 46, 47, 48, 50		19, 35	5	6, 14, 17, 21, 29, 32
19d – social security, child care services (art. 26; 18 ¶3)	3	31		15, 20, 34, 40		33				38		
19e – standard of living (art. 27, ¶1-3)		13, 32		7, 32				7	38	7, 38		6
20/22 – cooperation with organizations	6	24, 25, 35		12, 27, 42	5, 6	13, 30, 35, 36, 37, 38, 47, 48, 49, 52, 53, 54, 55	6	31, 32, 33, 38, 46, 48, 52, 54, 55	6	36, 40		25, 27, 34, 36, 40

TABLE XVI (CONTINUED)

<i>Reporting Guidelines Paragraph and Other Issues (Convention Article Number)</i>	<i>Australia</i>		<i>Czech Republic</i>		<i>Lao People's Democratic Republic</i>		<i>Togo</i>		<i>Trinidad and Tobago</i>		<i>Uganda</i>	
	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	+	-
21a – education, vocational training (art. 28)	3, 18	13, 15, 26	6	15, 18, 20, 32, 35	3	15, 24, 48, 51, 54		13, 16, 25, 40, 45, 49, 50	5, 21	17, 20, 32, 36, 37	18	14, 15, 18, 21, 29, 33, 38
21b – aims of education (art. 29)		27		31		36, 47, 49, 52		25, 39, 49, 52		36		33
21c – leisure, recreation (art. 31)								25, 49				
23a(i) – refugees (art. 22)		20, 30						26, 33, 50				21, 37
23a(ii) – armed conflict (art. 38, 39)					5	25, 49						6, 19, 24, 34
23b(i) – administration of juvenile justice (art. 40)		11, 22, 28, 29, 32		25, 41	6	29, 53		8, 30, 54		8, 10, 23, 24, 39		9, 20, 36
23b(ii) – deprivation of liberty (art. 37b-d)		8(R), 15, 20, 21, 23(R), 32		13, 15, 25, 29, 41		29, 53		30, 33, 54		23, 39		15, 20, 36
23b(iii) – sentencing (art. 37a)				25, 41		29, 53		30, 54		23, 39		20, 36
23b(iv) – recovery/reintegration (art. 39)		15, 26		25, 41		20, 25, 27, 29, 44, 49, 51, 52, 53		28, 30, 44, 52, 54		23, 31, 39		20, 24, 35, 36
23c(i) – child labor (art. 32)		11, 29		40		26, 50		27, 51		8, 10, 22, 24, 38		9, 12, 22, 30, 39
23c(ii) – drug abuse (art. 33)		18		24		28, 52		8, 28, 52				
23c(iii) – sexual exploitation/abuse (art. 34)		18, 26, 32	5	13, 22, 29, 39		10, 20, 27, 44, 51		27, 29, 33, 53		16, 31		12, 15, 23, 30, 35, 38

