

University of Michigan Journal of Law Reform

Volume 43

2009

Front Matter

Journal of Law Reform

Follow this and additional works at: <https://repository.law.umich.edu/mjlr>

Recommended Citation

Journal of Law Reform, *Front Matter*, 43 U. MICH. J. L. REFORM i (2009).

Available at: <https://repository.law.umich.edu/mjlr/vol43/iss1/1>

This Front Matter is brought to you for free and open access by the University of Michigan Journal of Law Reform at University of Michigan Law School Scholarship Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in University of Michigan Journal of Law Reform by an authorized editor of University of Michigan Law School Scholarship Repository. For more information, please contact mlaw.repository@umich.edu.

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN
JOURNAL of LAW REFORM

VOLUME 43 • ISSUE 1

FALL 2009

UNIV. OF MICH.

DEC 03 2009

LAW LIBRARY

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN
LAW SCHOOL
ANN ARBOR, MICHIGAN



55 252 WM 2186
10/10 MAR 02-013-06 Ohio
H Group

Cite as: 43 U. MICH. J.L. REFORM ____ (2009)

Copyright © 2009 by the *University of Michigan Journal of Law Reform*. All rights reserved. Except where otherwise expressly indicated, copies of scholarship printed in the *University of Michigan Journal of Law Reform* may be made for course use in any public or private institution of learning provided that (1) copies are distributed at or below cost, (2) the author and the *University of Michigan Journal of Law Reform* are identified on the copies, and (3) proper notice of copyright is affixed to each copy.

The *University of Michigan Journal of Law Reform* is published quarterly by students of the University of Michigan Law School. Fourth-class postage paid at Ann Arbor, Michigan 48109. Printed by Joe Christensen, Inc., Lincoln, Nebraska 68521.

University of Michigan Journal of Law Reform
University of Michigan Law School
625 S. State Street
Ann Arbor, MI 48109-1215
Telephone: (734) 763-6100
<http://students.law.umich.edu/mjlr/>

PUBLICATION POLICY

The *Journal* seeks to improve the law and its administration by providing a forum for discussion that identifies contemporary issues for reform efforts, proposes concrete means to accomplish change, and evaluates the impact of law reform. As contributions to this discussion, the *Journal* also welcomes multidisciplinary and empirical work.

We encourage the submission of unsolicited manuscripts for publication. Submissions should be sent electronically to jlr-submissions@umich.edu. Articles should generally conform to *The Bluebook: A Uniform System of Citation* (18th ed. 2005) and *The Chicago Manual of Style* (15th ed. 2003).

Views expressed in the *Journal* are those of the authors and not necessarily those of the editorial staff.

SUBSCRIPTIONS

The current subscription rate is \$35.00 domestic and \$40.00 foreign. All business inquiries should be made to (734) 763-6100. Subscribers should report the nonreceipt of copies within six months of the mailing date.

INDIVIDUAL AND BACK ISSUES

Copies of individual issues from the current volume can be obtained directly from the *Journal* for \$15.00 each.

Back issues in complete sets, volumes, or single issues can be obtained from William S. Hein & Co., Inc., 1285 Main Street, Buffalo, New York 14209—Telephone (716) 882-2600. The *Journal* is also available on microfilm through ProQuest, 300 North Zeeb Road, Ann Arbor, Michigan 48106-1346—Telephone (800) 521-0600. Back issues are also available in PDF format through HeinOnline at <http://heinonline.org>.

INDEXES

The *Journal* is indexed in the Current Law Index, Index to Legal Periodicals, Legal Resource Index, and PAIS Bulletin.

ISSN 0033-1546

ERRATUM

Ashley L. Thompson would like to acknowledge a misstatement in her Note, *The Unintended Consequence of Tort Reform in Michigan: An Argument for Reinstating Retailer Product Liability*, that was published in Volume 42:4. The author incorrectly stated, on pages 974–75, that the Michigan Supreme Court adopted a strict interpretation (previously used in *Mills v. Curioni, Inc.*) of Mich. Comp. Laws § 600.2947 in *Coleman v. Maxwell Shoe*. The *Coleman* case, however, should have been attributed to the Eastern District Court of Michigan. To date, the Michigan Supreme Court has not addressed this issue.

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN
JOURNAL of LAW REFORM

Editorial Board

Volume 43 • 2009–2010

Editor in Chief
WILLIAM T. WALL

Managing Editor
MARGIA K. Y. CORNER

Managing Executive Editor
SARAH A. BENNETT

Managing Article Editor
KRISTINA SALEH

Managing Note Editor
JULIA R. FINKEL

Executive Editors
NICHOLAS ANTONIOU
ALEXANDER BROWN
SARAH BETH GLEICH
RACHAEL S. STEENBERGH
RINA WANG

Article Editors
JOSEPH D. ADAMSON
SAMUEL M. DUNCAN
KEITH D. GREENBERG
BRENT LAPOINTE
BARRY LUONG*
JAN PETER MENSZ

Note Editors
ELIZABETH BEERMAN
BRADLEY M. SMYER
GRANT T. STERN
ERICA N. TURCIOS

MIR Y. ALI
JOHN C. ALLERDING
MATTHEW D. BARTLEBAUGH
W. TURNER BOOTH
EVAN P. BRENNAN
AMY LYNN BRUNING
BRIAN CATHEY
ALICE CHEN

Contributing Editors
CHRISTOPHER M. CHUBB
THERESA M. DEAN
JORDAN H. FLOURNOY
EMILY P. GRIM
ROBYN J. KONKEL
KERRY L. MONROE
ZOE A. RASMUSSEN
ELIZABETH A. REYNOLDS
RENA A. SETH

KELA SHANG
RYAN M. SHANNON
SHANNON SHIN
LILLIAN M. WAFFORD
JACOB ALLEN WALKER
MEREDITH S. WEILL
MATTHEW J. WEISER
JASON E. WRIGHT

ALAN J. ALEXANDER
CHRISTOPHER ALLEN
NELLY ALMEIDA
DANIEL BEAUCHEMIN
JESSICA BERNFELD
WILLIAM K. CHANG
ALIZA M. COHEN
KAREN CULLINANE
JACOB K. DANZIGER
JOHN T. DUFFEY
JOHANNA M. FRANZEN
MICHAEL HEDIN II
SOPHIE KASIMOW
JESSE J. KIRCHNER
CAITLIN KOZAN
KATRINA R. LARSEN

Associate Editors
LISA ZHAO LIU
MAX LOUIK
TAD J. MACFARLAN
FAIZAH MALIK
JESSE LEIGH MANIFF
ERIC H. MAO
CHRISTOPHER D. MARSHALL
LEE MAYNARD
MATTHEW J. NEALE
KATHERINE H. NIELSON
JEANNE L. NISHIMOTO
CARLY OSADETZ
DUSTIN M. PARMLEY
DANIEL J. PING
JOHN RHOADES

BRIAN D. RICE
ANDREW D. SELBST
SALONI SHAH
LAUREN SURGUINE SMITH
MEREDITH SMITH
ROBERT SMITH
THOMAS H. SOEHL
IAN SPAIN
MATTHEW J. TALLEY
KIMBERLY TIMKO
SAM P. VANVOLKENBURGH
QIAN WANG
S. LAURIE WILLIAMS
LANDIS WOOD
BRENT J. YLVISAKER
DIANA ZELIKOVICH

*TECHNOLOGY EDITOR

Manager
MAUREEN A. BISHOP

Editorial Assistants
CATHERINE T. LEGGIERI
MATTHEW S. REDDING
BARBARA I. SUMMERS

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN LAW SCHOOL

Fall 2009

Administrative Officers

MARY SUE COLEMAN, B.A., PH.D., *President of the University*
TERESA A. SULLIVAN, B.A., PH.D., *Provost and Executive Vice President for Academic Affairs*
EVAN H. CAMINKER, B.A., J.D., *Branch Rickey Collegiate Professor, Dean*
MARK D. WEST, B.A., J.D., *Nippon Life Professor of Law, Associate Dean for Academic Affairs*
BRIDGET M. MCCORMACK, B.A., J.D., *Associate Dean for Clinical Affairs*
VIRGINIA B. GORDAN, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Dean for International Affairs*
DAVID H. BAUM, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Dean for Student Affairs*
KATHERINE B. GOTTSCHALK, B.A., *Assistant Dean for Financial Aid*
SUSAN M. GUINDI, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Dean for Career Services*
SARAH C. ZEARFOSS, A.B., J.D., *Assistant Dean and Director of Admissions*
TODD BAILY, B.A., *Assistant Dean for Development and Alumni Relations*
MARYANN SAROSI, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Dean of Public Service*
CHRISTINE GREGORY, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Dean for Student Affairs*

Professors Emeriti of Law

LAYMAN E. ALLEN, A.B., M.P.A., LL.B.	RICHARD O. LEMPERT, A.B., J.D., PH.D., <i>Eric Stein Distinguished University Professor of Law and Sociology</i>
DAVID L. CHAMBERS, A.B., LL.B., <i>Wade H. McCree, Jr. Collegiate Professor of Law</i>	ROY F. PROFFITT, B.S., J.D., LL.M.
ALFRED F. CONARD, A.B., LL.B., LL.M., J.S.D., LL.D., <i>Henry M. Butzel Professor of Law</i>	JOHN W. REED, A.B., LL.B., LL.M., JUR.Sc.D., LL.D., <i>Thomas M. Cooley Professor of Law</i>
LUKE K. COOPERRIDER, B.S., J.D.	TERRANCE SANDALOW, A.B., J.D., <i>Edson R. Sunderland Professor of Law</i>
ROBBEN W. FLEMING, B.A., LL.B., LL.D.	A.W. BRIAN SIMPSON, B.A., M.A., D.C.L., <i>Charles F. and Edith J. Clyne Professor of Law</i>
WHITMORE GRAY, A.B., J.D., LL.D.	E. PHILIP SOPER, B.A., M.A., J.D., PH.D., <i>James V. Campbell Professor of Law</i>
THOMAS A. GREEN, B.A., PH.D., J.D., <i>John Philip Dawson Collegiate Professor of Law</i>	THEODORE J. ST. ANTOINE, A.B., J.D., <i>James E. and Sarah A. Degan Professor of Law</i>
JEROLD H. ISRAEL, B.B.A., LL.B., <i>Alene and Allan F. Smith Professor of Law</i>	ERIC STEIN, J.U.D., J.D., DR.H.C., <i>Hessel E. Yntema Professor of Law</i>
JOHN H. JACKSON, B.A., J.D., <i>Hessel E. Yntema Professor of Law</i>	PETER O. STEINER, A.B., M.A., PH.D.
CHARLES W. JOINER, A.B., J.D.	JOSEPH VINING, B.A., M.A., J.D., <i>Harry Burns Hutchins Collegiate Professor of Law</i>
YALE KAMISAR, A.B., LL.B., LL.D., <i>Clarence Darrow Distinguished University Professor of Law</i>	PETER K. WESTEN, B.A., J.D., <i>Frank G. Millard Professor of Law</i>
THOMAS E. KAUPER, A.B., J.D., <i>Henry M. Butzel Professor of Law</i>	JAMES BOYD WHITE, A.B., A.M., LL.B., <i>L. Hart Wright Collegiate Professor of Law</i>

Professors of Law

REUVEN S. AVI-YONAH, B.A., A.M., PH.D., J.D., <i>Irwin I. Cohn Professor of Law</i>	RICHARD D. FRIEDMAN, B.A., J.D., D.PHIL., <i>Ralph W. Aigler Professor of Law</i>
SAMUEL BAGENSTOS,* B.A., J.D.	BRUCE W. FRIER, B.A., PH.D., <i>John and Teresa D'Arms Distinguished University Professor of Classics and Roman Law</i>
MICHAEL S. BARR,* B.A., M.PHIL., J.D.	SAMUEL R. GROSS, A.B., J.D., <i>Thomas G. and Mabel Long Professor of Law</i>
LAURA N. BENY,* B.A., M.A., J.D., PH.D.	DANIEL HALBERSTAM,* B.A., J.D., <i>Eric Stein Collegiate Professor of Law</i>
EVAN H. CAMINKER, B.A., J.D., <i>Branch Rickey Collegiate Professor of Law</i>	JAMES C. HATHAWAY,* LL.B., LL.M., J.S.D., DONALD J. HERZOG, A.B., A.M., PH.D., <i>Edson R. Sunderland Professor of Law</i>
SHERMAN J. CLARK, B.S., J.D.	JAMES HINES JR., B.A., M.A., PH.D., <i>L. Hart Wright Collegiate Professor of Law</i>
EDWARD H. COOPER, A.B., LL.B., <i>Thomas M. Cooley Professor of Law</i>	JILL R. HORWITZ, B.A., M.P.P., J.D., PH.D., <i>Louis and Myrtle Moskowitz Research Professor of Business and Law</i>
DANIEL CRANE, B.A., J.D.	DOUGLAS A. KAHN, B.A., J.D., <i>Paul G. Kauper Professor of Law</i>
SUSAN P. CRAWFORD,* B.A., J.D.	
STEVEN P. CROLEY, A.B., J.D., M.A., PH.D.	
ALICIA DAVIS,* B.S., J.D., M.B.A.	
REBECCA S. EISENBERG,* B.A., J.D., <i>Robert and Barbara Luciano Professor of Law</i>	
PHOEBE C. ELLSWORTH,* A.B., PH.D., <i>Frank Murphy Distinguished Professor of Law and Psychology</i>	

ELLEN D. KATZ,* B.A., J.D.
 VIKRAMADITYA S. KHANNA, B.C.A., LL.B., S.J.D.
 JAMES E. KRIER, B.S., J.D.,
Earl Warren DeLano Professor of Law
 DOUGLAS LAYCOCK, B.A., J.D.,
Yale Kamisar Collegiate Professor of Law
 JESSICA D. LITMAN, B.A., M.F.A., J.D.
John F. Nickoll Professor of Law
 KYLE D. LOGUE, B.A., J.D.,
Wade H. McCree, Jr., Collegiate Professor of Law
 CATHARINE A. MACKINNON,* B.A., J.D., PH.D.,
Elizabeth A. Long Professor of Law
 NINA A. MENDELSON, A.B., J.D.
 WILLIAM I. MILLER, B.A., PH.D., J.D.,
Thomas G. Long Professor of Law
 WILLIAM NOVAK, B.A., M.A., PH.D.
 EDWARD A. PARSON, B.Sc., M.Sc., PH.D.
Joseph L. Sax Collegiate Professor of Law
 SALLYANNE PAYTON, B.A., LL.B.,
William W. Cook Professor of Law
 JOHN A.E. POTTOW,* A.B., J.D.
 RICHARD A. PRIMUS,* A.B., D.PHIL., J.D.

ADAM C. PRITCHARD, B.A., M.P.P., J.D.
Frances and George Skestos Professor of Law
 MARGARET JANE RADIN, A.B., M.F.A., J.D., LL.D.,
Henry King Ransom Professor of Law
 STEVEN R. RATNER, A.B., M.A., J.D.
Bruno Simma Collegiate Professor of Law
 DONALD H. REGAN, A.B., LL.B., B.PHIL., PH.D.,
William W. Bishop, Jr. Collegiate Professor of Law
 MATHIAS W. REIMANN, DR.IUR., LL.M.,
Hessel E. Yntema Professor of Law
 MARGO SCHLANGER,* B.A., J.D.
 CARL E. SCHNEIDER,* A.B., J.D.,
*Chauncey Stillman Professorship for Ethics,
 Morality, and the Practice of Law*
 REBECCA J. SCOTT, A.B., M.PHIL., PH.D.,
*Charles Gibson Distinguished University
 Professor of History*
 LAWRENCE W. WAGGONER, B.B.A., J.D.,
 D.PHIL., *Lewis M. Simes Professor of Law*
 MARK D. WEST, B.A., J.D.,
Nippon Life Professor of Law
 JAMES J. WHITE, B.A., J.D.,
Robert A. Sullivan Professor of Law
 CHRISTINA B. WHITMAN, A.B., M.A., J.D.,
Francis A. Allen Collegiate Professor of Law

Assistant Professors of Law

MONICA R. HAKIMI, B.A., J.D.
 SCOTT HERSHOVITZ, A.B., M.A., D.PHIL., J.D.
 NICHOLAS C. HOWSON, B.A., J.D.
 MADELINE KOCHEN, B.A., J.D., A.M., PH.D.

JULIAN D. MORTENSON, A.B., J.D.
 JAMES J. PRESCOTT,* B.A., J.D., PH.D.
 EVE BRENSIKE PRIMUS,* B.A., J.D.
 GIL SEINFELD, A.B., J.D.
 SONJA B. STARR, A.B., J.D.

Clinical Professors of Law

ALICIA ALVAREZ, B.A., J.D.
 DONALD N. DUQUETTE, B.A., J.D.
 PHILIP M. FROST,* B.A., J.D.
 BRIDGET M. MCCORMACK, B.A., J.D.

DAVID A. MORAN, B.S., B.A., M.A., M.S., J.D.
 PAUL D. REINGOLD, B.A., J.D.
 NICHOLAS J. RINE, B.A., J.D.
 DAVID A. SANTACROCE, B.A., J.D., LL.M.
 ANNE N. SCHROTH, B.A., J.D.

Clinical Assistant Professors of Law

EDWARD R. BECKER, B.A., J.D.
 HOWARD BROMBERG, B.A., J.D., J.S.M.
 DEBRA CHOPP, B.A., J.D.
 RACHEL CROSKERY-ROBERTS, B.A., J.D.
 PAUL H. FALON, B.A., M.A., J.D.
 MARK K. OSBECK, A.B., M.A., J.D.

TIMOTHY PINTO, B.A., J.D.
 VIVEK SANKARAN, B.A., J.D.
 THOMAS H. SEYMOUR, B.A., M.A., J.D.
 KIMBERLY A. THOMAS, B.S., J.D.
 FRANK E. VANDERVORT, B.A., J.D.
 BETH H. WILENSKY, B.A., J.D.

Affiliated Overseas Professors

J. CHRISTOPHER MCCRUDDEN, LL.B., LL.M.,
 D.PHIL

BRUNO SIMMA, DOCTORATE OF LAW

Visiting Professors of Law

BRADFORD CLARK, A.A., B.A., J.D.
 ANDREW B. COAN, B.A., J.D.
 JOHN E. DiNARDO, A.B., M.P.P., PH.D.
 NOAH HALL, B.S., J.D.

JODY S. KRAUS, B.A., M.D., PH.D., J.D.
 PENELOPE MATHEW, B.A., LL.B., LL.M., S.J.D.
 ANGELA ONWUACHI-WILLIG, B.A., J.D.
 ANNE PIEHL, A.B., PH.D.
 ALAN SCHENK, B.S., LL.B., LL.M.

Visiting Clinical Assistant Professor

BRIDGETTE CARR, B.A., J.D.

Business Faculty Fellows

BARRY A. ADELMAN, B.A., J.D.	TIMOTHY L. DICKINSON, B.A., J.D., LL.M.
DEBORAH BURAND, B.A., M.S.F.S., J.D.	JENNIFER DROGULA, B.A., J.D., LL.M.
	KARL E. LUTZ, B.A., J.D.

Public Service/Public Interest Faculty Fellows

SAUL A. GREEN, B.A., J.D.	MARK ROSENBAUM, B.A., J.D.
ALISON E. HIRSCHL, B.A., J.D.	<i>Harvey J. Gunderson Professor from Practice</i>
JUDITH E. LEVY, B.S., J.D.	DAVID UHLMANN, B.A., J.D.
	<i>Jeffrey F. Liss Faculty Development Professor from Practice</i>

Adjunct Professors

MARTIN BIENENSTOCK, B.S., J.D.	RAYMOND M. KETHLEDGE, B.A., J.D.
H. CHRISTOPHER BOEHNING, B.A., M.S., J.D.	SUSAN KORNFELD, B.A., J.D.
ANDREW P. BUCHSBAUM, A.B., J.D.	JOAN L. LARSEN, B.A., J.D.
RICHARD E. CASSARD, B.B.A., J.D.	HOWARD LEARNER, B.A., J.D.
MARK CODY, B.A., J.D.	JEFFREY H. MIRO, B.A., J.D., LL.M.
JAMES DESIMPELARE, B.S., M.B.A.	CYRIL MOSCOW, B.S., J.D.
LEONID FELLER, B.A., J.D.	LEONARD NIEHOFF, A.B., J.D.
SARA GOSMAN, A.B., J.D., M.P.A.	JUDY O'NEILL, B.A., J.D.
ROBERT HIRSHON, B.A., J.D.,	EDWARD R. STEIN, B.A., J.D.
<i>Frank G. Millard Professor from Practice</i>	STEFAN F. TUCKER, B.B.A., J.D.
ALLYN D. KANTOR, B.S., J.D.	JONATHAN TUKEL, B.A., J.D.

Adjunct Clinical Assistant Professors

NICOLE APPLEBERRY, A.B., J.D., LL.M.	VALERIE NEWMAN, B.A., J.D.
MARGARET A. CERNAK, B.A., J.D.	PETER J. VAN HOEK, B.A., J.D.
NEIL S. KAGAN, B.S., M.S., J.D.	NANCY E. VETTORELLO, B.A., M.U.P., J.D.

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN
JOURNAL of LAW REFORM

VOLUME 43 • ISSUE 1

FALL 2009

SYMPOSIUM

**THE NATURE, STRUCTURE, AND FUNCTION OF HEAT
OF PASSION/PROVOCATION AS A CRIMINAL DEFENSE**

CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION AND COMMENTARY

A Critical Introduction to the Symposium

Kyron Huigens 1

ARTICLE

Adequate (Non)Provocation and Heat of Passion
as Excuse Not Justification

Reid Griffith Fontaine 27

ESSAYS IN RESPONSE

The Values of Interdisciplinarity in Homicide Law Reform

Robert Weisberg 53

Unjustified: The Practical Irrelevance of the
Justification/Excuse Distinction

Gabriel J. Chin 79

The Provocation Defense and the Nature of Justification

Marcia Baron 117

Misunderstanding Provocation

Samuel H. Pillsbury 143

How Not to Argue That Reasonable
Provocation Is an Excuse

Peter Westen 175

The Irreducibly Normative Nature of Provocation/Passion

Stephen J. Morse 193