UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN LAW SCHOOL

Fall 2009

Administrative Officers

MARY SUE COLEMAN, B.A., Ph.D., President of the University
TERESA A. SULLIVAN, B.A., Ph.D., Provost and Executive Vice President for Academic Affairs
EVAN H. CAMINKER, B.A., J.D., Branch Rickey Collegiate Professor, Dean
MARK D. WEST, B.A., J.D., Nippon Life Professor of Law, Associate Dean for Academic Affairs
BRIDGET M. MCCORMACK, B.A., J.D., Associate Dean for Clinical Affairs
VIRGINIA B. GORDAN, B.A., J.D., Assistant Dean for International Affairs
DAVID H. BAUM, B.A., J.D., Assistant Dean for Student Affairs
KATHERINE B. GOTTFRECH, B.A., J.D., Assistant Dean for Financial Aid
SUSAN M. GUINDI, B.A., J.D., Assistant Dean for Career Services
SARAH C. ZEARFOSS, A.B., J.D., Assistant Dean and Director of Admissions
TODD BAILY, B.A., Assistant Dean for Development and Alumni Relations
MARYANN SAROSI, B.A., J.D., Assistant Dean of Public Service
CHRISTINE GREGORY, B.A., J.D., Assistant Dean for Student Affairs

Professors Emeriti of Law

LAYMAN E. ALLEN, A.B., M.P.A., LL.B.
DAVID L. CHAMBERS, A.B., LL.B., Wade H. McCree, Jr. Collegiate Professor of Law
ALFRED F. CONARD, A.B., LL.B., LL.M., J.S.D., LL.D., Henry M. Butzel Professor of Law
LUKE K. COOPERRIDER, B.S., J.D.
ROBBEN W. FLEMING, B.A., LL.B., LL.D.
THOMAS A. GREEN, B.A., Ph.D., J.D., John Philip Dawson Collegiate Professor of Law
JEROLD H. ISRAEL, B.B.A., LL.B., Alme and Allan E. Smith Professor of Law
JOHN H. JACKSON, B.A., J.D., Hessel E. Yntema Professor of Law
YALE KAMISAR, A.B., LL.B., LL.D., Clarence Darrow Distinguished University Professor of Law
THOMAS E. KAUPER, A.B., J.D., Henry M. Butzel Professor of Law

Professors of Law

REUVEN S. AVI-YONAH, B.A., A.M., Ph.D., J.D., Irwin I. Cohen Professor of Law
SAMUEL RAGENTOS,* B.A., J.D.
MICHAEL S. BARR,* B.A., M.Phil., J.D.
LAURA N. BENY,* B.A., M.A., J.D., Ph.D.
EVAN H. CAMINKER, B.A., J.D., Branch Rickey Collegiate Professor of Law
SHERMAN J. CLARK, B.S., J.D.
EDWARD H. COOPER, A.B., LL.B., Thomas M. Cooley Professor of Law
DANIEL CRANE, B.A., J.D.
SUSAN P. CRAWDAD,* B.A., J.D.
STEVEN P. CRAGLE, A.B., J.D., M.A., Ph.D.
ALICIA DAVIS,* B.S., J.D., M.B.A.
REBECCA S. EISENBURG,* B.A., J.D., Robert and Barbara Luciana Professor of Law
PHOEBE C. ELLSWORTH,* A.B., Ph.D., Frank Murphy Distinguished Professor of Law and Psychology
RICHARD O. LEMPERT, A.B., J.D., Ph.D., Ralph W. Aigler Professor of Law
ERIC STEIN, J.D., J.D., DR.H.C.
PAUL G. KAUPER Professor of Law

RICHARD D. FRIEDMAN, B.A., J.D., D.Phil., Ralph W. Aigler Professor of Law
BRUCE W. FRIER, B.A., Ph.D., John and Teresa D'Arms Distinguished University Professor of Classics and Roman Law
SAMUEL R. GROSS, A.B., J.D., Thomas G. and Mabel Long Professor of Law
DANIEL H. HALBERSTAM,* B.A., J.D., Eric Stein Collegiate Professor of Law
JAMES C. HATHAWAY,* LL.B., LL.M., J.S.D., Donald J. Herzog, A.B., A.M., Ph.D., Edson R. Sunderland Professor of Law
JAMES HINES JR., B.A., M.A., Ph.D., L. Hart Wright Collegiate Professor of Law
DANIEL H. HALBERSTAM,* B.A., J.D., Eric Stein Collegiate Professor of Law
JILL L. HORNIG, B.A., M.P.P., J.D., Ph.D., Louis and Myrtle Moskowitz Research Professor of Business and Law
DOUGLAS A. KAHN, B.A., J.D., Paul G. Kauper Professor of Law
Business Faculty Fellows

BARRY A. ADELMAN, B.A., J.D.
DEBORAH BURAND, B.A., M.S.F.S., J.D.
TIMOTHY L. DICKINSON, B.A., J.D., LL.M.
JENNIFER DROGULA, B.A., J.D., LL.M.
KARL E. LUTZ, B.A., J.D.

Public Service/Public Interest Faculty Fellows

SAUL A. GREEN, B.A., J.D.
ALISON E. HIRSCHEL, B.A., J.D.
JENNIFER DROGULA, B.A., J.D., LL.M.
MARK ROSENBAUM, B.A., J.D.

Harvey J. Gunderson Professor from Practice

DAVID UHLMANN, B.A., J.D.
Jeffrey F. Liss Faculty Development Professor from Practice

Adjunct Professors

MARTIN BIENENSTOCK, B.S., J.D.
H. CHRISTOPHER BOEHNING, B.A., M.S., J.D.
ANDREW P. BUCHSBAUM, A.B., J.D.
RICHARD E. CASSARD, B.B.A., J.D.
MARK CODY, B.A., J.D.
JAMES DESIMPFLARE, B.S., M.B.A.
SARA GOSMAN, A.B., J.D., M.P.A.
ROBERT HIRSHON, B.A., J.D.
FRANK G. MILLARD PROFESSOR FROM PRACTICE
ALLYN D. KANTOR, B.S., J.D.

Adjunct Clinical Assistant Professors

NICOLE APPLEBERRY, A.B., J.D., LL.M.
MARGARET A. CERNAK, B.A., J.D.
NEIL S. KAGAN, B.S., M.S., J.D.

RAYMOND M. KETHLEDGE, B.A., J.D.
SUSAN KORNFIELD, B.A., J.D.
JOAN L. LARSEN, B.A., J.D.
HOWARD LEARNER, B.A., J.D.
JEFFREY H. MIRO, B.A., J.D., LL.M.
CYRIL MOSCO, B.S., J.D.
LEONARD NIEHOFF, A.B., J.D.
JUDY O'NEILL, B.A., J.D.
EDWARD R. STEIN, B.A., J.D.
STEVEN F. TUCKER, B.B.A., J.D.
JONATHAN TUCEL, B.A., J.D.

VALERIE NEWMAN, B.A., J.D.
PETER J. VAN HOEK, B.A., J.D.
NANCY E. VETTORELLO, B.A., M.U.P., J.D.

*on leave for Fall 2009
SYMPOSIUM
THE NATURE, STRUCTURE, AND FUNCTION OF HEAT OF PASSION/PROVOCATION AS A CRIMINAL DEFENSE

CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION AND COMMENTARY
A Critical Introduction to the Symposium
Kyron Huigens .............................. 1

ARTICLE
Adequate (Non)Provocation and Heat of Passion as Excuse Not Justification
Reid Griffith Fontaine .......................... 27

ESSAYS IN RESPONSE
The Values of Interdisciplinarity in Homicide Law Reform
Robert Weisberg .............................. 53

Unjustified: The Practical Irrelevance of the Justification/Excuse Distinction
Gabriel J. Chin .............................. 79

The Provocation Defense and the Nature of Justification
Marcia Baron .............................. 117

Misunderstanding Provocation
Samuel H. Pillsbury ............................ 143

How Not to Argue That Reasonable Provocation Is an Excuse
Peter Westen .............................. 175

The Irreducibly Normative Nature of Provocation/Passion
Stephen J. Morse .............................. 193