CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS .............................................. v
THE AUTHORS: CURRICULUM VITAE .......................... vi

PART ONE. THE UNITED STATES AND THE OTHER "FIVE": AN ANALYTICAL COMPARISON 1

CHAPTER I

AN OVERVIEW: REQUISITE ADMINISTRATIVE FRAMEWORKS 3

1.1 Introduction: Why the volume was written .......... 3
1.2 Relationship of procedural goals to organization .... 4
1.3 Sequence of this volume ................................. 4
1.4 First central theme: A centralized interpretative program ...................................................... 5
1.5 Second central theme: Decentralization of the enforcement function ...................................... 8
1.6 Third central theme: Centralization of final administrative hearings at an intermediate level ... 10

CHAPTER II

CENTRALLY ADMINISTERED RULE-MAKING PROGRAMS 12

Section A. Evolution of U.S. Programs 12

2.1 Introduction .................................................. 12
2.2 Evolution of U.S. regulations program ............... 15
2.3 Evolution of U.S. private and published rulings programs ...................................................... 19
2.4 Weight normally accorded U.S. interpretative regulations and published rulings ................. 26

Section B. Analytic Comparison: The "Six's" Reactions to Vital Purposes Served by Centrally Administered Interpretative Programs 34

2.5 Introduction: Programs of the Six compared .......... 34
2.6 Achieving timely uniformity, efficiently and fairly... 39
2.7 Choosing the wisest possible interpretative positions ................................................. 42
2.8 Neutralizing risks re prospective transactions ...... 42

Section C. Implementing an Interpretative Regulations Program 44

2.9 Introduction: Inherent conflict among the goals ...... 44
2.10 The goal of proper quality ................................. 44
2.11 Processing regulations: Reconciling the goal of proper quality with competing goals of timeliness and efficiency .................. 48

Section D. Implementing Private and Published Rulings Programs 51

2.12 Introduction: Resolving inherent conflict between respective goals of private and published rulings programs ............................................... 51
2.13 Confining private rulings to legal questions: Requiring statements of fact and a brief ............ 54
2.14 Organization, conferences, review, and appeals re private rulings .................................. 56
2.15 Priorities re advance rulings; and grounds for refusal to rule ..................................... 59
2.16 Completed transactions: Private rulings and in-service technical advice ......................... 61
2.17 Publication of rulings and in-service technical advice .. 64
CHAPTER III
ASSESSMENT AND ADMINISTRATIVE APPEAL PROCEDURES

Section A. Analytic Comparison of the "Six": Requirements of a Tax Administration's Own Conflict Resolution Procedures, Viewed in Aggregate

3.1 Introduction: Comparative profiles of the entire conflict resolution process ........................................... 70
3.2 Assuring impartiality of administrative conflict resolution machinery ..................................................... 77
3.3 Assuring administrative machinery a reasonable chance to become fully acquainted with the taxpayer's side ................................................................. 82
3.4 Assuring justice: Need for complete "settlement" authority ........................................................................ 86

Section B. Analytic Comparison of Additional Requirements: Echelon by Echelon View of Assessment and Administrative Conflict Resolution Procedures

3.5 Examining officer level ........................................ 90
3.6 Mandatory internal review v. self-initiated requests for technical advice ............................................. 92
3.7 Jurisdictional screening function re administrative appeals ................................................................. 95
3.8 Requiring written protests ....................................... 99

CHAPTER IV
CONFLICT RESOLUTION BY INDEPENDENT TRIBUNALS

Section A. Analytic Comparison: Judicial Structures of the "Six"

4.1 Introduction: The goals ........................................ 102
4.2 Trial tribunals: Impartiality and the relevance of a specialized bench's perspectives ......... 103
4.3 Trial tribunals: Other factors relevant to the goals .............................................. 109
4.4 Appellate tribunals: The right and scope of review .............................................. 120
4.5 Appellate tribunals: Quality of review ................. 125
4.6 Appellate tribunals: Unifying interpretations .......... 131

Section B. Analytic Comparison: Litigation Practices of the "Six" 138

4.7 Introduction .............................................. 138
4.8 Practices peculiarly important to the tax administration .............................................. 138
4.9 Practices peculiarly important to taxpayers .......... 151
4.10 Practices of common concern ................. 157

PART TWO. BELGIUM 167

CHAPTER V
ADMINISTRATIVE ORGANIZATIONAL AND PERSONNEL FRAMEWORKS 169

Section A. Administrative Organizational Framework 169

1.1 Introduction .............................................. 169
1.2 Organizational framework, national office level .... 171
1.3 Organizational framework, regional office level .... 174
1.4 Organizational framework, local office level ....... 176

Section B. Personnel Framework (Governmental and Non-Governmental) 177

1.5 Governmental professional personnel ................. 177
1.6 Private tax practitioners .......................... 179
CHAPTER VI

ADMINISTRATIVE RULE-MAKING PROGRAMS

Section A. Character of the Underlying Statute

2.1 Precision of the statute itself

2.2 Legislative pre-enactment aids to interpretation

2.3 Standards of construction followed by the judiciary in interpreting the statute

Section B. The Regulations Program

2.4 Types and force of regulations

2.5 Precise purpose of "interpretative" regulations

2.6 Manner of processing regulations

Section C. The Rulings Program

2.7 Formal advance written rulings to taxpayers

2.8 Informal technical advice to taxpayers on proposed transactions

2.9 Technical advice to field offices

2.10 Publication of technical advice given taxpayers and local offices

CHAPTER VII

ASSESSMENT, REFUND, AND ADMINISTRATIVE APPEAL PROCEDURES

Section A. Assessment and Audit Procedures

3.1 Introductory note

3.2a Details of the typical assessment and audit procedure
3.2b Details of assessment and audit procedure re cadastral income.................................207

3.2c Details of assessment and audit procedure re income arising from certain categories of professional activity .........................208

Section B. Administrative Appeals 209

3.3 Introductory note..................................................209

3.4 Details of administrative appeal procedure re assessments.........................................210

Section C. Extent Administrative Processing of Refund Claims Departs from Administrative Processing of Assessments 213

3.5 Introductory note..................................................213

3.6 Details regarding refund procedure in cases of "material error".................................214

CHAPTER VIII

RESOLUTION OF INTERPRETATIVE INCOME TAX QUESTIONS BY INDEPENDENT TRIBUNALS 216

4.1 Introduction ......................................................216

Section A. Organization and Procedures: Lower Courts 216

4.2 Organization of the lower courts.........................216

4.3 Processing cases through the Court of Appeal ..217

Section B. Organization and Procedures: The Court of Cassation 220

4.4 Organization of the Court of Cassation ...............220

4.5 Processing a case through the Court of Cassation .221
PART THREE. FRANCE

CHAPTER IX

ADMINISTRATIVE ORGANIZATIONAL AND PERSONNEL FRAMEWORKS

Section A. Administrative Organizational Framework

1.1 Introduction .............................................227
1.2 Organizational framework, national office level ........227
1.3 Organizational framework, regional office level ........229
1.4 Organizational framework, local office level ..........230

Section B. Personnel Framework (Governmental and Non-Governmental)

1.5 Governmental professional personnel ..................232
1.6 Private tax practitioners .............................236

CHAPTER X

ADMINISTRATIVE RULE-MAKING PROGRAMS

Section A. Character of the Underlying Statute

2.1 Precision of the statute itself ..........................238
2.2 Legislative pre-enactment aids to interpretation .......240
2.3 Standards of construction followed by the judiciary in interpreting the statute ..........................241

Section B. The "Regulations" Program

2.4 & 2.5 Types, force, and purpose of "regulations" .......243
2.6 Manner of processing "regulations" .......................246
Section C. The Rulings Program 247

2.7 Formal advance written rulings to taxpayers 247

2.8 Informal technical advice to taxpayers on proposed transactions 249

2.9 Technical advice to field offices 249

2.10 Publication of technical advice given taxpayers and local offices 250

CHAPTER XI

ASSESSMENT, REFUND, AND ADMINISTRATIVE APPEAL PROCEDURES 251

Section A. Assessment and Audit Procedures 251

3.1 Introductory note 251

3.2a Details of assessment and audit procedure re actual income 251

3.2b Details of assessment and audit procedure re estimated income 257

Section B. Administrative Appeals 264

3.3 Introductory note 264

3.4a Details of administrative appeals to a departmental Commission 265

3.4b Administrative appeals to the departmental Director: Recours contentieux 269

3.4c Administrative appeals to the departmental Director: Recours gracieux 271

Section C. Administrative Processing of Refund Claims 272
CHAPTER XII

RESOLUTION OF TAX QUESTIONS BY INDEPENDENT TRIBUNALS

4.1 Introduction ......................................................... 273

Section A. Organization and Procedures: Trial Level 274

4.2 Organization of the tribunals ................................. 274

4.3 Processing cases through the trial tribunals ............ 275

Section B. Organization and Procedures: Appellate Tribunals 281

4.4 Organization of the appellate system ....................... 281

4.5 Processing a case through the appellate tribunal ...... 283

PART FOUR. GERMANY 289

CHAPTER XIII

ADMINISTRATIVE ORGANIZATIONAL AND PERSONNEL FRAMEWORKS 291

Section A. Administrative Organizational Framework 291

1.1 Introduction ......................................................... 291

1.2 Organizational framework, national office level .......... 292

A. Federal tax administration ..................................... 292

B. State tax administration ....................................... 295

1.3 Organizational framework, regional office level ........ 295

1.4 Organizational framework, local office level ............ 296
Section B. Personnel Framework (Governmental and Non-Governmental) 299

1.5 Governmental professional personnel .................299
1.6 Private tax practitioners ..................................304

CHAPTER XIV

ADMINISTRATIVE RULE-MAKING PROGRAMS 307

Section A. Character of the Underlying Statute 307

2.1 Precision of the statute itself .........................307
2.2 Legislative pre-enactment aids to interpretation ....313
2.3 Standards of construction followed by the judiciary in interpreting the statute .........................315

Section B. The Regulations Program 316

2.4 Types and force of regulations .........................316
2.5 Precise purpose of interpretative regulations ........318
2.6 Manner of processing regulations .....................321

Section C. The Rulings Program 322

2.7 Formal advance written rulings to taxpayers .......322
2.8 Informal technical advice to taxpayers on proposed transactions ........................................324
2.9 Technical advice to field offices ......................325
2.10 Publication of technical advice given taxpayers and local offices ........................................326
CHAPTER XV

ASSESSMENT, REFUND, AND ADMINISTRATIVE APPEAL PROCEDURES 328

Section A. Assessment and Audit Procedures 328

3.1 Introductory note 328

3.2a Details of assessment and audit procedures:
   In general 330

3.2b Details of assessment and audit procedures where taxes withheld at source 336

Section B. Administrative Appeals 337

3.3 Introductory note 337

3.4a Protest 338

3.4b Complaint 341

Section C. Extent Administrative Processing of Refund Claims Departs from Administrative Processing of Assessments 342

3.5 Introductory note 342

3.6 Details regarding refund procedures 342

CHAPTER XVI

RESOLUTION OF INTERPRETATIVE INCOME TAX QUESTIONS BY INDEPENDENT TRIBUNALS 344

4.1 Introduction 344

Section A. Organization and Procedures:
   Trial Level 346

4.2 Organization of the trial tribunals 346

4.3 Processing cases through the trial tribunals 348
2.3 Standards of construction followed by the judiciary in interpreting the statute ...............384

Section B. The Regulations Program 385

2.4 Types and force of regulations .................385
2.5 Precise purpose of statutory regulations ........388
2.6 Manner of processing regulations ...............389

Section C. The Rulings Program 390

2.7 Formal advance written rulings to taxpayers ....390
2.8 Informal technical advice to taxpayers on proposed transactions .............................392
2.9 Technical advice to field offices .................393
2.10 Publication of technical advice given taxpayers and local offices .................396

CHAPTER XIX

ASSESSMENT, REFUND, AND ADMINISTRATIVE APPEAL PROCEDURES 399

Section A. Assessment and Audit Procedures 399
3.1 Introductory note ........................................399
3.2 Details of the assessment and audit procedures ....401

Section B. Administrative Appeals 406
3.3 Introductory note ........................................406
3.4 Details of procedures analogous to administrative appeals ..................................407

Section C. Extent Administrative Processing of Refund Claims Departs from Administrative Processing of Assessments 410
3.5 Introductory note ........................................410
3.6 "Error or mistake" claims: Refund procedures prior to an administrative appeal ...............410

3.7 "Error or mistake" claims: Procedure equivalent to administrative appeal ....................412

CHAPTER XX

RESOLUTION OF INTERPRETATIVE INCOME TAX QUESTIONS BY INDEPENDENT TRIBUNALS 413

4.1 Introduction ........................................413

Section A. Organization and Procedures:
Trial Level 414

4.2a Organization of the General Commissioners .....414
4.2b Organization of the Special Commissioners ......415
4.2c Organization of the Board of Referees ...........416
4.2d Organization of the 1960 Act tribunal ............417
4.3a Processing appeals: The General Commissioners ..418
4.3b Processing appeals: The Special Commissioners ...421
4.3c Processing appeals: The Board of Referees .......422
4.3d Processing appeals: The 1960 Act tribunal .........423

Section B. Organization and Procedures:
Appellate Tribunals 424

4.4 Organization of the appellate court system .........424
4.5 Processing cases through the courts ...............425
PART SIX. THE NETHERLANDS

CHAPTER XXI

ADMINISTRATIVE ORGANIZATIONAL AND PERSONNEL FRAMEWORKS

Section A. Administrative Organizational Framework

1.1 Introduction .................................................. 431
1.2 Organizational framework, national office level .......... 432
1.3 Organizational framework, regional office level .......... 434
1.4 Organizational framework, local office level .......... 436

Section B. Personnel Framework (Governmental and Non-Governmental) 439

1.5 Governmental professional personnel ...................... 439
1.6 Private tax practitioners ................................. 442

CHAPTER XXII

ADMINISTRATIVE RULE-MAKING PROGRAMS 444

Section A. Character of the Underlying Statute 444

2.1 Precision of the statute itself ......................... 444
2.2 Legislative pre-enactment aids to interpretation .......... 449
2.3 Standards of construction followed by the judiciary in interpreting the statute ...................... 451

Section B. The Regulations Program 453

2.4 Types and force of regulations ......................... 453
2.5 Precise purpose of interpretative regulations ............ 453
2.6 Manner of processing regulations ....................... 454
Section C. The Rulings Program 454

2.7 Formal advance written rulings to taxpayers 454
2.8 Informal technical advice to taxpayers on proposed transactions 456
2.9 Technical advice to field offices 457
2.10 Publication of technical advice given taxpayers and local offices 457

CHAPTER XXIII

ASSESSMENT, REFUND, AND ADMINISTRATIVE APPEAL PROCEDURES 459

Section A. Assessment and Audit Procedures 459

3.1 Introductory note 459
3.2a Details of the assessment and audit procedures re individuals (income tax) 459
3.2b Details of the assessment and audit procedures re corporations (corporations tax) 464
3.2c Details of the assessment and audit procedures re individuals (wage tax) 465

Section B. Administrative Appeals 466

3.3 Introductory note 466
3.4a Details of the administrative appeal procedure re assessments in income tax (natural persons) 466
3.4b Details of the administrative appeal procedure re corporation tax assessments 468
3.4c Details of the administrative appeal procedure re assessments in wage tax (natural persons) 469
Section C. Extent Administrative Processing of Refund Claims Departs from Administrative Processing of Assessments 469

3.5 Introductory note ................................................. 469
3.6 Details regarding refund procedures prior to an administrative appeal ................................................. 470
3.7 Details of the administrative appeal procedure re refund claims .................................................. 471

CHAPTER XXIV

RESOLUTION OF INTERPRETATIVE INCOME TAX QUESTIONS BY INDEPENDENT TRIBUNALS 473

4.1 Introduction ..................................................... 473

Section A. Organization and Procedures: Trial Level 474

4.2 Organization of the trial tribunals ...................... 474
4.3 Processing cases through the trial tribunals .......... 476

Section B. Organization and Procedures: Appellate Tribunals 481

4.4 Organization of the appellate court system ......... 481
4.5 Processing a case through the appellate tribunals . 482