MICHIGAN LEGAL STUDIES

RETROACTIVE LEGISLATION AFFECTING INTERESTS IN LAND

PUBLISHED UNDER THE AUSPICES OF THE UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN LAW SCHOOL (WHICH, HOWEVER, ASSUMES NO RESPONSIBILITY FOR THE VIEWS EXPRESSED) WITH THE AID OF FUNDS DERIVED FROM GIFTS TO THE UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN BY WILLIAM W. COOK
MICHIeAN LEGAL STUDIES

DISCOVERY BEFORE TRIAL
George Ragland, Jr.

TORTS IN THE CONFLICT OF LAWS
Moffatt Hancock

THE AMENDING OF THE FEDERAL CONSTITUTION
Lester B. Orfield

REVIEW OF ADMINISTRATIVE ACTS
Armin Uhler

THE PREVENTION OF REPEATED CRIME
John Barker Waite

THE CONFLICT OF LAWS: A COMPARATIVE STUDY
Ernst Rabel

UNREPORTED OPINIONS OF THE SUPREME COURT OF MICHIGAN 1836-1943
William Wirt Blume, Editor

PROBLEMS IN PROBATE LAW:
INCLUDING A MODEL PROBATE CODE
Lewis M. Simes and Paul E. Bayse

SOVIET CIVIL LAW
Vladimir Gsovski

SURVEY OF METROPOLITAN COURTS:
DETOIT AREA
Maxine Board Virtue

ADMINISTRATIVE AGENCIES AND THE COURTS
Frank E. Cooper

OUR LEGAL SYSTEM AND HOW IT OPERATES
Burke Shartel

RETROACTIVE LEGISLATION AFFECTING INTERESTS IN LAND
John Scurlock

INTEGRATION OF PUBLIC UTILITY HOLDING COMPANIES
Robert F. Ritchie

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN PUBLICATIONS: LAW

TRANSACTIONS OF THE SUPREME COURT OF THE TERRITORY OF MICHIGAN 1805-1836
Six Volumes
William Wirt Blume, Editor

RATIFICATION OF THE TWENTY-FIRST AMENDMENT TO THE CONSTITUTION OF THE UNITED STATES
Everett S. Brown, Compiler

COOLEY LECTURES

THE CONSTITUTION AND SOCIO-ECONOMIC CHANGE
Henry Rottschaefer

SOME PROBLEMS OF EQUITY
Zechariah Chafee, Jr.

OUR LEGAL SYSTEM AND HOW IT OPERATES
Burke Shartel
(published in Michigan Legal Studies)

SELECTED TOPICS ON THE LAW OF TORTS
William Lloyd Prosser

SUMMER INSTITUTE LECTURES

THE CONFLICT OF LAWS AND INTERNATIONAL CONTRACTS: 1949
THE LAW AND LABOR-MANAGEMENT RELATIONS: 1950
TAXATION OF BUSINESS ENTERPRISE: 1951
ATOMIC ENERGY—INDUSTRIAL AND LEGAL PROBLEMS: 1952
FEDERAL ANTITRUST LAWS: 1953

LEGISLATIVE RESEARCH PUBLICATIONS

CURRENT TRENDS IN STATE LEGISLATION, 1951
William Pierce, Editor
RETROACTIVE LEGISLATION AFFECTING INTERESTS IN LAND

by

JOHN SCURLOCK

Associate Professor of Law, University of Kansas City

Foreword

by

LEWIS M. SIMES

Ann Arbor

University of Michigan Law School

1953
To my Wife
PROFESSOR SCURLOCK'S monograph covers an area of the law which is commonly by-passed in treatises and in classroom instruction. If we could merely tear Maitland's "seamless web" of the law and retain all the shreds, no part of the legal system would escape us. What we actually do, however, is to set up, in a more or less arbitrary fashion, numerous centers of legal classification, such as contracts, torts, property and constitutional law, to which closely related legal materials are attracted as to a magnet. But those legal materials which stand midway between two centers of attraction are likely to be subjected to equal magnetic pulls in opposite directions and to be drawn to neither.

These observations are particularly applicable to legal doctrines concerning the subject of retroactive legislation affecting interests in land. The constitutional law expert has left it for the property expert. The property expert has left it for the constitutional law expert. Thus, no one has given it adequate treatment.

But the practitioner, the judge and the legislator cannot limit the field of their activities to the law which clusters about certain arbitrarily selected centers. They must deal equally with the borderline areas, because to them law is an aspect of life. The scores of reported cases in the law books dealing with retroactive statutes concerning land bear silent witness to the importance of the subject of this monograph and the frequency with which its problems arise.

The statute books are full of retroactive legislation which modifies traditional incidents of property institutions. No
lawyer can safely advise his client concerning the effect of such statutes, without some basic notions of their validity under state and federal constitutions. Yet up to this time there has been no adequate treatment of this problem as a unit. Indeed, far from finding any guiding principles in standard textbooks, the lawyer may even have serious difficulty in locating all the reported decisions which deal with the precise question of constitutionality with which he is confronted. Professor Scurlock's monograph will aid the lawyer in both particulars. It will give him guiding principles, and it will furnish him with an adequate picture of the case law dealing with his own peculiar problem.

Moreover, this monograph will supply a long felt want of the legislator. Everyone who has drafted legislation modifying the law of real property has been confronted at the outset with the question: Shall I make this applicable to interests in property already created? Or shall I limit its operation to interests arising under deeds and wills which take effect after the legislation is enacted? Professor Scurlock's book throws a flood of light upon this question, such as will be found in no other treatise or article.

For the legal philosopher, as well as the practical man of affairs, this monograph has its contribution. While it deals with a subject matter involving both constitutional law and the law of real property, the questions discussed commonly turn on the nature of property interests. To the person who asks the question what is property, or who is confused by the chameleon-hued concept of "vested interests in property," this book has something to offer.

In short, for the lawyer, the judge, the legislator and the legal philosopher, this monograph constitutes a valuable contribution to the science of law.

Lewis M. Simes
Preface

I have discussed in the Introduction the method of approach and arrangement of materials, to which the reader is referred.

This study was begun while I was a graduate fellow at the University of Michigan Law School. It is a great pleasure for me to express my appreciation for the guidance given by my thesis committee, Mr. Burke Shartel, Mr. Paul G. Kauper and Mr. Allan F. Smith, and for the helpful criticisms of Mr. Lewis M. Simes.

John Scurlock

School of Law
University of Kansas City
February, 1953
# Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>FOREWORD BY LEWIS M. SIMES</td>
<td>vii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PREFACE</td>
<td>ix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CHAPTER 1. INTRODUCTION</strong></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scope</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mode of Treatment</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Construction of Statute and Determination of Existence of Interest</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CHAPTER 2. THE CONSTITUTIONAL GUARANTEES</strong></td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CHAPTER 3. ACQUISITION AND DISPOSITION OF INTERESTS IN LAND</strong></td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. Inter Vivos Transfers</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Power of Alienation</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adverse Possession—Statutes of Limitation</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Occupying Claimants Acts</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Title by Accretion</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accretions Due to Shifting of Non-Navigable Streams</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Definitions of Navigability</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recording Acts</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Changing Conditions of Recording</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marketable Title Acts</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proceedings to Quiet Title and to Register Title</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Transfers at Death</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Power of Testamentary Disposition</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Antenuptial Contracts</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Disposition of Property by Intestate Succession ........................................ 108
Rights of Heirs and Devisees Before Death of Ancestor .................................. 111
Contract to Make a Will .................................................................................. 115
Rights of Heirs and Devisees After Death of Ancestor ..................................... 116
Statutes Authorizing Sale of Land ................................................................. 124
Rights of Executors and Administrators ........................................................ 128

CHAPTER 4. FUTURE INTERESTS ............................................................ 130
Notice and Hearing ....................................................................................... 132
A Warning on the Word "Vested" ................................................................... 136

I. Remainders, Reversions, and Executory Interests ....................................... 136
   1. Statutes Which Authorize Compromise of Claims as to Validity or Effect of a Will. 137
   2. Statutes Which Authorize the Compromise of Claims Against Trust Estates ........ 148
   3. Statutes Which Authorize Proceedings to Determine the Status of Title to Land and Proceedings to Quiet Title: Torrens Acts .................................................. 151
   4. Statutes Which Authorize Compulsory Partition ........................................... 154
      Partition by Sale ....................................................................................... 158
   5. Statutes Which Authorize the Sale or Mortgage of Land ............................... 163
      (a) Contingent Future Interests ............................................................... 169
      (b) Vested Future Interests ..................................................................... 173
      (c) Land Held in Trust ........................................................................... 179
      (d) The Effect of Restrictions Against Sale ............................................ 181
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6. Statutes Which Authorize a Life Tenant to Execute Leases.</td>
<td>182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Statutes Which Alter the Rules for Allocation of Benefits between Life Tenant and Remaindermen</td>
<td>188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Statutes Relating to Improvements and Repairs Made by the Life Tenant or His Grantee</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Legitimation and Adoption Statutes</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Statutes Relating to the Rule Against Perpetuities</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Statutes Which Abolish the Rule in Shelley's Case</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Statutes Which Abolish the Worthier Title Doctrine</td>
<td>206</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. Statutes Which Abolish the Destructibility Rule</td>
<td>208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. Statutes Abolishing the Fee Tail Estate</td>
<td>210</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(a) The Heirs of the Body of the Tenant in Tail</td>
<td>214</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) The Reversioners and Remaindermen</td>
<td>219</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(c) Effect of Repeal of Statutes</td>
<td>223</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. Statutes Which Authorize the Revocation of Grants of Future Interests</td>
<td>224</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. Statutes of Limitations and Marketable Title Statutes</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Powers of Appointment</td>
<td>231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Possibilities of Reverter and Powers of Termination</td>
<td>236</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Chapter 5. Trusts**

- Spendthrift Trusts                                                 | 249  |
- Termination of Trusts                                              | 258  |
TABLE OF CONTENTS

The Trustee as Having a Vested Interest........ 264
Statutes Which Authorize the Sale, Mortgage,
or Leasing of Trust Property.................... 268
Statutes Designed to Protect Bona Fide Alien-
ees of the Trust Res............................ 271

Chapter 6. Estates and Interests Arising From

Marriage ........................................ 273
Husband’s Estate Jure Uxoris.................... 274
Curtesy ........................................... 279
Dower ............................................. 285
Dower Consummately ................................ 295
The Statutory Marital Rights..................... 295
Homestead ........................................ 298
Community Property ................................ 300

Chapter 7. Concurrent Ownership.................... 311
I. Joint Tenancies and Tenancies in Common...... 311
   Statutes Affecting the Incident of Survivor-
   ship ............................................ 311
   1. Statutes Which Abolish the Common-Law
      Rule of Construction.......................... 315
   2. Statutes Which Purport to Abolish the Inci-
      dent of Survivorship........................ 320
   3. Statutes Which Appear to Abolish Joint
      Tenancies as Such............................ 324
   4. The Effect of an Instrument Which Ex-
      pressly Creates a Joint Tenancy............. 325
   5. The Effect of Repeal of a Statute............ 327
   Partition of Land Held in Joint Tenancy and
   in Common...................................... 329
   Partition by Sale................................ 331
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TABLE OF CONTENTS</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Miscellaneous Statutes Relating to Tenancies in Common and Joint Tenancies</td>
<td>334</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Tenancies by Entireties</td>
<td>334</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TABLE OF CASES</td>
<td>343</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INDEX</td>
<td>379</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>